

CITY PLAN COMMISSION

Wednesday, May 16, 2018

A meeting of the City Plan Commission was called to order at 6:09 p.m. by Vice-Chairperson Dennis Statz in the Fire Truck Bay, City Hall, 421 Michigan Street.

Roll Call: Members Dennis Statz, Mike Gilson, Jeff Norland, Steven Hurley, and Laurel Hauser were present. Also present were Alderpersons Barb Allmann, David Ward and David Hayes, City Administrator Josh Van Lieshout, City Engineer Chad Shefchik, Community Development Director Marty Olejniczak, Planner/Zoning Administrator Chris Sullivan-Robinson, Community Development Secretary Cheryl Nault, and various members of the public.

Adoption of the Agenda: Moved by Ms. Hauser, seconded by Mr. Hurley to adopt the following agenda:

1. Roll call.
2. Adoption of agenda.
3. Approval of minutes from April 18, 2018.
4. Conditional use request from Door County Medical Center for a skilled nursing facility, located at 323 S. 18th Avenue, parcel #281-62-35000121A:
Presentation:
Public hearing:
Consideration of:
5. Comprehensive Plan amendment – Future land use for Amity Field (parcel #281-23-0527260006):
Presentation:
Public Hearing:
Consideration of:
6. Comprehensive Plan amendment- Future land use for Robert Goetz (parcel #281-68-17000301A):
Presentation:
Public Hearing:
Consideration of:
7. Consideration of: Combined Preliminary/Final Planned Unit Development for Phillips Development LLC, for a 34-unit multiple-family development, located in the 700 blocks of Erie and Florida Streets, parcel #281-23-0527260006 (aka Amity Field).
Presentation:
Public Hearing:
Consideration of:
8. Combined Preliminary/Final Planned Unit Development for Duquaine Development (Mau & Associates, LLP, Agent), for a 162-unit multiple-family development, located on the southeast corner of Tacoma Beach Road and Clay Banks Road/CTH U, parcel #281-68-17000301A.
9. Public comment on non-agenda Plan Commission related items.
10. Adjourn.

Carried.

Approval of minutes from April 18, 2018: Moved by Mr. Norland, seconded by Mr. Statz to approve the minutes from April 18, 2018, with the following changes: On page 7, first paragraph change R-4 to R-3. Also, in the second paragraph insert “expressing concerns” after the

following people spoke. "The following spoke in favor" should be added before Lee Haasch. All ayes. Carried.

Conditional use request from Door County Medical Center for a skilled nursing facility, located at 323 S. 18th Avenue, parcel #281-62-35000121A:

Presentation: Mr. Sullivan-Robinson stated that the Door County Medical Center, 323 S 18th Avenue, is seeking a conditional use permit for an addition of a skilled nursing facility on the corner of Rhode Island Street and S. 16th Avenue. The approximately 25,000 square-foot single-story, 28-foot high addition will be replacing the **existing** skilled nursing facility. It will be attached to the **existing** medical center and extend into two **existing** parking lots. The property is located in an R-4 zoning district. The current SNF will be converted into storage or other medical uses. The Door County Medical Center is required to 391 parking spaces. There will be 469 parking spaces available throughout the site.

The Aesthetic Design & Site Plan Review Board had recently approved the project with the following conditions:

City staff recommended approval of the conditional use request with the following conditions:

1. Any new replacement parking lot fixtures must match existing parking lot light fixtures.
2. Final approval of the stormwater management plan by the City Engineer.
3. Replace six of the nine trees removed from the west parking lot to meet original parking lot tree requirements.
4. Meet setback requirements for an R-4 district.

Patrick Skaleki, representative from Berners-Schober Associates, **stated that a courtyard is being developed and landscaped. This will be a campus-wide basis with full-time residents and in and out residents. The project is pending City Engineer review and approval. Colors - ?? The existing driveway will be moved approximately 40 feet. It is made easy for fire access. The landscaping will give character to the building. A five-foot fence will be installed (where?).**

Public hearing: Vice-Chair Statz opened the public hearing at 6:24 p.m.

Scott Thomas, 1557 Tacoma Beach Road, stated that this is an awesome development.

Karen Lenius, 124 S. 16th Place, has concerns about the heavy truck traffic going up and down the street. The trucks should use a different route.

There were no written letters of correspondence. The public hearing was declared closed at 6:29 p.m.

Consideration of: The Commission discussed the request. Mr. Olejniczak commented that they need to defer to the City Engineer regarding streets.

Moved by Ms. Hauser, seconded by Mr. Gilson to approve the conditional use request, subject to staff's recommendation, as well as Parking & Traffic Committee and review of the streets by the City Engineer. All ayes. Carried.

Comprehensive Plan amendment – Future land use for Amity Field (parcel #281-23-0527260006):

Presentation: Mr. Olejniczak stated that the current Comprehensive Plan was adopted in February, 2010. A chapter on future land use in one of the elements of the plan. The recommended classification for this parcel is Public & Institutional. The Comp Plan should match the proposed use. The City has owned this parcel and for many years had been leased by the Sturgeon Bay School District, which no longer leases the site.

A proposed rezoning to a Planned Unit Development (PUD) is under consideration that would be for a development of 34 apartment units. Under state law, when a property is rezoned, the action is required to be consistent with the adopted Comprehensive Plan. If the PUD is approved for this parcel, an amendment to the Comprehensive Plan is needed. The suggested new use for this parcel is Multi-Family Residential.

Public Hearing: Vice-Chair Statz opened the public hearing at 6:38 p.m.

Bill Chadoir, 324 Alabama Street, serving as Interim Executive Director for the Door County Development Corporation, stated that the #1 issue that we are dealing with today is workforce development. Young people are not going into trades. It is hard finding workers and keeping workers. Apartments are a much bigger role than in the past. He is in support of the Comp Plan amendment. To research the problem, \$40,000 has been raised for a consultant. The study should be done later this summer or early fall. A manufacturer was relocated to the Industrial Park that was near Amity Field. It is a workforce housing neighborhood. Jobs pay full benefits and keeps enrollment in schools.

Mr. Chadoir had read a letter from Bill Behme, HR & Labor Relations Manager Fincantieri Bay Shipbuilding, regarding the need for adequate housing and to support those who have a vision for making affordable housing a reality to both new and existing families.

Hans Christian, 330 N. 3rd Avenue, is supportive of the development. The development has been flexible and has shown sensitivity.

Aaron Carmody, 1779 Shiloh Road, wondered why there is a housing shortage. Consider transient housing.

Ms. Nault read a summary of three letters in favor of the amendment from Dave Rolston, President and CEO of Hatco Corp.; Chris Moore, President/Owner of NEW Industries; and Michael Baudhuin, Vice-President WireTech Fabricators, Inc. who all agree regarding the lack of available workforce and available housing.

The public hearing was declared closed at 6:55 p.m.

Consideration of: Ms. Hauser asked if there was any Public/Institutional looking to develop in the past couple of years. Mr. Olejniczak responded City Hall and the County had built their facilities.

After further discussion, it was moved by Mr. Gilson, seconded by Ms. Hauser to recommend to Council approval of the Comprehensive Plan amendment for the future land use classification for the Amity Field parcel to be Multiple-Family Residential, with Mixed-Residential as the alternative. All ayes. Carried.

Comprehensive Plan amendment- Future land use for Robert Goetz (parcel #281-68-17000301A):

Presentation: Mr. Olejniczak stated that this item is a bit more controversial than the previous item. **The recommended future classification for this parcel, located at the SE corner of Tacoma Beach Road and Clay Banks Road, is Single-Family Residential- Lower Density,** except for a small area approximately 1.5 acres at the intersection that is planned for future Transitional Commercial. The City had received a proposal to rezone the property to allow apartment buildings. The proposal was for 162 units and has now been brought down to 134 units. The site is not conducive for single-family lots.

An amendment to the Comprehensive Plan should be undertaken in addition to the rezoning. If the Plan Commission and Council believe the proposed apartment development is an appropriate use for this parcel. **The suggested new land use category is Mixed Residential.** Other possible land use designations include: Single-Family Residential – Lower Density, which is the current land use classification; Single-Family Residential-Higher Density; or Multiple-Family Residential.

The northwest corner of this parcel is planned for Transitional Commercial, which means Commercial uses that are compatible with neighborhoods or can transition into neighborhoods.

Office use is more confined than Transitional (ie office complex on the corner of 18th Avenue and Michigan Street).

Public & Institutional category is used for the City well, Knights of Columbus Hall and Jehovah's Witness Kingdom Hall, along with the property located on the south side of the highway.

Open Space & Recreation identifies a neighborhood, according to the Sturgeon Bay Outdoor Recreation Plan, except for the Goetz site. The needs and desires of the community need to be reflected upon.

Staff recommends the future land use classification be Mixed-Residential with or without keeping the northwest corner as Transitional Commercial.

Public Hearing: Vice-Chair Statz opened the public hearing at 7:13 p.m.

Gerald Inman, 1500 Tacoma Beach Rd., Unit 5-3, spoke on behalf of 247 taxpayers that signed a petition in opposition to the proposed change of the Comprehensive Plan and to request the zoning be changed to R-2 Single-Family Residential.

Marti Spitell Ziegelbauer, 1573 Tacoma Beach Road, was present representing her and her husband, Gary. She is on the Board of Directors for Strawberry Creek Estates and contacted all the residents of Strawberry Creek Estates regarding this proposal. She asked that the proposal be denied. Traffic is a big issue.

Jeff Griffin, 1571 Tacoma Beach Road, stated that the people that live in the vicinity didn't think the social contract would be changed. The issue is traffic.

Bill Chaudoir, 324 Alabama Street, thought this was a perfect location for apartments, but the intersection needs to be improved. Workforce housing needs to be addressed. This area is not a Single-Family district.

Mr. Olejniczak stated that currently there are two areas, near Target and _____, Comp Plan designation and

Jim Herbst, 839 E. Fathom Place, lives in Sawyer Subdivision, and stated there are severe water problems. He wondered what this development will do. Rents did not seem affordable.

Gerrit DeJonge, 944 Tacoma Beach Road, stated there is a need for additional housing, but where? We need people to work. You don't need to change a Comprehensive Plan to cater to an outside developer.

Brad Andreae, owner of Therma-Tron-X, stated that they have 260 employees, with high paid jobs. A 26,000 square foot addition was just added to their facility. If there is no housing, they would have to build their own apartments south of town or locate their facility elsewhere.

Hans Christian, 330 N 3rd Avenue, mentioned that the Bonovich's will be building apartments, as well as the properties south of town. The Peil and Palmer Johnson property on Egg Harbor Road will be developed, as well as West Side School, Target area and the area around the skate park. The proposed area is a terrible location.

Kathy Hayes, 864 Circle Ridge Place, gave a history on the busy intersection.

Jim White, 1500 Tacoma Beach Road, said if density is changed the traffic changes. Most things are located on the other side of the bay.

Diane Brauer, 431 N. 11th Place, had concerns about density. The City does need housing. There are a lot of children with no sidewalks, with adding numerous vehicles. This is asking for another fatality.

Rebecca Laughlin, 1231 Clay Banks Road, stated this area is wetlands. There are a lot of mosquitos. It is probably looking at more than 134 units in the longrun.

Jim Flanagan, 1546 Tacoma Beach Road, is a seasonal resident. The Comprehensive Plan should not sit for 10 years. The City should be more current with trends. He hopes the proposal does not pass, but if approved a stop and go light should coordinate with the bridge.

Nate Kramer, 728 E. Clay Banks Road, looked at the safety aspects and there are a lot of industrial trucks driving down County U.

Dave Hoffman, 644 Tacoma Beach Road, stated there are a lot of walkers, garbage trucks, and cars at fast speed in that area. Something was supposed to have been done when the Oxford Avenue Apartments were built. He would like to see a four-foot bike/walking trail along Tacoma Beach Road.

Scott Thomas, 1557 Tacoma Beach Road, agreed with everyone that spoke. County U is the only road without a controlled intersection.

Bill Murphy, 1500 Tacoma Beach Road, stated that this property is meant for Single-Family with some Two-Family homes. The proposed Multi-Family use would lead to the largest apartment complex in the City. The area needs revitalization.

Randy Dixon, 1108 Rhode Island Street), is a professional archeologist who was hired to do a Phase 1 archeological survey on this property. He said the property does contain some artifacts. The piece of property is pretty messed up. There are 32,000 archeological sites in Wisconsin.

Kathy Hayes, 264 Circle Ridge Place, stated that archeology is important.

Ms. Nault read a summary of letters in opposition to the proposal.

Michael Olesen – 1500 Tacoma Beach Rd., stated that the Board of Directors of Strawberry Creek Estates has made contact with the owners in Strawberry Creek Estates and are in opposition to the proposed change to the Comprehensive Plan or zoning of the 14 acre parcel. The rezoning to mixed residential would be in conflict with the use that the Comp Plan presently recommends for this parcel. There would be significant increase in traffic. The project should be denied. The Board of Directors would like the subject parcel rezoned to R-2 Single-Family Residential.

Scott & Linda Thomas, 1557 Tacoma Beach Road, do not want a change to the Comp Plan. The property will be an extreme stress point for traffic & safety. This property doesn't represent Sturgeon Bay as a classy place to live.

Betsy Rossberg, 544 Tacoma Beach Road #34, is uncomfortable with a complex this large and recommends an environmental & economic impact study, as well as a traffic study be completed. Sturgeon Bay needs affordable housing.

Gerrit & Lonnie DeJonge – The Comprehensive Plan 7 PUD do not match. Other concerns are traffic issues, density too great for location, does not conform to the existing development pattern of neighborhood, existing wetlands will create issues, there's an archaeological site located on the property, and there have been a number of concerned citizens representing disapproval of the project.

Bill & Joanne Patterson – 926 & 932 Tacoma Beach Road, stated many times when the bridge is open traffic backs up for 15 minutes or more. Adding more vehicles would be disasterous. Does not conform to the Comp Plan.

Scott Bader – 1275 Tacoma Beach Road, doesn't know why this development has gotten this far. We should be able to rely on zoning when purchasing and living in our neighborhoods.

Greg Daanen – 920 Tacoma Beach Road, is opposed to the project.

Dennis & Barbara Hare- 1500 Tacoma Beach Road, Unit 2-1, stated the proposal would have a detrimental effect on the quality of life for citizens, as well as creating dangerous situation. The proposal is not consistent with the best interests that the Comp Plan was established for.

Norbert & Patricia Lenius- 1052 & 1066 Tacoma Beach Road, is not in favor of changing the Comp Plan and zoning. This has too much density for the area.

Lynne Weborg, 450 Tacoma Beach Road, is against changing the zoning. There are a lot of dangerous traffic conditions.

Gilbert Cichy, no given address, stated this project will disrupt the area forever. There are other suitable areas in Sturgeon Bay.

Heidi Kratcha, no given address, stated there are no sidewalks on Tacoma Beach Road. They often take their kids on walks and bike rides to the Ahnapee Trail. A lot of people walk their dogs. She is concerned with heavy traffic.

Hans Christian, 330 N 3rd Avenue, thought it would be appropriate for staff to change their mind on this project and no longer show any support.

Scott and Amy Richard, 941 Tacoma Beach Road, has concerns and is opposed to the proposed change in zoning and to any zoning that is not specified by the City of Sturgeon Bay Master Plan.

The following letters received were neither for or against:

Robert Perlewitz- not given address-stated the only way an apartment complex can be built is if a stop & go light or round about is built.

Chris Olson- 46 E Redwood St., stated that if approved, he would like to see all exterior lighting fixtures utilizing full cut-off optics. Also, he would like to see impervious surface all mitigated with an onsite stormwater plan installation.

In addition to the 247 signatures on the petition, plus an additional four signatures that Mr. Inman submitted, 20 emails had been received supporting the petition.

The public hearing was declared closed at 8:28 p.m.

Consideration of: Discussion was held after hearing testimony. Moved by Ms. Hauser, seconded by Mr. Norland to deny the Comprehensive Plan amendment for future land use for the Robert Goetz parcel.

Mr. Gilson stated that there is something wrong with the Comprehensive Plan. He didn't see any desire to build Single-Family homes.

Ms. Hauser stated that the Plan Commission will resolve the housing problem. The Comprehensive Plan will be reviewed in the next year.

Mr. Gilson added that developers don't grow on trees. This is a reasonable site. The City needs to push this. It is going to happen at some point in time.

Mr. Statz mentioned that the intersection needs to be improved. The State requires deaths for something to happen. Traffic going out onto the highway is a safety issue.

Ms. Hauser asked why have a Comp Plan if it is not followed? There are other locations to build apartments.

Mr. Hurley thanked everyone for sharing their comments. **ADD**

A roll call vote was taken on the motion to deny the Comprehensive Plan amendment. Motion carried, with Mr. Statz and Mr. Gilson voting no.

Consideration of: Combined Preliminary/Final Planned Unit Development for Phillips Development LLC, for a 34-unit multiple-family development, located in the 700 blocks of

Erie and Florida Streets, parcel #281-23-0527260006 (aka Amity Field): Mr. Sullivan-Robinson stated that Phillips Development is petitioning for approval of a PUD for a 34-unit multiple-family development. The project consists of three 8-unit and one 10-unit townhome buildings. There were concerns brought up last month at the public hearing which included traffic issues, increase in density, living between multi-family facilities, having an onsite manager, and enclosing the detention pond.

The Aesthetic Design & Site Plan Review Board recommended approval of the project, subject to the new fire hydrant on Florida Street be relocated further eastward, __(what else?)_____.

Ms. Hauser questioned the park & playground fee. Mr. Olejniczak responded that every residential unit pays a park & playground fee of \$300 that is used for public equipment. It is not designed for private property.

Jon LeRoy, Mau & Associates, stated that they have added sidewalk, more landscaping, and the living room areas are on the outside of the properties. There will be a berm planted on the northwest corner of the property.

Ms. Hauser commented that the units looked pleasing and that they did a nice job.

Mr. Hurley said there was not a good spot for a playground. The equipment across the street would be sufficient.

Mr. Norland __(windows across the top)_____.

Mr. LeRoy stated the townhomes inspire a maritime Door County feel.

After further discussion, it was moved by Mr. Statz, seconded by Ms. Hauser to recommend to Council approval of the PUD subject to final approval of the City Engineer for the stormwater management plan. All ayes. Carried.

Consideration of: Combined Preliminary/Final Planned Unit Development for Duquaine Development (Mau & Associates, LLP, Agent), for a 162-unit multiple-family development, located on the southeast corner of Tacoma Beach Road and Clay Banks Road/CTH U, parcel #281-68-17000301A: Since the item to amend the Comprehensive Plan was denied, members wondered if this item should still be considered. Mr. Olejniczak mentioned that it could be tabled, it could be acted on at this meeting; or could approve a modified PUD. The ordinance provides a time limit.

After a short discussion, it was moved by Ms. Hauser, seconded by Mr. Norland to deny the combined Preliminary/Final Planned Unit Development for Duquaine Development **for all the reasons given during the public hearing, including traffic safety, density, existing wetlands, and an existing archeological site.** Roll call vote. Motion failed, with Mr. Gilson, Mr. Hurley, and Mr. Statz voting no.

Steve Beida, Mau & Associates, was available for any questions.

Moved by Mr. Statz, seconded by Mr. Gilson to table until next meeting. All ayes. Carried.

Public comment on non-agenda Plan Commission related items: No one spoke on non-agenda items.

Adjourn: Moved by Mr. Norland, seconded by Ms. Hauser to adjourn. All ayes. Carried.
Meeting adjourned at 9:15 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Cheryl Nault
Community Development/Building Inspection Secretary