



CITY OF PLAINFIELD
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, ROOM 202
 PLAINFIELD, NEW JERSEY 07060



Adrian O. Mapp, Mayor

William H. Michelson, Chairman
 Lawrence T. Quirk, Vice-Chairman

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MARCH 28, 2017, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

Call to Order and Public Notice

Chairman Michelson called the meeting to order at 7:39 P.M. and in conformance with the Open Public Meetings Act read aloud the following: "In compliance with the Open Public Meetings Act, this is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Plainfield. Adequate notice of this meeting has been given in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, the annual meeting schedule was published in the Courier-News, and copies of the meeting schedule are posted in the offices of the City Clerk and Planning Division. I ask that everyone including Commission members please turn their cell phones to silence or vibrate and not take or send any electronic messages during this meeting."

Roll Call

2017 Historic Preservation Commission Name, Class Designation (Term Ends)	1/24/17	2/28/17	3/28/17	4/25/17	5/23/17	6/27/17	7/25/17	8/22/17	9/26/17	10/24/17	11/14/17	12/19/17
John Favazzo , Class A (12/31/2017)	X	X	X									
Bill Garrett , Class B (12/31/2019)		X	X									
Sandra Gurshman , Class B (12/31/2018)	X	X	X									
William Michelson , Class B (12/31/2018)	X	X	X									
Lawrence Quirk , Class A (12/31/2017)	X	X	X									
Gary Schneider , Class C (12/31/2019)	X		X									
Reginald Thomas , Class A (12/31/2018)	X	X	X									
Regular Member #8 VACANT (4 year term)												
Regular Member #9 VACANT (4 year term)												
Alternate Member #1 VACANT (2 year term)												
Alternate Member #2 VACANT (2 year term)												

Also present: HPC Consultant Barton Ross, and HPC Secretary Scott Bauman

Presentation of February 28, 2017, Meeting Minutes

Chairman Michelson announced the February 28, 2017, meeting minutes will be presented at the April 25, 2017, meeting.

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MARCH 28, 2017, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

New Business

1. Announcements from the Chairman

Chairman Michelson announced that the following applications are not going forward tonight:

- A. Certificate of Appropriateness Application HPC 2017-03. 1308 Watchung Avenue. Block 814, Lot 2 Broadway Historic District. Applicant & Property Owner- Steven Jackson
 - Applicant did not serve notice to property owners within 200 feet of 1308 Watchung Avenue

- B. Certificate of Appropriateness Application HPC 2016-17. 777 Belvidere Avenue. Block 904, Lot 10 Netherwood Heights Historic District. Applicant & Property Owner- Dr. Caroline McCagg
 - Applicant agrees to withdraw the application and remove the fence. Commissioner Gurshman made a motion to dismiss the application with prejudice. Vice-Chairman Quirk seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved by voice vote.

- C. Certificate of Appropriateness Application HPC 2017-04. 957 Central Avenue. Block 759, Lot 13 Van Wyck Brooks Historic District. Applicant & Property Owner- Joshwa Money School, LLC
 - Applicant did not serve notice to property owners within 200 feet of 957 Central Avenue

2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application HPC 2017-02

733 Berkeley Avenue. Block 907, Lot 2. Netherwood Heights Historic District

Regina Whitmer- Applicant & Property Owner

Mr. Bauman informed the Commission that the applicant served notice and the Commission has jurisdiction. Ms. Whitmer introduced herself to the Commission and informed them that she proposes to replace rotted wooden carriage-style doors on the detached garage with new steel doors that are automated, lockable, and painted in a color to match the house.

Chairman Michelson asked Ms. Whitmer if the old doors were in place when she took title to the property; Ms. Whitmer said “yes”. When asked how the garage doors would open and close automatically, Ms. Whitmer said the doors would move up and down as opposed to side-to-side. A discussion ensued over the design of the doors- three (3) panels versus two (2) panels, and the size/number of windows above the panels. On the original doors, windows comprised the top third of the door, and on the new doors, the windows are smaller and scaled less than one-third of the door. Chairman Michelson commented that the proposed decorative hardware seems reasonable. Commissioner Favazzo agrees that the proposed window size is too small on the door, but the muntin pattern is fine.

Chairman Michelson opened the meeting to the public; no one commented on the application and Chairman Michelson closed the public portion of the meeting. Vice-Chairman Quirk made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Garrett, to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the replacement of existing wood sliding carriage doors on a two-car garage with two (2) new steel doors; the doors are to have a “carriage look” to look like the original doors, the window muntins as shown are appropriate and the windows shall be as large as possible, as in the original doors. The applicant shall submit a specification sheet to the Architectural Review Committee for approval. The motion passed unanimously.

John Favazzo (YES)	Bill Garrett (YES)	Sandy Gurshman (YES)	William Michelson (YES)
Lawrence Quirk (YES)	Gary Schneider (ABSTAIN)	Reginald Thomas (YES)	

New Business (continued)

3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application HPC 2017-07

800-24 Park Avenue. Block 719, Lot 1 & 2. Plainfield Public Library. Van Wyck Brooks Historic District Applicant & Property Owner- City of Plainfield

Commissioner Gurshman recused herself from the hearing. Tina Marie Doody and Peter Rajcevic of the Plainfield Public Library, 800 Park Avenue, Plainfield, and architect Anthony Iovino of 1 Katherine Street, Little Ferry, introduced themselves to the Commission. Mr. Iovino summarized the scope of work for phase 1 of the project. Phase 1 consists of installing bluestone slabs over the concrete stairs along Park Avenue and turning onto West Ninth Street, and an addition to the air conditioner condenser enclosure facing West Ninth Street.

Chairman Michelson asked Mr. Iovino whether the top panels of the air conditioner condenser enclosure can be leveled. Mr. Iovino said the cost would be eight to ten thousand dollars to install new panels and to extend and raise the existing panels, as they are sunk in concrete. If the new enclosure were leveled down to the existing enclosure then the air intake areas would be enclosed, which is not good for the HVAC system. Mr. Rajcevic said they did a mockup and it makes the enclosure look more monolithic rather than going with the step line. The enclosure dimensions are six (6) feet across, and ten (10) to twelve (12) feet towards the back of the building.

Moving onto the concrete stairs, Mr. Iovino distributed pictures of the stairs showing they are in bad shape; Mr. Iovino passed around a bluestone sample for color. The bluestone will go on all three (3) steps. Commissioner Gary Schneider entered the meeting at 8:10 pm. Commissioner Favazzo asked Mr. Iovino how he intends to handle water and ice jacking and drainage under the bluestone; Mr. Iovino replied that after the bluestone is installed the steps and joints will be sealed. Vice-Chairman Quirk asked if any new handrails are being installed; Mr. Rajcevic replied that hand rubbed bronze aluminum rails will be installed, and they will be similar in design and materials to the railing by the windows. The rails will have a round profile.

Chairman Michelson opened the meeting to the public. Arne Aakre of 915 Madison Avenue asked Mr. Iovino how he intends to spec the bluestone tread sample; Mr. Iovino replied that he will obtain a range of samples. Mr. Aakre said variegated material will be cheaper and the sample Mr. Iovino showed the Commission is an expensive sample, not variegated. Mr. Rajcevic said the library wants full color and not variegated bluestone, and the funding is in place for the work. Chairman Michelson closed the public portion of the meeting.

Vice-Chairman Quirk made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Schneider, to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) permit the installation of bluestone slab on the concrete stairs on the Park Avenue side of the building turning towards West Ninth Street as per the plans titled Phase 1, dated March 17, 2017; no variegated bluestone but the highest quality; 2) install two (2) rounded handrails along the West Ninth Street and Park Avenue sides of the building; railings to match the color of the window frames; and 3) installation of a six (6) foot high by approximately ten (10) to twelve (12) feet long enclosure for mechanical equipment, duplicating the look of the existing enclosure. The motion passed unanimously by voice vote.

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MARCH 28, 2017, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

New Business (continued)

4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application HPC 2017-05

201-09 West Second Street. Block 245, Lot 3. Titsworth-Sutphen House. Local Historic Landmark

Applicant & Property Owner- PNC Bank, NA

Attorney for the applicant Diane Hickey of Riker Danzig (One Speedwell Avenue, Morristown, NJ), Joseph Hanley of PNC Bank (8000 Tinicum Blvd, Philadelphia, PA), and engineer for the applicant Rob Streker of Bohler Engineering (35 Technology Drive, Warren, NJ) introduced themselves to the Commission.

Ms. Hickey informed the Commission that the applicant proposes to subdivide Lots 3, 4, and 5 into two (2) lots, new Lots 3.01 and 3.02. The applicant proposes to construct two (2) remote drive-thru ATMs, parking and related site improvements. All site improvements will be located on new Lot 3.01. New Lot 3.02 will continue to be utilized as a parking lot. The Titsworth-Sutphen House will be located on new Lot 3.02. The applicant proposes to paint the exterior of the Titsworth-Sutphen House.

Chairman Michelson said the PNC Bank building is in the North Avenue Historic District, the parking lots are not in a historic district, the Commission's interest is limited to the Sutphen House as an individually listed historic landmark. Chairman Michelson asked Ms. Hickey if the guardhouse is being removed as part of the proposal; Ms. Hickey responded that the guardhouse is slated for demolition should the project be approved. Chairman Michelson noted that the ATMs are far from the bank building; Ms. Hickey said the bank plans to leave the bank building on Park Avenue and relocate to a smaller space on West Front Street- the PNC Bank employees will park on new Lot 3.01.

Ms. Hickey said there will be sixteen (16) spaces for the Sutphen House and there will be no changes to the house itself. The applicant proposes to repave the parking area and install streetscape improvements along the public right-of-way facing new Lot 3.01. A new fence is proposed to begin at the northeast corner of Lot 3.01 and to wrap around the property perimeter. New Lot 3.02 will continue to function as a parking lot with a new curb cut/driveway apron along West Second Street. Commission consultant Mr. Ross informed the Commission that the Ordinance designated properties, not buildings.

Vice-Chairman Quirk said the ATM proposal makes it more difficult to appreciate the house; he appreciates the streetscape and landscaping but it is all squeezing the house; he would like to see the ATMs moved more to the east and more landscaping around the Sutphen House- give the Sutphen House more breathing room and improve the building beyond paint and shutters. Mr. Streker said locating the ATM farther east cuts off options to develop new Lot 3.02 in the future. Vice-Chairman Quirk reiterated his preference for moving the ATMs further east. Mr. Streker said a ten (10) foot green space next to the Sutphen House could be done.

Ms. Hickey asked and was granted a brief recess to review options with her client. When Ms. Hickey and the applicant returned, Chairman Michelson cited his thoughts on the application thus far:

- 1) The HPC has jurisdiction over the current rear of Lot 3; the Commission has no problem consenting to subdividing the property, but the applicant may want to reconsider changing the subdivision request as it affects the rear of new Lot 3.01;

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MARCH 28, 2017, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

New Business (continued)

- 2) A Certificate of Appropriateness is required for the ATMs, lanes, platform, fencing, and signage;
- 3) Painting the Sutphen House is not in the jurisdiction of the Historic Preservation Commission;
- 4) The Commission may be inclined to go along with moving the ATMS further east;
- 5) Making the lots more marketable/developable is nice but not in the Commission's jurisdiction, if there was a development plan in place, the Commission could help;
- 6) The Commission does not object to the subdivision; however the applicant may wish to change the lot line so the ATMs are not in the Commission's jurisdiction (not on the lot containing the Sutphen House); and
- 7) The Applicant may wish to adjourn its Zoning Board of Adjustment application to May 3, so that this Commission can complete its part of the case on April 25.

A discussion ensued over the potential amount and location of green space that could be added around the Sutphen House while maintaining the proposed location of the ATM machines and drive-thru lanes. Mr. Streker said the drive thru lanes can stack up to eight (8) vehicles. Ms. Hickey asked and was granted a brief recess to review options with her client.

Ms. Hickey returned and said her client can agree to carry the Zoning Board use variance application from April 5 to May 3, and have the Certificate of Appropriateness hearing carried to April 25, but she would like clear recommendations from the Commission. Chairman Michelson summarized the recommendations from the Commission: 1) green space around the house; 2) better if the ATMs are further from the house; 3) the subdivision is not a problem; 4) will need a Certificate of Appropriateness for ATM canopy, drive-thru lanes, pavers, light fixtures, fencing, and signs on Lot 3.01. Vice-Chairman Quirk added that the applicant should look at the house as historic, provide grass on the sides and think how the ATMs architecturally relate to the house and green space. Commissioner Gurshman added that the Commission does not legislate paint colors.

On a motion made by Commissioner Gurshman and seconded by Commissioner Schneider, the Commission voted unanimously to carry the hearing to April 25, 2017. No further notice is required.

5. Adoption of 2016 Certified Local Government (CLG) Annual Report

Commissioner Gurshman made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Garrett, to adopt the 2016 CLG Report and to send a copy to the State Historic Preservation Office. The motion was unanimously approved by voice vote.

6. 852 Terrill Road, Block 921, Lot 15.2- Request to Delist Property as a Local Historic Landmark

Chairman Michelson reported that Corporation Counsel has not yet provided him with a draft Historic Preservation Commission Resolution de-listing 852 Terrill Road from the list of local historic landmarks. When the Resolution is ready, it will be scheduled for the next available meeting.

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MARCH 28, 2017, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

Old Business

1. Historic Preservation Survey for District Expansions

Chairman Michelson reported that the City Purchasing Agent will open the proposals for consulting services on March 30 and the Commission can expect to review the proposals at the April 25 meeting.

Reports

1. Community Outreach Committee

A. Historic Preservation Awards Program

The Commission agreed to work on a program to coordinate with Historic Preservation month in May 2017.

2. Ordinance Review Committee: Chairman Michelson reported no news on updates to the land use ordinance addressing historic preservation.

3. Architectural Review: Mr. Bauman directed the attention of the Commission to their meeting packets where letters approving work not requiring a Certificate of Appropriateness are attached.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Vice-Chairman Quirk made a motion for adjournment, seconded by Commissioner Garrett; all voted in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 9:55 PM

Respectfully submitted,

Scott Bauman

Scott Bauman, AICP, PP

Principal Planner / HPC Secretary, Plainfield Planning Division

Prepared: April 25, 2017

Approved by the Historic Preservation Commission: May 23, 2017