



CITY OF PLAINFIELD
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, ROOM 202
 PLAINFIELD, NEW JERSEY 07060



Adrian O. Mapp, Mayor

William H. Michelson, Chairman
 Lawrence T. Quirk, Vice-Chairman

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
JUNE 25, 2019, 7:30 PM. CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NEW JERSEY

Call to Order and Public Notice

Chairman Michelson called the meeting to order at 7:36 P.M. and in conformance with the Open Public Meetings Act read aloud the following: "In compliance with the Open Public Meetings Act, this is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission. Adequate notice of this meeting has been given in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, the annual meeting schedule was published in the Courier-News, and copies of the meeting schedule are posted in the offices of the City Clerk and Planning Division. I ask that everyone including Commission members please turn their cell phones to silence or vibrate and not take or send any electronic messages during this meeting."

Roll Call

2019 Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Name, Class Designation (Term Ends)	1/22/19	2/26/19	3/26/19	4/23/19	5/28/19	6/25/19	7/23/19	8/27/19	9/24/19	10/22/19	11/26/19	12/17/19
Mario Camino , Class A (12/31/2020)	X	ab	*	ab	ab	X						
John Favazzo , Class A (12/31/2021)	X	X	C	X	ab	X						
William T. Garrett , Class B (12/31/2019)	X	X	A	X	X	X						
Sandra Gurshman , Class B (12/31/2022)	ab	X	N	X	X							
William H. Michelson , Class B (12/31/2022)	X	X	C	X	X	X						
Lawrence T. Quirk , Class A (12/31/2021)	X	X	E	ab	X	X						
Gary F. Schneider , Class C (12/31/2019)	X	X	L	X	X							
Reginald Thomas , Class A (12/31/2022)	X	X	L	X	X	X						
Member 9 (vacant- unexpired term ends 12/31/2020)	n/a	n/a	E	n/a	n/a							
Gail Smith Alexander , Alternate Member 1 (12/31/2020)	x	X	D	X	ab	X						
Alternate 2 (vacant- unexpired term ends 12/31/2020)	x	ab	*	n/a	n/a							

Also present: HPC Consultant Barton Ross, HPC Secretary Scott Bauman

Presentation of Meeting Minutes

Commissioner Thomas made a motion to accept the May 28, 2019, regular meeting minutes as presented; Commissioner Garrett seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved by voice vote, with Commissioners Camino, Favazzo, and Smith Alexander abstaining.

New Business

- Certificate of Appropriateness HPC 2019-03. Applicant & Owner: Lidio Matos
 242 East 9th Street. Block 824, Lot 28. Crescent Area Historic District**

Recording Secretary Mr. Bauman noted that this is the second hearing and the applicant previously served notice and the Commission continues to have jurisdiction to hear the application. Mr. Lido Matos, 120 Duer Street, North Plainfield, introduced himself to the Commission and provided them with 2 estimates for Anderson 400 Series

Woodwright double-hung windows for 32 windows. Mr. Matos confirmed that he wishes to replace all existing windows; he provided Commissioners with an inventory of existing windows including number, dimension, and type.

A discussion ensued over the two estimates, grid patterns (9 over 1), and storm windows (none proposed). Chairman Michelson opened the meeting to the public. No one from the public commented. Vice-Chairman Quirk made a motion to approve the replacement of all windows at the house (32) according to the submitted Home Depot order quote #H0906-146177, dated 6/18/19 and submitted with the applicant's revised submission packet. All windows will be 9/1 wood Anderson 400 Series "Woodright" double-hung units with simulated divided lites as specified in the application. All other trim and moldings will be wood and must exactly match existing window profiles and materials. Snap-on plastic divider grilles will not be allowed as a substitute in the historic districts. Commissioner Favazzo seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

**2. Certificate of Appropriateness HPC 2019-01. Applicant & Owner: Pradip Paul
710-16 Belvidere Avenue. Block 903, Lot 2. Netherwood Heights Historic District**

Recording Secretary Mr. Bauman noted that this is the second hearing and the applicant previously served notice and the Commission continues to have jurisdiction to hear the application.

Applicant/property owner Pradip Paul, 52 Mansion Terrace, Cranford, and architect Kurt Ludwig, 77 North Main Street, Milltown, introduced themselves to the Commission. Mr. Ludwig cited the differences between the old plans and revised plans- elimination of the circular driveway, reduced the size of the building to 3,500 SF, eliminated the swimming pool, redesigned the front façade, and partially covered the rear yard deck. The revised proposal complies with all setback and lot/building coverage requirements. Mr. Ludwig explained to the Commissioners the first and second floor plan, and each building elevation. Mr. Ludwig called the style of the building "arts and crafts", and "craftsman." A discussion ensued over the quantity of stacked stone exterior siding. Upon questioning, Mr. Ludwig said the chimney is not masonry, but a gas chase with a wood frame. Commissioners asked Mr. Ludwig to break up the façade on the side elevations- there are not enough windows on the right side elevation. Mr. Ludwig confirmed the siding is Hardieplank siding.

Commissioner Thomas commented, if the design is Craftsman, then the applicant should go more with truncated than Doric columns. Commissioner Thomas asked Mr. Ludwig to consider truncating the chimney so it diminishes and adding chimney clay pots of a different color. Regarding the chimney, Commissioner Thomas cautioned on using careful proportions of stone- the smaller the busier, it will lose detail. Commissioner Garrett asked about the proposed detached garage; Mr. Ludwig said drawings are not ready. Upon further questioning, Mr. Ludwig said the driveway will be asphalt and he agreed to a grey tinted driveway apron if necessary. When asked about grading, Mr. Ludwig said the rear part of the lot slopes down and there is no pool proposed- it is less challenging, he is having a topographic survey prepared.

Chairman Michelson opened the meeting to the public. Louise Colodne of 701 Belvidere Avenue made comments about the proposed veneer siding, portico, roof and Hardieplank; the lack of shutters for windows; 5 bedrooms if one counts the first floor office as a bedroom; the visibility of the detached garage from the street; and the lack of a landscape plan. Elizabeth Hine, of 830 Belvidere Avenue cited her concern over the detached garage, the lack of windows on the side elevations, and the stacked stone on the façade. Mr. Ludwig agreed to bring in a veneer sample to the next meeting. Commissioner Thomas said landscaping will help soften the stone façade features. Tom Clark of 729 Belvidere Avenue said detached garages are visible from the street throughout the district, there are no sidewalks in the immediate area, and the Commission should keep to a deadline- if it is not met then the meeting should be postponed. Chairman Michelson reminded Mr. Ludwig that July 10 is the deadline for the July 23 meeting.

Chairman Michelson closed the public portion of the hearing. Vice-Chairman Quirk made a motion to carry the application to the July 23, 2019, meeting, no further public notice is required. Commissioner Thomas seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

3. **Certificate of Appropriateness HPC 2019-06. Applicant: Vision Solar, LLC. Owner: Kisha Daniels
814 Webster Place. Block 635, Lot 5. Putnam Watchung Historic District**

Recording Secretary Mr. Bauman noted that the applicant adequately served notice and the Commission has jurisdiction to hear the application. John Oakes of Vision Solar LLC, 511 Route 168 Turnersville, New Jersey, introduced himself to the Commission. Mr. Oakes gave his background on the solar industry and the mandate in New Jersey. Mr. Oakes said his proposal consists of installing 11 roof mounted solar panels (193 SF) on the northeast second floor roof facing Webster Place.

Chairman Michelson stated his position that solar should not be allowed in historic districts at all. The Commission has had discussions over allowing solar in non-visible areas. Chairman Michelson welcomed the applicant to proceed and the Commission would rule if the proposal is appropriate in a historic district. Chairman Michelson opined that solar panels are not compatible, they do not look old, they are new-fangled devices. Mr. Oakes said the roof faces due south, the project is important to the homeowner. Mr. Oakes cited the rising costs of energy, and his opinion that solar panels add value to a home- it is an asset.

Vice-Chairman Quirk said he looked at the pictures and the panels are visible from the street- that is a change to the property and streetscape. Vice-Chairman Quirk further stated the solar industry is developing panels that mimic roofs and will not be as intrusive as the proposed panels. The proposed look is not historic. Mr. Oakes cited expenses associated with panels that mimic roofs and Vice-Chairman Quirk acknowledged the cost differences. Mr. Oakes said he can look into a solar roof; Vice-Chairman Quirk said the Commission is always open to something new.

Commissioner Thomas suggested getting the panels off the house altogether and propose a freestanding array. Commissioner Favazzo said the proposal is not in keeping of what the Commission is preserving in the district. Mr. Oakes cited the 30 percent tax incentive is ending this year and decreasing through 2021.

Chairman Michelson opened the meeting to the public. No one from the public commented. Vice-Chairman Quirk made a motion to deny the Certificate of Appropriateness for reasons that it is visible from the street, it is non-historic, and has an adverse effect to the property and the Putnam Watchung Historic District; the proposal is not consistent with the city's historic design guidelines. Commissioner Garrett seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

4. **Certificate of Appropriateness HPC 2019-07. Applicant: & Owner: Thomas T. Turner, III
313 W 9th Street. Block 759, Lot 22. Van Wyck Brooks Historic District**

Recording Secretary Mr. Bauman noted that the applicant adequately served notice and the Commission has jurisdiction to hear the application. Applicant/property owner Thomas Turner, 313 West 9th Street, Plainfield, introduced himself to the Commission. Mr. Turner informed the Commission that he proposes to remove pipe and stones next to his driveway; repair the front steps; finish the front walkway; install fencing around the back and garage side of the house; install castle stone on bottom half of front and rear of the house; replace siding with Hardie board; install a pagoda over the front steps; replace the asphalt shingles on the house roof; and construct an addition to the left side of the house for closet and shower space. Vice-Chairman confirmed the L-shaped addition on the left side elevation. Mr. Turner cited an early 1990's Zoning Board approval of a side yard variance for the addition. Mr. Turner will provide the Commission with a copy of the approval.

Vice-Chairman Quirk said he has no problem with the steps and walkway; he asked Mr. Turner what the driveway material will be; Mr. Turner said he is not sure. A discussion ensued about existing and proposed fencing; Chairman Michelson noted that the property survey is old- he recommended that Mr. Turner draw himself a larger, clearer rendition of his fencing proposal.

Chairman Michelson said it appears that the proposal will need variances from the Zoning Board and the Board wants to hear from the Commission. The fences are not likely to be a problem- the wood design is ok if no more than 6 feet in height. The front addition, steps repair, portico- all reasonable but we need more details. Regarding

the left side addition, it is an interesting hardship situation- it will require a variance. Regarding the 2 stone walls, Mr. Turner agreed to remove the wall to the right side of the driveway; Chairman Michelson commented that Mr. Turner might have to deal with the Zoning Board about the stone wall in front of the sidewalk.

Commissioners expressed the need for further detail and pictures. Commissioner Favazzo recommended offsetting a gable; Commissioner Thomas commented that the plan needs to be "to scale".

Vice-Chairman Quirk questioned the notice, commenting that it did not include the rear addition. Chairman Michelson commented that this is a classic example of a non-contributing style in a historic district; it is the Commission's role to see if changes can be made that do not make the non-conformity any worse.

Commissioner Smith Alexander asked Mr. Turner if he was proposing lights on each fence post; Mr. Turner said lights are proposed every 8 feet.

Commissioner Thomas made a motion to carry the application to the July 23, 2019, meeting date, no further public notice is required. Commissioner Favazzo seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

Unfinished Business

1. Updating the Master Plan Historic Preservation Element

Mr. Ross reported that the city needs to proceed with the Historic Commission and Planning Board public meetings. Chairman Michelson reported that he, Barton Ross, and Planning Director Bill Nierstedt are working together to meet the September 30, 2019, deadline. A subcommittee consisting of Commissioners Schneider, Garrett, and Alexander will assist with the project. Chairman Michelson agreed to write a background paragraph on each of the districts.

2. 822 2nd Place

Chairman Michelson informed the Commission that 822 2nd Place is being condemned by the City Health Officer. The tax collector is looking for the owners, many in-house discussions have occurred.

3. Property Maintenance & Zoning Complaints

A discussion ensued over who to call when complaints happen moving forward.

4. 2019 Tri-County History Fair

Vice-Chairman Quirk made a motion to authorize a \$20.00 expenditure for the registration fee to the September 28, 2019, Tri-County History Fair. Commissioner Thomas seconded the motion and it was approved by roll call.

Adjournment

Chairman Michelson announced that this would be HPC Secretary Scott Bauman's last meeting; Mr. Bauman thanked the Commission and wished them well. There being no further business, Vice-Chairman Quirk made a motion for adjournment, seconded by Commissioner Thomas; all voted in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 10:21 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Scott Bauman

Scott Bauman, PP, AICP

Recording Secretary

Prepared July 9, 2019

Approved by the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission: July 23, 2019