



SHARON ROBINSON-BRIGGS
MAYOR

CITY OF PLAINFIELD
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, ROOM 202
PLAINFIELD, NEW JERSEY 07060



Sandra Gurshman, Chairwoman
William Michelson, Vice Chairman

Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Minutes
March 27, 2012, 7:30 PM, City Hall Library, 515 Watchung Avenue, Plainfield, New Jersey

I. Open Public Meeting Statement

Chairwoman Sandy Gurshman called the meeting to order at 7:39 PM and read the following into the record:
"This meeting has been duly advertised in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, 10:4-6 et seq. The annual schedule of board meetings has been published in the Courier-News newspaper. In addition, copies of the notice have been posted in the City Clerk and Planning Division offices. This is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Commission."

Name, Class Designation (Term Duration)	1/24/12	2/28/12	3/27/12	4/24/12	5/22/12	6/26/12	7/24/12	8/28/12	9/18/12	10/23/12	11/27/12	12/18/12
John Favazzo / Class A (5/10/10 - 1/1/14)	X	X	X									
Lawrence Ferrara / Class C (1/18/11 - 1/1/15)	X	X	X									
Sandra Gurshman / Class B (1/18/11 - 1/1/15)	X	X	X									
Patricia Turner Kavanaugh / Class C (1/3/12 - 1/1/16)	X	X	X									
Elizabeth King / Class C (1/12/09 - 1/1/13)	X		X									
William Michelson / Class B (1/18/11 - 1/1/15)	X	X	X									
David Westlake / Class A (1/12/09 - 1/1/13)	X	X	X									
Jan Jasper / Class C, (1/1/09 - 1/1/13) unexpired term	X	X	X									
Bill Garrett / Class B (2/3/12 - 1/1/16)	n/a		X									
Alt. #1 James Galvin / Class A (2/3/12 - 1/1/13) unexpired term	n/a	n/a	X									
Alt #2 VACANT (2 year term 1/1/12 - 1/1/14)	n/a	n/a	n/a									
HPC Consultant Gail Hunton	X	X										
HPC Secretary Scott Bauman	X	X										

II. Adoption of February 28, 2012, Meeting Minutes

Ms. Turner Kavanaugh made a motion to approve the February 28, 2012, meeting minutes as submitted; Vice Chairman Michelson seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously. Commission members King, Galvin, and Garrett abstained from voting.

III. Carried Certificate of Appropriateness Application

1. HPC 10-06; 801-807 Park Avenue / 100-104 Crescent Avenue; Block 828, Lot 1

Crescent Area Historic District; Applicant & Owner: Lamont Gibson

The Historic Preservation Commission has carried this application since April 2011; the only portion of the Certificate of Appropriateness application which remains unaddressed is the proposed wood cornice repair. The Applicant / Owner informed HPC Secretary Bauman that he would not be able to attend the March 27 meeting and requested that the application be carried to April 24.

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public. No one from the public commented on the application. Chairwoman Gurshman closed the public session of the meeting.

After further discussion, Vice Chairman Michelson made a motion to carry the application to April 24, 2012; Ms. King seconded the motion and there was no further discussion. The Commission voted unanimously to carry HPC 10-06 to the April 24, 2012, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission; no further notice is required.

2. HPC 11-08; 543-573 West Eighth Street; Block 761, Lot 1; Van Wyck Brooks Historic District
Applicant: Phyllis Novello & Cena Glaser; Owner: Phyllis Novello

The Historic Preservation Commission has carried this application since October 2011. The Applicant is proposing to install new wood or metal grids (charcoal grey color) to be placed on the outside of vinyl / twin casement windows in the sun room of the Van Wyck Brooks House facing Plainfield Avenue.

HPC Secretary Bauman informed the Commission that tonight at 7:15 PM- fifteen minutes prior to the meeting- the Applicant's architect Roger Winkle hand delivered a letter dated March 27, 2012, to Mr. Bauman and asked that it be distributed to the Commission. Neither the Applicant nor the Applicant's architect was present at the hearing. The Commission discussed the merits of Mr. Winkle's letter and the options of the Commission- carry the application to April 24, deny the application, dismiss the application with prejudice, or approve the application.

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the hearing to the public for comment. Brian Munroe of 313 Franklin Place informed the Commission that ornamental wrought iron window bars are being removed from the left side elevation of the house; Mr. Munroe felt that this action is a sign that the Applicant proposes to replace the windows that are now accessible thanks to the removal of the wrought iron bars. The Commission asked Mr. Bauman to follow through with the Zoning Officer to ensure that the property owner receives a violation notice for removing the window bars.

With regards to the wrought iron window bars, Dottie Gutenkauf of 414 Randolph Road told the Commission that strong action needs to be taken; she suggested a strongly worded letter to the Inspections Division and copying that letter to Public Works Director Eric Jackson. April Stefel of 935 Madison Avenue stressed the importance of enforcement and fining property owners who do not follow the land use ordinance. Gerry Heydt of 915 Madison Avenue suggested that the Commission could carry the application to April 24 and ask the Applicant to appear with her contractor.

The Commission further discussed Mr. Winkle's March 27 letter and compared the cost estimates attached to the letter. Larry Quirk of 967 Madison Avenue said the Commission's historic consultant Gail Hunton was supposed to talk to the Plainfield Planning Board attorney Michele Donato about her legal opinion about the application. Ms. Hunton said that Ms. Donato explained to her the options of denying versus dismissing without prejudice. Mr. Favazzo said that it appears from Mr. Winkle's letter that the Applicant actually pursued and acquired bids for the work that would be compliant with our Guidelines.

Chairwoman Gurshman closed the public portion of the meeting. Vice Chairman Michelson made a motion to deny the application without prejudice to a new application that does not have vinyl windows. Ms. Turner Kavanaugh seconded the motion. Ms. Jasper asked if this meant the Applicant would have to re-notice; Vice Chairman Michelson said yes, a new application would require a new notice. Mr. Galvin cited the Design Guidelines, section on windows and read it aloud to the Commission. Vice Chairman Michelson withdrew his original motion and Ms. Turner Kavanaugh withdrew her second on Vice Chairman Michelson's original motion.

Arne Aakre of 915 Madison asked Chairwoman Gurshman if he could speak; Chairwoman Gurshman told Mr. Aakre he could proceed. Mr. Aakre cited concern about proportions and sizing- he would like shop / design drawings should the Commission approve the application. Mr. Galvin said if the Commission approves, there will be a condition to include shop drawings. Mr. Aakre expressed confidence that a design professional can prepare shop drawings for this application.

Ms. Hunton read aloud the City's Design Guidelines concerning replacement windows: "*retain and repair window frames, sash, decorative glass panes, sills, heads, hoodmolds, and moldings. New or replacement windows on historic buildings must be appropriate to the period and style of the building, duplicating the material and design of the older feature. Replacement sash of wooden windows must be wooden.*"

After further discussion, Ms. Turner Kavanaugh made a motion to deny HPC 11-08 based on the proposal does not match the design guidelines- wood for wood repair, and repairing the leaded glass windows rather than replacing them. Ms. King seconded the motion. Mr. Bauman conducted a roll call vote and the motion was approved 7 in favor, two abstentions- Ms. Jasper, and Mr. Favazzo. Mr. Galvin did not vote because he is an alternate member.

Ms. King left the meeting at 9:15 PM.

IV. New Certificate of Appropriateness Application

1. HPC 12-04; 701-703 Ravine Road; Block 908, Lot 13; Netherwood Heights Historic District

Applicant & Owner: Izabella Miyagawa

Applicant / Owner has served notice for March 27, but later discovered a scheduling conflict. The Applicant / Owner requested that the Historic Preservation Commission provide comment on the proposal and carry the application to April 24, 2012. Commission members asked Mr. Bauman to communicate to the Applicant/Owner the following: 1) how will the railing attach to the roof, 2) since the roof will be a walk-out roof, what weathering surface is being applied to the roof, 3) how will the posts be flashed, 4) would the Applicant / Owner consider adjusting the spacing / sizing of the proposed balustrades, and 5) will there be an awning for the balcony.

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public. Jim Spear of 609 Belvidere Avenue said he was familiar with the project and that the Applicant / Owner would apply a membrane to the roof so it can serve as a functioning balcony. Mr. Westlake and Mr. Spear had a brief discussion over the different types of weathering surface for roofs. Hearing no further comments, Chairwoman Gurshman closed the public portion of the meeting. Ms. Turner Kavanaugh proposed that application HPC 12-04 be carried to the April 24, 2012 meeting. Vice Chairman Michelson seconded the motion. There was no further discussion and the Commission voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

V. New Business

1. Ms. Turner Kavanaugh informed the Commission of a March 24, 2012, New York Times article of a historic home in Staten Island. Ms. Turner Kavanaugh also informed the Commission that on March 13, the duCret School at 1030 Central Avenue received landmark status on the New Jersey State Register of Historic Places.
2. Mr. Galvin informed the Commission that New Jersey Transit will be replacing the railroad bridges directly to the east and west of the Plainfield Train Station.

VI. Unfinished Business

1. Revisions to Certificate of Compliance to Reflect Historic District / Landmark Status: carried to 4/24/12.

VII. Staff Report

1. Properties in Historic Districts / Historic Sites with Code / Maintenance Violations. Mr. Bauman provided the HPC with an update on each of the properties listed: 810 Central Avenue, 957 Central Avenue, 200 East Ninth Street, 307 Franklin Place, 340 Franklin Place, 900 Madison Avenue, 117 North Avenue, 187 North Avenue, 715 Ravine Road, 850 Terrill Road, 811 Third Place, 512 Watchung Avenue, and 563 West Eighth Street.
2. 2012 Grant Rounds: Certified Local Government & NJ Historic Trust. The Commission discussed the grant and decided that there was not enough time to assemble a minimum \$9,000 grant application by May 1. Certified Local Governments were advised of this grant on February 9 and the application deadline is May 1. Mr. Bauman volunteered to prepare a draft letter to the State Historic Preservation Office that acknowledges receipt of the grant application, and communicates our situation that makes applying for funds in 2012 not feasible.

VIII. Adjournment

There being no further business, Ms. Turner Kavanaugh made a motion for adjournment, seconded by Mr. Westlake, all voted in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 10:11 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Scott Bauman

Scott Bauman, AICP, PP
Principal Planner / HPC Secretary
Plainfield Planning Division
Prepared: April 16, 2012
HPC Approved: April 24, 2012