



Adrian O. Mapp, Mayor

**CITY OF PLAINFIELD**  
**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**  
 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, ROOM 202  
 PLAINFIELD, NEW JERSEY 07060  
 Phone: (908) 753-3580 \* Fax: (908) 226-2587



William H. Michelson, Chairman  
 Lawrence T. Quirk, Vice-Chairman

**Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission**  
**Regular Meeting Agenda, August 23, 2022; 7:30 PM, Via Zoom**

**Open Public Meeting Statement**

Chairman Michelson called the virtual meeting to order at 7:38 P.M. and in conformance with the Open Public Meetings Act read aloud the following: In compliance with the Open Public Meetings Act, this is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission. Adequate notice of this meeting was given in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act; the annual meeting schedule was published in the Courier-News on February 10, 2022 and posted in the offices of the City Clerk and Planning Division and on the City website. I ask that everyone including Commission members please turn their cell phones to silence or vibrate and not take or send any electronic messages during this meeting

**Roll Call**

2022 Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Name, Class Designation (Term Ends)	1/25/22	2/22/22	3/22/22	4/26/22	5/24/22	6/21/22	7/26/22	8/23/22	9/27/22	10/25/22	11/22/22	12/20/22
<b>Mario Camino</b> , Class A (12/31/2024)	X	O	X	O	X	X	X	O				
<b>John Favazzo</b> , Class A (12/31/2025)	X	X	X	O	X	X	X	O				
<b>William T. Garrett</b> , Class B (12/31/2023)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X				
<b>Sandra Gurshman</b> , Class B (12/31/2022)	X	X	X	O	O	O	O	O				
<b>William H. Michelson</b> , Class B (12/31/2022)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X				
<b>Lawrence T. Quirk</b> , Class A (12/31/2025)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X				
<b>Gary F. Schneider</b> , Class C (12/31/2023)	X	O	X	X	X	X	X	X				
<b>Reginald Thomas</b> , Class A (12/31/2022)	X	X	X	O	X	O	X	X				
<b>Gail Smith Alexander</b> , Class C (12/31/2024)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	O				
<b>Kirk Hemphill</b> , Alternate Member 1 (12/31/2022)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X				
Alternate 2 (vacant- unexpired term ends 12/31/2020)	na	na										

**Presentation of Meeting Minutes**

June 28<sup>th</sup> meeting minutes were presented. Motion to adopt minutes was made by Commissioner Schneider and seconded by Commissioner Hemphill. Voice vote, all in favor.

## Old Business

- 1. Hearing #1: Certificate of Appropriateness HPC 2022-13 Applicant and Owner City of Plainfield, North Avenue from Watchung Avenue to Park Avenue, and Gavett Place from East Second Street to North Avenue; Block and Lot NA. North Avenue Historic District.** This is a proposal to turn these two streets into a pedestrian mall, with numerous new or upgraded features. Applicant seeks to improve existing roadways including milling and paving, reconstruction of handicap ramps and adjacent sidewalks, a gazebo, tree planting, and drainage improvements including rain gardens. It is noted once again that the State Historic Preservation Office made numerous critiques and suggestions to the original plan.

Historic consultant Barton Ross notes he has spoken with the City Engineer again. New plans have still not been submitted, but he anticipates they will be, in time for next month's meeting.

Chairman Michelson notes the case should be carried another month; all agree.

Motion to carry HPC 2022-13 to September 27 was made by Commissioner Thomas and seconded by Commissioner Hemphill. Voice vote, all in favor.

- 2. Hearing #2: Certificate of Appropriateness HPC 2022-47. Applicant and Owner Jibril Sanders, 648 Belvidere Avenue; Block 906 Lot 6. Netherwood Heights Historic District.** Applicant seeks to install a gazebo, a swimming pool, window awnings, bluestone sidewalk (existing one has a number of broken slates), fence (change of material), wrap-around driveway with pavers, and renovation of the side porch (north side of house) with new railings, doors and screens.

Ms. Susan Rubright, Esq. of Brach Eichler, Roseland, NJ represents applicant Jibril Sanders as counsel.

Mr. Robert Cozzarelli represents applicant as his architect.

Mr. Jibril Sanders at 648 Belvidere Avenue introduces himself.

This case was carried from partial hearing on July 26. Mr. Cozzarelli says he revised the plans, based on comments from the last hearing. The items listed in the plans now include details for screens, pavers, and railings, with manufacturer cutouts for all materials. He has now changed the plan for the concrete front walkway, which will be perpendicular to the street and repaired, but with no driveway work.

Vice Chairman Quirk asks Board Counsel to mark new plans dated August 12, 2022 as Exhibit A. He also asks to clarify whether the bluestone repairs would include the front walkway from the street. Mr. Cozzarelli notes that the path to the home would be tinted concrete, but the sidewalk would be bluestone.

Vice Chairman Quirk asks about a notation about a removal by the door near the side porch. Mr. Cozzarelli notes that the plans are greyed out due to purposes of perspective on the drawing, and no removals will be in the final plan.

Vice Chairman Quirk asks about the stockade fence and whether it would be one style all the way around the home. Mr. Cozzarelli notes there are two types of fence between the front of the home and the rear.

Chairman Michelson asks about a pile of perceived cinderblocks on the property, near the porch. Mr. Cozzarelli brings up a visual for reference. Mr. Cozzarelli notes they will include this in the final plan, to make it work with the fence.

Chairman Michelson asks if the plan is to still include a new semicircular driveway. Mr. Cozzarelli notes this feature has been removed from the plans, leaving only the concrete front walkway and the existing driveway along the south lot line.

Chairman asks for any public comment, none is offered.

Motion was made to grant HPC 2022-47 a Certificate of Appropriateness, to allow the construction of a concrete front walkway from the sidewalk to the front of the home, with the condition that HPC-endorsed proper tinting be added to it; the bluestone sidewalk slates will be repaired or replaced; the side porch will be given new screens and awnings; the railings will match the existing balustrades and will reflect the architect's plans marked as Exhibit A; and Applicant may construct stockade fences in the rear yard and south side yard, as shown on Exhibit A. Motion was seconded by Commissioner Schneider.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Garrett: abstains  
Commissioner Thomas: Yes  
Commissioner Schneider: Yes  
Commissioner Hemphill: Yes  
Vice Chairman Quirk: Yes  
Chairman Michelson: Yes

### **New Business**

- 3. Hearing #1: Certificate of Appropriateness HPC 2022-45. Applicant and Owner Maria Pellum, 829 Park Avenue; Block 828 Lot 14. Crescent Area Historic District.** Applicant seeks to replace windows that are leaking water into first floor and basement

Not to be heard this evening, due to not enough information presented for completeness.

- 4. Hearing #2: Certificate of Appropriateness HPC 2022-46. Applicant and Owner Max Sanchez, 829 Richmond Street; Block 639 Lot 22. Putnam Watchung Historic District.** Applicant seeks to obtain after-the-fact approval for Jacuzzi installation and approval for chimney repair including a change of material from stucco to natural stone.

Max Sanchez of 829 Richmond Street presents his case.

Mr. Sanchez notes that, after Hurricane Ida, his chimney was damaged. He would like to upgrade it to a new material made of stone.

Vice Chairman Quirk asks if the applicant is looking to install actual stone or engraved stucco. Mr. Sanchez notes that he has not committed to particular material yet, but does not want to use stucco.

Vice Chairman Quirk asks if applicant is still looking for hot tub approval. Mr. Sanchez notes that the hot tub has been there for several years, not visible from the street, and is looking for after-the-fact approval.

Chairman Michelson agrees the existing chimney should be replaced, but does not agree with the stone in the example.

Commissioner Thomas says he does not mind the stone, but he did mention that scale and color should be carefully considered, and presented before a final decision. He also notes the existing stucco was there likely for fire protection. He also notes that there is no chimney cap, and that the chimney is tapered. He notes the chimney may need to be drawn out for reference.

Chairman Michelson notes that the material in the applicant's chimney is very thin, where the example's chimney is very thick, and the applicant should consider something in between.

Vice Chairman Quirk notes that the size of the stones is proportional to the size of the chimney in the example.

Commissioner Hemphill asks about the installation of the hot tub generator. Mr. Sanchez goes through the history of the hot tub and how the zoning application process triggered this issue.

Commissioner Schneider recommends applicant look for ideas online, for potential chimney material.

Chairman Michelson says this case cannot be completed this evening, due to the open question of chimney material. Applicant will choose a product and present it to the Commission next month.

Motion to carry HPC 2022-46 to September 27, 2022 was made by Vice Chairman Quirk and seconded by Commissioner Schneider. Voice vote, all in favor.

## **Public Comment**

### **Discussions**

Chairman Michelson reports the Mayor's interest in purchasing the Old YMCA property since the developer apparently is not prepared to proceed with construction following approvals from both this Commission and the Planning Board. The same architect who did the previous drawings was asked to be retained by Council for the new plans.

Chairman Michelson also speaks on the changes to the HPC Ordinance, which was approved on first reading by the City Council in its July 11 meeting. The Resolution was tabled one month, at the request of the City Clerk, but has also now been carried to the September 15 Council meeting.

- Vice Chairman Quirk notes these changes will include the end of the process by which projects on City property have been brought before the HPC for nearly 20 years. He notes that these changes would make it such that the HPC's role in cases that also have to go before the Planning or Zoning Board cases would be reduced to a referral report to whichever Board is hearing a case. The HPC would apparently not retain its key function of granting or denying Certificates of Appropriateness.
- Commissioner Schneider recalls what happened the last time the Old YMCA was brought to the HPC, and decisions and comments made at the time.

Acting Director of Planning Brittany Claybrooks asks Board Counsel Christopher Zingaro about whether there are Design Guidelines by which the districts are governed. Chairman Michelson notes there are extensive Design Guidelines attached to the Ordinance, that were adopted by the Council about 10-12 years ago. Ms. Claybrooks asks Counsel if HPC member preferences should be taken into account when making a decision. Counsel Zingaro notes that the Commission only acts on what is submitted, but does not act based on their preferences alone.

- Chairman Michelson notes that the HPC is more proactive than the other Boards. He also notes that Board Counsel's role is advisory only, and that he as Chairman makes the decisions.
- Commissioner Thomas clarifies that the HPC does have Design Guidelines. He also notes that HPC Commissioners' opinions are not abstract, but are guided by their extensive architectural experience.

Jennifer Popper, 816 Dixie Lane, comments that the aforementioned conversation could have happened in private instead of taking up public time.

Chairman Michelson asks the HPC for remarks on Mr. Ross' Sustainability Guidelines. Mr. Ross notes that the draft should be sent to SHPO by Labor Day. Chairman Michelson comments that there are many pages that are "intentionally left blank", and that the North Avenue Historic District should be referred to as such and not "North Avenue Commercial Historic District"

Chairman Michelson also reported on the changes in the administrative responsibilities of Planning staff, resulting in personnel turnover.

### **Adjournment**

Motion to adjourn was made by Commissioner Schneider and seconded by Vice Chairman Quirk. Voice vote unanimous in favor. Meeting ended at 9:28pm.