



CITY OF PLAINFIELD
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, ROOM 202
 PLAINFIELD, NEW JERSEY 07060



William H. Michelson, Chairman
Lawrence T. Quirk, Vice-Chairman

Adrian O. Mapp, Mayor

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
DECEMBER 20, 2016, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

Call to Order and Public Notice

Chairman William Michelson called the regular meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:32 P.M. and in conformance with the Open Public Meetings Act read aloud the following: "In compliance with the Open Public Meetings Act, this is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Plainfield. Adequate notice of this meeting has been given in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, the annual meeting schedule was published in the Courier-News on January 30, 2016, and copies of the meeting schedule are posted in the offices of the City Clerk and Planning Division. I ask that everyone including Commission members please turn their cell phones to silence or vibrate and not take or send any electronic messages during this meeting."

Roll Call

2016 Historic Preservation Commission Name, Class Designation (Term Ends)	1/26/16	2/23/16	3/22/16	4/26/16	5/24/16	6/28/16	7/26/16	8/23/16	9/27/16	10/25/16	11/15/16	12/20/16
John Favazzo, Class A (12/31/2017)	X		X	X	X	X	X		X	X		
Bill Garrett, Class B (12/31/2019)		C	X	X	X	X	X	C	X	X	C	X
Sandra Gurshman, Class B (12/31/2018)	X	A	X	X	X	X	X	A	X	X	A	X
Jan Jasper, Class C (12/31/2016)	X	N					X	N		X	N	
Elizabeth King, Class C (12/31/2016)	X	C		X	X	X	X	C	X	X	C	X
William Michelson, Class B (12/31/2018)	X	E	X	X	X	X	X	E	X	X	E	X
Lawrence Quirk Class A (12/31/2017)	X	L	X	X		X	X	L	X	X	L	X
Gary Schneider, Class C (12/31/2019)		L	X	X	X	X	X	L	X	X	L	
Reginald Thomas, Class A (12/31/2018)		E	X		X	X	X	E	X	X	E	X
Alternate Member #1 VACANT (2 year term)		D						D			D	
Alternate Member #2 VACANT (2 year term)												

Also present: HPC Consultant Barton Ross, and HPC Secretary Scott Bauman

Presentation of October 25, 2016, Meeting Minutes

Ms. Gurshman made a motion to approve the October 25, 2016, meeting minutes as presented; Ms. King seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
DECEMBER 20, 2016, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

Historic Preservation Commission Vacancies

Chairman Michelson announced that Commissioner Elizabeth King is seeking reappointment and Commissioner Jan Jasper has decided not to seek reappointment to the Historic Preservation Commission. Ms. Jasper was not present at the meeting; Chairman Michelson thanked Ms. Jasper for her service to the Commission. Chairman Michelson also announced that with Ms. Jasper's departure the Commission now has three vacancies- one regular member and two alternate members. Chairman Michelson is writing a letter to the Mayor asking him to make appointments to the Commission including reappointment of Commissioner King who reported that she had already sent a letter to the Mayor seeking same.

New Business

1. Informal Discussion: 315 Central Avenue. Block 103, Lot 2. Plainfield Fire Division Headquarters Listed on the State & National Register of Historic Places in 1993

Captain Walter Thompson and Lieutenant John Reed of the Plainfield Fire Division, 315 Central Avenue, Plainfield, introduced themselves to the Historic Preservation Commission and informed them that the city received a FEMA grant for a 120 kW generator. The Fire Division is in the design phase and working on developing specifications for the bidding process. There are limited areas where the generator can be located, so the Fire Division is seeking the Commission's comment before the project goes out to bid. . The generator will be about 10' x 4' and 6' high. The proposed location of the generator is the front yard area between the side building elevation and West Fourth Street. Landscaping will be used to screen the generator, and 4-foot high concrete bollards are positioned to protect the generator from damage. The generator cannot be located on the roof of the building due to engineering concerns, or the basement due to FEMA requirements. The generator cannot be located behind the building because of the parking lot. FEMA further requires that the generator be powered by diesel fuel, and the generator is expected to be able operate nonstop for 72 hours.

When asked about security, Lieutenant Reed said fencing is not needed, since the generator will be located directly alongside the building, which has 24-hour staff present. The bollards will surround the generator on all sides and can be painted a black or green to blend in with the landscape screening. HPC Secretary Bauman noted that the plan calls for "trees" to be utilized as screening; the Planning Division will assist the Fire Division with the selection of landscape screening.

Commissioner Garrett asked if the generator could be located at the Signal Division property and wiring could be piped underground to the Fire Headquarters. Lieutenant Reed said they will consider that suggestion but he noted that the generator needs to be self-sustaining, and he was not sure about crossing other utilities and obtaining PSE&G approval. Commissioner Gurshman commented that the main idea is to not impact the façade of the building.

Chairman Michelson opened the meeting to the public; no one from the public commented. Chairman Michelson closed the public portion of the meeting. Chairman Michelson informed Captain Thompson and Lieutenant Reed that the location is OK, the bollards can be painted to blend in with the surroundings, and shrubs will help soften the corner and screen the generator from the public. A Certificate of Appropriateness with public notice is required, and the application fee will be waived. Lieutenant Reed and Captain Thompson thanked the Commission for their time.

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
DECEMBER 20, 2016, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

New Business (continued)

2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application HPC 2016-14

657 Belvidere Avenue. Block 759, Lot 2. Netherwood Heights Historic District

Michael White- Applicant & Owner

HPC Secretary Bauman informed the Commission the applicant noticed properly and the Commission has jurisdiction to hear the application. Mr. Michael White introduced himself as the owner of 657 Belvidere Avenue; Mr. White said he replaced front, rear and side yard fencing; the area visible from the street consists of 20 linear feet of 4' tall x 5/8" thick x 5-1/2" wide pressure-treated pine wood "dog-ear" type fencing in the front yard area between the side of the house and side lot line on both sides. There will be an approximate 3' wide gate to the backyard, across the driveway with hidden hardware and made of the same material and specification.

HPC Secretary Bauman added that while the owner is replacing an existing fence, the existing fence did not receive approval from the Zoning Officer or the Historic Preservation Commission; pictures of the property from 2012 show no fencing visible from the street. The side and rear fences do not require approval by the Commission since they are not visible from the street. Chairman Michelson opened the meeting to the public; no one from the public commented on the proposal and Chairman Michelson closed the hearing to the public. After further discussion, Vice-Chairman Quirk made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to approve the installation of front yard fencing as already installed by the owner. Commissioner King seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.

John Favazzo (ABSENT)	Bill Garrett (YES)	Sandy Gurshman (YES)	Jan Jasper (ABSENT)
Elizabeth King (YES)	William Michelson (YES)	Lawrence Quirk (YES)	Gary Schneider (ABSENT)
Reginald Thomas (YES)			

3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application HPC 2016-15

822 Arlington Avenue. Block 717, Lot 2. Van Wyck Brooks Historic District

Maged Youssef- Applicant. Caroline Youssef- Property Owner

HPC Secretary Bauman informed the Commission that the applicant noticed properly and that the Commission has jurisdiction to hear the application. Ms. Caroline Youssef of 822 Arlington Avenue and Brad Needleman of Needleman Roofing, 88 Meadowbrook Road, North Plainfield, introduced themselves to the Commission.

Mr. Needleman informed the Commission that the proposal is to remove slate shingles on the main roof, remove built-in gutters, and install Certainteed Hatteras asphalt shingles and 5" K-style white aluminum gutters with round corrugated downspouts. Mr. Needleman said the slates are Pennsylvania slate and are in poor condition. The Hatteras shingles are a 50-year shingle; the tongue-and-groove decking beneath the slate shingles are in good condition. Regarding the built-in gutters, Mr. Needleman said they consist of 2x4s on the roof, the owner cannot afford to reline the built-in gutters with copper, and any other liner material such as rubber membrane would need replacement every ten years. There is an \$8,000 price difference between relining the built-in gutters with copper and removing the built-in gutters altogether and installing the 5-inch K-style hanging gutters. There is no fascia board so the gutters will be attached with straps, and new downspouts will be installed on the side elevations.

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
DECEMBER 20, 2016, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

New Business (continued)

Commissioner Thomas commented that removing the gutters eliminated a detail that is important to the house- it will change the shape and it will look different. Mr. Needleman agreed with Commissioner Thomas. Commissioner Thomas suggested using an alternate metal for lining the gutter; Mr. Needleman cited soldering issues with alternate metals. Commissioner Thomas suggested roll roofing and counter flashing. Mr. Ross suggested using galvanized steel; Mr. Needleman said the quality of the galvanized steel is substandard. Vice-Chairman Quirk confirmed with Mr. Needleman that the built-in gutters on the porch roof would remain untouched. Commissioner Gurshman said she would like to see a cross-section drawing showing how the K-style gutter would look. When asked about using half-round gutters, Mr. Needleman said they come in 10 and 20 foot sections and require a great deal of caulking- they are not the best gutters. Chairman Michelson commented that the roof/gutter/fascia is sacrosanct on this building.

When asked about the condition of the wood soffits, Mr. Needleman said they were not in bad condition. Commissioner Thomas suggested the Commission carry the application to January and the applicant return with information on how he plans on installing hanging gutters- what molding is going to be removed, how the gutters will be attached to the house, where the water will flow. Vice-Chairman Quirk added that photographs and diagrams would be helpful. When asked about using roll roofing for lining built-in gutters, Mr. Needleman opined on the poor performance of roll roofing- specifically its inability to offer flexibility while maintaining its durability- he can install it, but it will only last 8 to 10 years. Copper lining will last 60-80 years. Mr. Needleman suggested a copper drip edge with roll roofing; Chairman Michelson asked Mr. Needleman to provide detail and sketches/photographs of similar designs and submit it to Mr. Bauman prior to the January 24 meeting. Vice-Chairman Quirk added he would like to know what he will see from the street and asked for a crosscut drawing of the copper drip edge with roll roofing.

Chairman Michelson opened the meeting to the public; no one from the public commented on the proposal and Chairman Michelson closed the hearing to the public. After further discussion, Commissioner King made a motion to carry the hearing to January 24, 2017. Commissioner Garrett seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.

John Favazzo (ABSENT)	Bill Garrett (YES)	Sandy Gurshman (YES)	Jan Jasper (ABSENT)
Elizabeth King (YES)	William Michelson (YES)	Lawrence Quirk (YES)	Gary Schneider (ABSENT)
Reginald Thomas (YES)			

4. Adoption of 2017 Meeting Calendar

Commissioner Gurshman made a motion to adopt the 2017 meeting calendar as follows: January 24; February 28; March 28; April 25; May 23; June 27; July 25; August 22; September 26; October 24; November 14; December 19; and January 23, 2018. The meetings begin at 7:30 PM at Plainfield City Hall. Vice-Chairman Quirk seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.

John Favazzo (ABSENT)	Bill Garrett (YES)	Sandy Gurshman (YES)	Jan Jasper (ABSENT)
Elizabeth King (YES)	William Michelson (YES)	Lawrence Quirk (YES)	Gary Schneider (ABSENT)
Reginald Thomas (YES)			

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
DECEMBER 20, 2016, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

Old Business

1. Historic Preservation Survey for District Expansions

Chairman Michelson reported that the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) received the paperwork from the National Park Service and the SHPO will reach out to municipalities within a week or two to meet and discuss the details involved with grant management.

2. Cedar Brook Park Artificial Turf Fields

Chairman Michelson shared with the Commission the contents of a November 3, 2016, letter from the NJDEP to Union County concerning conditions of project authorization; the county has a limited time to accept or reject the conditions made by the DEP; if the county does not approve with conditions then the project is denied. Mr. Bauman agreed to follow up with the NJDEP on whether the county approved or rejected the conditions.

3. Cedar Brook Park Pemberton Avenue Culvert Replacement

Chairman Michelson reported that Union County is now proceeding with the replacement of the Pemberton Avenue culvert; the county's consultant contacted HPC Secretary Bauman with elevation plans. Mr. Bauman presented the elevation plans to the Commission and the Commission preferred Elevation C with three (3) ½" vertical rectangular depressed panels on each side of the culvert. The Commission found the proposed arch design as acceptable. Chairman Michelson would like to ask the County to add some detail to these panels, either an emblem or decoration of some kind, or at least an accent color. Mr. Bauman will prepare a letter to the county's consultant for Chairman Michelson's signature.

Reports

- 1. Community Outreach Committee:** The Commission discussed finalists for the 2016 Preservation Award program. The awards ceremony will occur in May 2017, coinciding with Historic Preservation Month.
- 2. Ordinance Review Committee:** Chairman Michelson reported no news on updates to the land use ordinance addressing historic preservation.
- 3. Architectural Review:** Mr. Bauman directed the attention of the Commission to their meeting packets where letters approving work not requiring a Certificate of Appropriateness are attached.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Commissioner Gurshman made a motion for adjournment, seconded by Vice-Chairman Quirk; all voted in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 9:21 PM

Respectfully submitted,

Scott Bauman

Scott Bauman, AICP, PP

Principal Planner / HPC Secretary, Plainfield Planning Division

Prepared: December 27, 2016

Approved by the Historic Preservation Commission: January 24, 2017