

Minutes
Thomasville Historic Preservation Commission
City Council Chambers
7003 Ball Park Rd
Tuesday 28 February 2023 – 6:30 P.M.

The Thomasville Historic Preservation Commission meeting was held at the City Council Chambers on Tuesday 7 February 2023 at 6:30 P.M.

Members Present: Members: Casey Gardner, Jill Simpson, Katheryn Byrnes, Dean Freeman, and Steve Teglas

Staff Members: Chuck George; Attorney: Samantha Smith; City Council Liaison: Lisa Shell

Members Absent: Lisa Edwards, Paxton Taylor, Marybeth Ford, Jennifer Gardner, and city attorney Misti Whitman.

1. Call To Order

Dean Freeman called the meeting to order at 18:32.

2. Oath of Office - New Members

Two new members joined the HPC. The Attorney Samantha Smith swore in Amanda Cox and Jennifer Mayhall.

3. Approval of Minutes

Dean Freeman asked for a motion to approve the minutes from the February 7, 2023 meeting. Jill Simpson made a motion to approve the minutes from the February 7, 2023 meeting. Casey Gardner seconded the motion.

Dean Freeman asked that we change the words vice president to vice chairman on the February 7, 2023 meeting. All approved this change. Non-opposed.

Motion passed.

4. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness (Public Hearing)

COA-22-11-02

Property Owner/ApplicantL Jennifer Mayhall

Location: 16 Carmalt Street

Scope of Work consist of the following:

1. Window Replacement - Already replaced by contractor (Approved on 12/27/23)
2. French Doors - French door already installed by contractor
3. New Front Door (Approved on 12/27/23)

Two members, Jennifer Mayhall (Owner) and Steve Teglas (Business associate of Jennifer) had to recuse themselves from the proceedings. Kat made a motion to have Jennifer and Steve recuse themselves. Casey second. All approved, non-opposed, motion to have Jennifer and Steve stepped down was approved.

Samantha Swore in:

Jennifer Mayhall
Steve Teglas
Scott Ford
Chuck George
Christopher Lewis

Chuck gave his staff report. Staff finds that the revitalization occurred and new features requested to be inconsistent with the Thomasville Design Standards. The Historical Preservation Design Standards specify the replacement in kind of any portion of a window or door that is damaged or deteriorated beyond repair. Retain as much of the original fabric as possible. Match the original in design, material, dimension, sash or panel configuration, detail, texture, and color. It is not acceptable to replace wooden doors and windows with vinyl substitutes. The new front door and the new French doors added features would create a false sense of history.

Staff finds the proposed work to be inconsistent with the design standards of the Historic Preservation Commission. However, it will not negatively affect the architectural and historical integrity of the streetscape properties in the Colonial Drive School District.

Jennifer Mayhall spoke in support of the COA. She talked about how she came in February 2022 and spoke about what she plans to do with the car port. She was told to talk to a design committee and after an email from Scott Ford there was no more communication. She said that beside what is in the COA she had nothing more to add. The carport was not made to standards and she was unable to use the carport as a carport.

Steve Teglas spoke in support of the COA. He talked about how he lives down and wants to continue to make the historical district beautiful. Based on Misti's report from the February 7th meeting the new doors fit the standards of the Colonial Drive School District. He talked about the fact that seeing this home get fixed up is amazing and helpful to the neighbors because hopefully more homeowners will fix up their houses too.

Christopher Lewis talks about his own COA and asked why we allowed Jennifer to complete her work without a COA but he could not. We told him that she was not aware that she needed a COA and hence why she is here now.

Scott Ford talks in opposition of this COA. He said that he visited the house in February 2022 and spoke to the owner then saying adding a stoop and carport would most likely not be approved (there is no official record of this meeting). He said that you can see the doors from the road, if you come up via the side of the house. He is in opposition due to the standards on page 40: "It is not acceptable to eliminate existing windows or doors or to introduce new windows and doors on character-defining elevations of a building."

Jennifer gets up and rebutes what Scott says. She said that she has no memory of this meeting. If you look at the house from the front you will not be able to see the new door. That was the end of the public discussion on this COA.

Jill Simpson read from the state's historical design guidelines, which states "Avoid new doors if they diminish integrity of the house." Per the 2004 Thomasville Survey (the survey explains what is character-defining about the houses in the historical district) of the house in question the only character defining features are: the steep roofs, the front porch, carport portico, 3 over 1 windows, chimney brickwork, and square columns. Jill said that per the standards page 40 the windows in the carport are not considered 'character-defining elevations of the building.' The carport is not described as character defining for this house. Jill also talked about how Misit said the doors are similar to the Colonial Historical District (at least 4 houses have french doors with portico's). Jill comes to the conclusion that this new door is congruent with the district even if it is not congruent with the standards.

Casey did say that there was another house about a year ago who wanted to add side windows to their house and it was denied.

Dean says that the new doors are visible from the street and that the windows are character defining. The owner of the house got the standards and gave them to the contractor (told the committee this in December). He says that per the standards on page 40 (it is not acceptable to eliminate existing windows or doors or to introduce new windows and doors on character-defining elevations of a building) and 42 (It is not acceptable to enclose a front porch, entrance, or balcony on a character-defining elevation) we should deny this COA. He mentions that even though the work is done it should not affect our judgment on this COA.

Katheryn Byrnes made a motion of finding facts based on the standards page 40 and 42 steps 6 - it is not acceptable to eliminate existing windows or doors or to introduce new windows and doors on character-defining elevations of a building, Chuck's report

that says it will not negatively affect the architectural and historical integrity of the streetscape properties in the Colonial Drive School District, and Jill's 2004 survey that does not the carport windows as character defining. Jill seconds the motion.

Dean says he opposes due to what the standards say on page 40 and 46 and Casey opposes due to the fact that this is a lot of gray area. In favor of finding facts was Katheryn, Jill, and Amanda. In opposition was Dean and Casey. Finding of Fact has been approved.

Katheryn made a motion to approve this COA based on the approved finding of facts. Jill seconds the motion. In favor of the COA is Casey, Katheryn, Jill, and Amanda. In opposition is Dean. COA is approved.

Dean Freeman walks out of the meeting and resigns his position and role in the Historical Preservation Committee right after the COA was approved. Casey Gardner takes over the rest of the meeting as he is the Vice Chairman.

COA -23-05

Applicant: David Yemm

Property Owner: City of Thomasville

Location: 7 W. Guilford St. (Former City Hall/Police Department)

The Blue Ribbon Committee studying the resume of 7 W. Guilford.

Would like to remove partition walls that were placed in the area designated as "Library" on the original drawings from 1937. The committee believes this will help visualize any adaptive resume of the building while maintaining the original character.

Samantha Swore in

David Yemm

Michael Brandt

Per Chuck's staff report we have no interior guidelines. As long as their plans are in congruent with the properties original design then the staff finds this is congruent with the standards.

David Yemm spoke in support of the COA. He presented the original property architectural plans which show that there were no partition walls in the area designated as "Library." The NC State office came in and toured the building. They recommended tearing down the added walls and bring the building back to its original designs.

Michael Brandt, the city manager, got up and talked about the importance of this building for the community. The building has been neglected and they will turn it into something useful. They want to fix the building back to the original design so they can keep their integrity.

No one from the community had any opposition.

Katheryn and Jill talked about how they went and toured the building. You could see which walls were added and are in agreement that bringing the room back to the original design is a good idea.

Casey asked if it was just this room. The answer was yes.

Jill made a motion of finding of facts due to the plans provided that show the walls were not original. Katheryn seconded the motion. All in favor. Non-opposed. Finding of facts passed.

Katheryn made a motion to approve this COA based on the finding of facts. Amanda seconded the motion. All in favor. Non-opposed. The COA passed.

5. Staff Report

Chuck welcomes the new members and talks about how the Casey Gardner, Jennifer Gardner, and Lisa Edwards time on the committee is up. Four spots on the committee have opened up so please have anyone who is interested apply.

We need to educate the public on the design standards.

6. Committee Reports

Nothing to report.

7. Other Business

April 1st is Bright Letter History Day. Jill said that she will use some of the money for a tablecloth so that the table we have looks better.

As getting a light on the flag post at the post office is under \$400 we are moving forward in that decision.

We have agreed to have a meet and greet with the public on Monday 24 April 2023 between 6-8 pm at the Women's Club. Katheryn will send out some menu ideas and the advertisement flier so we can all approve it.

We talked about sitting with Misit to update the standards to maybe guidelines or to add what she talked about/found at the February 7 meeting.

8. Next Meeting

The Commission's next meeting will be held on Tuesday 28 March 2023 at 6:30 P.M. in the City Council Chambers on Ball Park Road.

The deadline for COA Applications will be on Friday 3 March 2023 at 5 P.M.

9. Adjournment

This meeting was adjourned at 2026 on 28 February 2023.

Minutes submitted by Katheryn Byrnes.

Katheryn Byrnes
Secretary