

Minutes of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting
January 26, 2010, 8:00 PM, City Hall Library, 1st Floor, 515 Watchung Avenue, Plainfield, NJ

I. Open Public Meeting Statement

Planning Director William Nierstedt called the January 26, 2010 regularly scheduled meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 8:03 PM and read the following into the record: *"This meeting has been duly advertised in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, 10:4-6 et seq. The annual schedule of board meetings has been published in the Courier-News newspaper. In addition, copies of the notice have been posted in the City Clerk and Planning Division offices. This is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Commission."*

Name, Class Designation (term expires)	1/26/10	2/23/10	3/23/10	4/27/10	5/25/10	6/22/10	7/27/10	8/24/10	9/28/10	10/26/10	11/16/10	12/14/10
Chairwoman Sandra Gurshman / Class B (12/31/2010)	X											
William Michelson, Esq. / Class B (12/31/2010)	X											
Patricia Turner Kavanaugh / Class C (12/31/2011)	X											
Elizabeth King / Class C (12/31/2012)												
Vice Chairman Reginald Thomas, RA / Class A (12/31/2012)												
David Westlake, RA / Class A (12/31/2012)	X											
Bill Garrett / Class B (12/31/2012)	X											
Regular Member #8 vacancy / Class Designation (12/31/2010)												
Regular Member #9 vacancy / Class Designation, (expiration?)												
Alternate #1 Jan Jasper / Class C (12/31/2010)	X											
Alternate #2 vacancy / Class Designation (unexp. 12/31/2010)												
HPC Consultant Gail Hunton	X											
HPC Secretary Scott Bauman, PP/AICP												

Annual Reorganization of the Historic Preservation Commission

1. Nomination and Election of Chairperson: Ms. Turner Kavanaugh made a motion to nominate Sandra Gurshman as Chairwoman for 2010 including the January 25, 2011 reorganization meeting. Mr. Michelson seconded the motion; all voted in favor, none opposed.

Planning Director Nierstedt turned the meeting over to Sandra Gurshman who thanked everyone for their confidence and called for nominations for the election of a vice chairperson.

2. Nomination and Election of Vice-Chairperson: Ms. Turner Kavanaugh made a motion to nominate Reginald Thomas as Vice Chairman for 2009 including the January 26, 2010 reorganization meeting. Mr. Michelson seconded the motion; all voted in favor, none opposed.
3. Appointment of Historic Preservation Consultant: Sandra Gurshman informed the HPC that Ms. Hunton is hired as the HPC consultant through June 30, 2010 and there is no reason to act on this appointment at this time.
4. Appointment of Historic Preservation Commission Secretary: Ms. Turner Kavanaugh made a motion to appoint Scott Bauman as the HPC Secretary for 2010 including the January 25, 2011 reorganization meeting with fees of \$25 per hour, \$100.00 per meeting, not to exceed \$1,200.00 unless authorized by resolution. Mr. Westlake seconded the motion; all voted in favor, none opposed.

Chairwoman Gurshman stated for the record that Jan Jasper had arrived and read the next two resolutions into the record. She asked for a single motion to adopt both. Pat Turner Kavanaugh made a motion to adopt both resolutions; Bill Garrett seconded. And one voice vote was taken on both resolutions.

5. Designation of Official Newspaper: By majority voice vote, the HPC unanimously passed a resolution designating the Courier News as the official newspaper of the Plainfield HPC for the publication of official notices and as the official newspaper to receive notices for the purpose of the Open Public Meetings Act.
6. Adoption of Procedures, Forms, and By Laws of the HPC: By majority voice vote, the HPC unanimously passed a resolution adopting the procedures, forms, and by-laws of the Plainfield HPC for 2008 as cited in the land use ordinance adopted by City Council December 2, 2002.

II Adoption of the November 17, 2009 Regular Meeting Minutes

On motion made by Pat Turner Kavanaugh and seconded by Bill Michelson, the HPC unanimously adopted the 11/17/09 meeting minutes as amended with corrections made by HPC members and duly noted by Mr. Nierstedt.

Adoption of the December 15, 2009 Regular Meeting Minutes

On motion made by Bill Michelson and seconded by Pat Turner Kavanaugh, the HPC unanimously adopted the 12/15/09 meeting minutes as amended with corrections made by HPC members and duly noted by Mr. Nierstedt.

III. New Certificate of Appropriateness Applications

HPC 09-23: 926-928 Putnam Avenue; Block 642, Lot 4; Putnam Watchung Historic District

Applicant: Ultimate Investments, LLC / Owner: Dwayne Wiggins of KIJ Contracting

The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to repair the existing stucco exterior, install new hanging gutters, construct a new front porch consisting of roof, posts, railing, stairs, and lattice, install a new front door with side lite and transom, install new basement windows, and repair slate sidewalks.

Dwayne Wiggins from KIJ Contracting, PO Box 5446, Somerset NJ 08875 testified on behalf of the applicant. He advised that Ultimate Investment LLC, in Parsippany, purchased the property about a month ago. He stated that has been working closely with Mr. Bauman to submit the application. They are proposing to restoring the wood porch, front façade stucco, leaders and gutters, and repairing the slate sidewalk, in addition to interior electric and building work. They are basically undertaking a complete rehabilitation. The structure will be converted from a four family to a three family dwelling, with one unit on each floor.

Mr. Michelson asked Mr. Nierstedt if the conversion would require the applicant to submit an application to the Zoning Board of Adjustment. Mr. Nierstedt advised that the applicant would not have to go to the Zoning Board.

The applicant will reduce the number of meters from 5 to 4. Four meters are still needed for three units, as there will also be a house meter. He advised that he and his wife worked very closely with Mr. Bauman who made a complex process seem very easy. Ms. Gurshman asked that that complement be passed on to Mr. Bauman.

The applicant advised that they will be installing hanging gutters. Ms. Gurshman asked that the straps be located beneath the shingles, and not above. Mr. Wiggins agreed. In response to further questioning by Ms. Hunton and Ms. Gurshman, the applicant advised that a previous contractor had repaired the existing Yankee Gutters, and roof including lining the gutters with aluminum and they are in working order. The applicant stated that he would retain the Yankee Gutters. He will remove the cinder block that is being utilized for the porch and replace with wood to match the original porch and others in the neighborhood.

He advised that a previous contractor installed vinyl clad windows on the entire structure without permits. The applicant will be installing unclad wood frame windows in the basement. Upon questioning by Mr. Michelson, Mr. Wiggins advised that the contractor probably installed the windows in 2007-08.

Mr. Gurshman asked about the details on the porch steps. Mr. Wiggins advised that installing bull nosed steps would not be a problem. Mr. Westlake asked about the wood decking and framing and advised that the proposed framing would have to be reversed from the submitted plans— the framing would have to run side to side, and the decking would have to be installed perpendicular to the structure. The applicant will be using 5/4 tongue and groove wood decking, not 'back yard' decking and Ms. Hunton advised him to contact the lumberyard and utilize

only wood that can be painted; wolmanized would should not be used. Ms. Hunton advised that this would be placed as a condition in the approval certificate.

Mr. Garrett asked about the fire escape and Mr. Wiggins advised that he will be reconstructing the fire escape to meet the new fire codes. The existing fire escape has been removed and new fire escape will be installed in the same location as the old in the rear of the dwelling on the left side of the dwelling. It will come out of the third floor kitchen window to a platform, then down to a second floor platform and a ladder will drop to the ground.

Mr. Wiggins asked about the chimney; he is proposing to demolish the interior chimney and install a new chimney on the outside, and he asked the Commission what they would prefer. After some discussion, the commission agreed that they would prefer replacement in-kind of the interior chimney rather than construction of a new exterior one. Mr. Wiggins advised that the existing chimney and flue are not sound. Mr. Wiggins will be constructing a new box through the roof, with the pipes on the inside, and then a box on the roof with stucco around it to match the previous one. Mr. Wiggins further advised that he will re-stucco where needed, principally on the right side of the structure. Ms. Hunton advised that she would place a condition in the approval certificate stating that the applicant is to use a real stucco mixture, not cement.

Mr. Wiggins will also replace the front door; he will include a side light and a transom over the door, which will be a 36" opening.

Mr. Wiggins also discussed the slate sidewalk work and he advised that he had discussed shaving the roots of the tree, not cutting them. He advised that he had discussed the matter with 'April' who advised that he might be able to get slate from the city Department of Public Works.

Ms. Gurshman opened the meeting to the public; hearing no response, she closed the public portion of the meeting. She then asked for a motion on the application. On a motion by Mr. Michelson, and seconded by Pat Turner Kavanaugh, the commission voted unanimously (6): Gurshman, Michelson, Kavanaugh, Westlake, Garrett and Jasper; Negative (0); Abstention (0) to approve the application subject to conditions regarding the front porch decking and steps, new chimney location and stucco box, elimination of one meter, restoration of Yankee gutters, and installation of hanging gutters under roof shingles.

Chairwoman Gurshman thanked the applicant and said she looked forward to his restoration of this house

V. New Business

1. 2008 & 2009 Year End Reports for the Historic Preservation Commission

Chairwoman Gurshman advised that this report will be discussed in February when Mr. Bauman returns.

2. Resolution Commemorating the Life of William Hetfield

On a motion by Bill Michelson and seconded by Pat Turner Kavanaugh, the commission voted unanimously to adopt the wording of the resolution commemorating Plainfield resident Bill Hetfield.

VI. Old Business

1. **PSE&G Solar 4 All Program: PSE&G Responses to Historic Preservation Commission Inquiries**

Chairwoman Gurshman updated the commission members on e-mail responses she has received from Eileen Leahey at PSE&G. She advised that regarding the tree trimming, if there is too much shade on an existing pole, PSE&G will not install the solar panel, they will not trim the tree in order to place a panel. Ms. Gurshman further asked that if anyone else has any questions for PSE&G, they forward them to her and she would forward them to PSE&G for a response. David Westlake questioned the ownership of heights on the panels. He said that communication wires are low, and electric wires are higher; he questioned how PSE&G is able to locate the panels as low on the poles as they are locating them. Bill Michelson asked about visual clutter the panels are creating and if the power generation behind the panels is sound; if the panels are actually creating any electricity yet, and if the electric generated is worth the investment.

2. **Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Website**

Jan Jasper advised the members that she has selected the web-master, and is currently selecting documents to be placed on the site, as well as the font and style. She asked Ms. Hunton to forward her pictures that had been taken

for the recently adopted guidelines and master plan. A discussion ensued about the technologically most efficient way to obtain and place the pictures. She also inquired as to whether one would need permission from the homeowners to place pictures of their structures on the site. Bill Michelson advised that they probably would; she was encouraged to use pictures of public places/structures such as city hall, in addition to churches, commercial properties and district signs. Chairwoman Gurshman advised using the city logo. She also asked Planning Director Nierstedt to place the Commission 2010 calendar on the city web site. It is anticipated that the city will provide the link from the city web site. The commission members only want their names, not phone numbers or addresses- on the web site. They also encouraged the placement of the Planning Board and Zoning Board of Adjustment agendas/minutes on the city web-site. Gail Hunton advised her to check with the web-master as to the best format. Chairwoman Gurshman advised Ms. Jasper to check the Plainfield library for additional pictures.

3. Historic Designated Properties with Code / Maintenance Violations

Chairwoman Gurshman advised that the commission would discuss the violations when Mr. Bauman returns next month.

VII. Staff Report

1. Survey of 413 Properties for Proposed Historic District

Ms. Hunton advised that she is working on completing the summary table of the survey area by street. She hopes to have it completed by the February meeting.

2. Design Guidelines for Historic Districts and Sites

Ms. Hunton advised that the City Council has adopted the Design Guidelines for Historic Districts and Sites.

VII. Open Public Session

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting for public discussion:

Joyce Phipps of 1200 Myrtle Avenue, a property in the area under review for historic designation status, asked what the commission saw as the defining characteristic of the area under review, and what sets this area apart from other areas of the city. Ms. Hunton advised that she would compare the subject area in terms of diversity to the Van Wyck Brooks District as it has the complete history of housing in the city within its borders, from the turnoff the 20th century through the 1920s and 1930s, through World War II. The area exemplifies the complete range of housing in Plainfield's 'boom era' of 1875-1930.

Robert Henning of 1351 Chetwynd Street asked if the commission will have a session where residents will be invited to a discussion of the study area. Chairwoman Gurshman advised that once the commission determines what makes sense to place in a district, and what does not, then the commission will schedule a meeting with residents. Ms Hunton explained that the city land use ordinance has defined criteria explaining when a change on a structure requires the obtaining of a Certificate of Appropriateness, and that there must be a material change that it is visible from street. She encouraged Mr. Henning to contact Mr. Bauman and review the Guidelines for Historic structures and Sites.

IX Adjournment

There being no further business, Pat Turner Kavanaugh made a motion for adjournment, and seconded by Bill Garrett the commission voted all in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 9:38 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Bill Nierstedt for".

Bill Nierstedt, AICP, PP, Director of Planning
February 13, 2010

Minutes of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting
March 23, 2010, 8:00 PM, City Hall Library, 1st Floor, 515 Watchung Avenue, Plainfield, NJ

I. Open Public Meeting Statement

Chairwoman Sandy Gurshman called the March 23, 2010 regularly scheduled meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:36 PM and read the following into the record: *"This meeting has been duly advertised in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, 10:4-6 et seq. The annual schedule of board meetings has been published in the Courier-News newspaper. In addition, copies of the notice have been posted in the City Clerk and Planning Division offices. This is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Commission."*

Name, Class Designation (term expires)	1/26/10	3/23/10	4/27/10	5/25/10	6/22/10	7/27/10	8/24/10	9/28/10	10/26/10	11/16/10	12/14/10
Chairwoman Sandra Gurshman / Class B (12/31/2010)	X	X									
William Michelson, Esq. / Class B (12/31/2010)	X	X									
Patricia Turner Kavanaugh / Class C (12/31/2011)	X	X									
Elizabeth King / Class C (12/31/2012)		X									
Vice Chairman Reginald Thomas, RA / Class A (12/31/2012)		X									
David Westlake, RA / Class A (12/31/2012)	X	X									
Bill Garrett / Class B (12/31/2012)	X	X									
Regular Member #8 vacancy / Class Designation (12/31/2010)											
Regular Member #9 vacancy / Class Designation, (expiration?)											
Alternate #1 Jan Jasper / Class C (12/31/2010)	X	X									
Alternate #2 vacancy / Class Designation (unexp. 12/31/2010)											
HPC Consultant Gail Hunton	X	X									
HPC Secretary Scott Bauman, PP/AICP		X									

II Adoption of the January 26, 2010, Regular Meeting Minutes

On motion made by Mr. Michelson and seconded by Ms. Kavanaugh, the HPC unanimously adopted the January 26, 2010, meeting minutes as amended with corrections made by HPC members and duly noted by Mr. Bauman. Chairwoman Gurshman wanted the record to reflect that the February 23, 2010, meeting was cancelled due to a lack of a meeting quorum- there were no Certificate of Appropriateness applications pending.

III. Request for Extension of a Previously Approved Certificate of Appropriateness

HPC 05-03: 747 Dixie Lane; Block 908, Lot 6; Netherwood Heights Historic District

On May 5, 2005, the Historic Preservation Commission issued a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following work: replacement of two existing bay windows with 90 degree box bay casement windows, extension of asphalt shingle roofline over new box bay windows, installation of planter boxes under the new box bay windows, installation of planter boxes on the second floor balcony rails, installation of copper half-round gutters and round leaders along the first floor roofline, installation of full view screen/storm wood door at the front entrance, erect a wood arbor, install wrought iron hand rails at the front entrance in front of the arbor along the front porch steps.

The Applicant has requested an extension of the approval that expired on June 5, 2007. Mr. Bauman informed those present that pursuant to §17:10-7.H. of the Land Use Ordinance, a Certificate of Appropriateness is valid for a period of 2 years from date of issue unless reasonable extensions are granted by the Commission. After reviewing the conditions of the previous approval and learning that the Applicant does not intend to make any changes, the HPC was comfortable granting the extension under the condition that their action is agreed upon by the Commission's legal counsel. Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public; hearing no response, she closed the public portion of the meeting. Chairwoman Gurshman asked for a motion on the application; on a motion by Mr. Michelson, and seconded by Ms. Kavanaugh, the Commission voted unanimously to grant the Applicant a two year extension with the condition that their action is agreed upon by the Commission's legal counsel.

IV. New Business

1. 2008 & 2009 Year End Reports for the Historic Preservation Commission

Members of the Commission reviewed the report; Ms. King asked to add an additional column totaling the number of each activity. Commission members were pleased with the report- it lets the public know what kind of work the HPC approves. Commission members agreed that the reports should be forwarded to the City Council and Planning Board. Chairwoman Gurshman asked for a motion to approve the 2008 and 2009 HPC Year End Reports; on a motion by Ms. King, and seconded by Mr. Michelson, the Commission voted unanimously to accept the reports with the amendments suggested by Ms. King and to forward the amended report to the City council and to the Planning Board.

2. Welcome David G. Brown, II- Director of Dept. of Public Works & Urban Development

Mr. Brown introduced himself to the Commission and apologized because he had to leave due to an emergency situation on North Avenue.

V. Staff Report

1. Survey of 413 Properties for Proposed Historic District

Ms. Hunton presented to the HPC and public in attendance a map showing the study area. Ms. Hunton provided those present with a Streetscape Summary for each street included in the study area. In alphabetical order Ms. Hunton and the HPC discussed the following:

- a) Brook Lane: Strong street. Ms. Hunton pointed out the Webster-Martine house as being the most historically significant residence left in Plainfield.
- b) Cedar Brook Road: Strong street, same as Brook Lane.
- c) Chetwynd Avenue: Medium/weak street. Look at the abutting streets: 1920s, 30s, 40s. Vinyl on some structures, starting to see inappropriate additions and repairs.
- d) Edgewood Avenue: Strong street. Connector street containing 1920s colonial revival. Many structures still have wood siding and are in good shape.
- e) Evergreen Avenue: Strong street. Six of 45 contributing homes have vinyl siding.
- f) Highland Avenue: Strong street.
- g) Hillside Avenue (from Hillside Avenue Historic District line to Marlborough Avenue): "Maybe".
- h) Kensington Avenue (from Watchung Avenue to Thornton Avenue): Strong street. Contains two late 19th century houses.
- i) Lake Street: Not strong- smaller houses, great loss in historic character.
- j) Marlborough Avenue: Not strong- replacement siding on at least 8 of 19 structures. Gail only looked at the north side of the street but has now agreed to quickly assess the south side of the street.
- k) Martine Avenue: Medium strength street- starting to see the impact of inappropriate changes (siding, windows, etc).
- l) Park Avenue (from Prospect Avenue to Thornton Avenue): Not strong- should have never been surveyed. Structures altered dramatically.
- m) Pine Street: Not strong.
- n) Prospect Avenue: Strong street- the 1878 Plainfield map shows houses being built. Many architectural styles are shown on Prospect Avenue. There are some problems with bad alterations.
- o) Thornton Avenue: Medium strength street- many of the structures have been diminished by additions and repairs.
- p) Spring Street: Not strong.
- q) Watchung Avenue (1066-1018): Not strong
- r) Woodland Avenue (from Watchung Avenue to Marlborough Avenue, both sides): west side (between Prospect and Watchung- yes, east side is medium strength to not strong.

"After her street by street summary, Ms. Hunton told the HPC that the designation process requires HPC, Planning Board and City Council approval, in that order; if people who want to object can do it by petition, letter, or orally at a hearing, or any combination thereof, and we would have to keep a list. Ms. Hunton recommended the HPC consider Brook Lane, Cedar Brook Road, Prospect Avenue, and other roads- possibly add these properties to the already existing Putnam Watchung Historic District. Ms. Hunton explained that the Hillside

Historic District cuts in the middle of the study area and there are really two different districts unless the Hillside Historic District agrees to expand. Ms. Hunton recommended that HPC members be given a copy of the map of the study area and the streetscape summary, and conduct their own walking / driving tour to see the area for themselves.

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public. Carol Bicket of 1083 Hillside Avenue wanted to know where her property was located on the map. Ms. Hunton showed Ms. Bicket the location of her property; Ms. Bicket was satisfied with Ms. Hunton's answer. Joyce Phipps of 1200 Martine Avenue asked if there is a list of individual addresses. Ms. Hunton responded that there is and it is on her PC at home. Ms. Phipps asked about a potential timeline for the project. Ms. Hunton said that the HPC will now look at the survey area and a similar discussion will occur possibly at the next meeting in April; there is no specific time table. There is the possibility that HPC members will reach out to other historic districts as well. Ms. Phipps asked if the properties in a newly created historic district are accepted in "as is" condition; Ms. Hunton responded that the properties are accepted into the newly created district "as is". Ms. Phipps asked if paint colors are regulated; Ms. Hunton responded that paint color is not regulated.

2. NJ Historic Tax Credit Bill Reintroduced in 2010 Legislature

The Historic Property Revitalization Act (S659/ A1851) has been reintroduced by Sen. Barbara Buono and Assemblyman Reed Gusciora. Mr. Bauman provided HPC members with the text of the Senate Bill. The bill would provide credits against certain taxes for certain costs of rehabilitating historic properties. The HPC has supported this bill in the past and reiterated their support for the bill for this legislative session. Mr. Bauman agreed to prepare a draft letter of support to go out to our state representatives.

VI. Old Business

1. Historic Designated Properties with Code / Maintenance Violations

The HPC specifically discussed the Lampkin House on Terrill Road. Mr. Bauman gave the HPC an update on the foreclosure situation, the violation notices issued by the City (court date April 16), and potential grant opportunities to save the structure.

VII. Adjournment

There being no further business, Pat Turner Kavanaugh made a motion for adjournment, and seconded by Bill Michelson the commission voted all in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 9:55 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,



Scott Bauman, AICP, PP
Principal Planner / HPC Secretary
Plainfield Planning Division
April 13, 2010

**Minutes of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting
April 27, 2010, 8:00 PM, City Hall Library, 1st Floor, 515 Watchung Avenue, Plainfield, NJ**

I. Open Public Meeting Statement

Chairwoman Sandy Gurshman called the April 27, 2010, regularly scheduled meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:43 PM and read the following into the record: *"This meeting has been duly advertised in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, 10:4-6 et seq. The annual schedule of board meetings has been published in the Courier-News newspaper. In addition, copies of the notice have been posted in the City Clerk and Planning Division offices. This is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Commission."*

Name, Class Designation (term expires)	1/26/10	3/23/10	4/27/10	5/25/10	6/22/10	7/27/10	8/24/10	9/28/10	10/26/10	11/16/10	12/14/10
Chairwoman Sandra Gurshman / Class B (12/31/2010)	X	X	X								
William Michelson, Esq. / Class B (12/31/2010)	X	X									
Patricia Turner Kavanaugh / Class C (12/31/2011)	X	X	X								
Elizabeth King / Class C (12/31/2012)		X	X								
Vice Chairman Reginald Thomas, RA / Class A (12/31/2012)		X	X								
David Westlake, RA / Class A (12/31/2012)	X	X	X								
Bill Garrett / Class B (12/31/2012)	X	X	X								
Regular Member #8 vacancy / Class Designation (12/31/2010)											
Regular Member #9 vacancy / Class Designation. (expiration?)											
Alternate #1 Jan Jasper / Class C (12/31/2010)	X	X	X								
Alternate #2 vacancy / Class Designation (unexp. 12/31/2010)											
HPC Consultant Gail Hunton	X	X	X								
HPC Secretary Scott Bauman, PP/AICP		X	X								

II Adoption of the March 23, 2010, Regular Meeting Minutes

On motion made by Ms. Kavanaugh and seconded by Ms. King, the HPC unanimously adopted the March 23, 2010, meeting minutes; all voted in favor, none opposed.

III. New Certificate of Appropriateness Applications

1. HPC 10-02: 714-720 Park Avenue; Block 713, Lot 3; Van Wyck Brooks Historic District

Applicant: Historic Building Architects, LLC / Owner: First Unitarian Society of Plainfield

Mr. Bauman informed the HPC that the Applicant has served notice and the HPC has jurisdiction over the application. Annabelle Trenner, AIA of Historic Building Architects, LLC (312 West State Street, Trenton, NJ) has the owner's permission represent them for the hearing. Ms. Trenner described the scope of work which includes: restoration of stone walls and steps at the North Porch entrance based on historic photographs as reference, replacing the sidewalk to parking lot using stampcrete concrete pressed to imitate slate, removing the contemporary concrete patio and retaining walls and restoring the wood porch at the Parish Hall entrance using historic photographs as reference. The proposed work also includes the installation of a barrier free access lift entrance door adjacent to the barrier free parking space at the Parish Hall, restoring a large stained glass window facing Park Avenue, raking out and re-pointing the church Park Avenue elevation, including both towers, and installing a new slate roof and flat pan metal roof on Parish Hall.

Ms. Trenner asked the HPC to turn to Drawing A-401 of the plan and she explained the proposed work to the east elevation of the sanctuary including repairing and restoring wood trim, restoring all sides of the masonry towers, infilling new brownstone, and rake/re-pointing all masonry joints.

Ms. Trenner asked the HPC to turn to Drawing A-402 of the plan and she explained the proposed work to the north elevation of the sanctuary including removing a planter and terrace, and cleaning the stone wall concealed behind the terrace.

Ms. Trenner discussed the proposed drainage improvements to the property, slate shingle roof replacement, and restoration of the stain glass window. The plexiglass storm window will be removed from the stain glass window.

Chairwoman Gurshman commented that there is a lot to absorb. Mr. Westlake asked if the walls in the new terrace are splayed; Ms. Trenner said they are but will be straightened. Mr. Thomas and Ms. Trenner engaged in a discussion over the comparative costs of Worthington fiberglass columns versus wood columns. Mr. Westlake asked for more detail on sheet A-406 that calls for the installation of a brickface at the side of the stairs. Ms. Trenner said they are putting back used brick. Mr. Westlake is concerned about the texture of the brick, i.e.: face brick versus common brick.

Mr. Westlake directed Ms. Trenner's attention to Drawings A-410, and A-411 "east porch plans", and east porch elevation section and details". Mr. Westlake asked if the guard rail was high enough; Ms. Trenner replied that they are high enough, she believe it was checked. Mr. Westlake commented that the height of the porch is 30 inches above grade and the height of the guard rail should be re-checked. Mr. West lake commented that the handrails on the east porch need to have a return- the rail should be returned to the newel post rather than turned down. Ms. Trenner said they are supposed to be returned to the post and will correct this error on Drawing A-411. Mr. Westlake said he would like to see the Simpson base eliminated; the way it is shown on the plans is inappropriate and not attractive and is more akin to the way a deck is constructed. If newel post is moved back to the bottom riser it can be tied in and stabilized there.

Chairwoman Gurshman asked about the terrace demolition plan on Drawing A-402 and if the flexible drainage pipe will be removed once the work is complete. Ms. Trenner said that the flexible pipe will be placed under grade and will not be seen. Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public; hearing no response, she closed the public portion of the meeting. Chairwoman Gurshman asked for a motion on the application; on a motion by Ms. Kavanaugh, and seconded by Mr. Garrett, the Commission voted unanimously to approve the application as submitted.

2. HPC 10-03: 947 Madison Avenue; Block 758, Lot 22; Van Wyck Brooks Historic District
Applicant & Owner: Steve & Catherine Baffoni

Mr. Bauman informed the HPC that the Applicant has served notice and the HPC has jurisdiction over the application. William Toth, Jr., AIA of 950 Fernwood Avenue, Plainfield represented the owners Steve and Catherine Baffoni. Mr. Toth informed the HPC that the Applicant proposes to replace the existing 80 year old slate shingle roof with new asphalt shingles (GAF Slateline). There will be no change to existing hanging gutters. The slate is crumbling and is deteriorating. The weight of the slate is pushing the sidewalls away from the house. The valley beams are undersized and are splitting; the original structure was not designed properly for slate roof shingles. When asked about a cost comparison, Mr. Toth said he obtained a slate replacement quote for \$40,000 and an additional \$20,000 in framing modifications. The GAF Slateline shingles would cost \$17,000 without the need for any framing modifications.

Chairwoman Gurshman mentioned to Mr. Toth that she has received complaints that the owner replaced an 8 over 1 wood window with a 1 over 1 vinyl window. Mr. Toth said that he is aware of this window and it is a temporary situation and that the correct window will be installed.

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public; hearing no response, she closed the public portion of the meeting. Chairwoman Gurshman asked for a motion on the application; on a motion by Ms. Kavanaugh, and seconded by Ms. King, the Commission voted unanimously to approve the application as submitted.

IV. New Business

1. 2010 Historic Preservation Conference: Sustainable Past / Sustainable Future

Mr. Bauman informed the members of the Commission that the State Historic Preservation Office is holding their annual conference on June 2, in Elizabeth. The cost is \$80.00 per person, there is money in the HPC budget to send Commission members to the conference. Mr. Bauman asked that interested Members contact him by the end of next week.

2. 2010 Financial Disclosure Forms

Mr. Bauman reminded HPC members to fill out their disclosure forms and hand them to him.

V. Staff Report

1. Historic Preservation Commission Website

The Commission discussed what to do with their own website and how it should relate to the city website. The HPC expressed a commitment to work with their own webmaster for 2010 and to work with Chris Payne with the City's website. The City website can contain meeting agendas, minutes, and a roster of members while the HPC website can contain more non-updatable material like design guidelines, historic district information, pictures, links to articles, resources, etc. Chairwoman Gurshman agreed to work on getting a meeting together with the City webmaster to ensure that everyone is on the same page.

2. Survey of 413 Properties for Proposed Historic District

HPC members were provided a map showing the study area. Ms. Hunton told those present that she wanted a better idea of potential boundaries. After discussing the merits of all of the streets on the map and in the Streetscape Summary, the HPC concluded the following:

Streets Included	Streets Not Included	Streets Needing Further Examination
Brook Lane	Lake Street	Chetwynd Avenue: Medium/weak street. Look at the abutting streets: 1920s, 30s, 40s. Vinyl on some structures, starting to see inappropriate additions and repairs.
Cedar Brook Road	Park Avenue (from Prospect Avenue to Thornton Avenue)	Hillside Avenue (lower part)
Edgewood Avenue	Pine Street	Marlborough Avenue: Not strong-replacement siding on at least 8 of 19 structures. Gail only looked at the north side of the street but has now agreed to quickly assess the south side of the street.
Evergreen Avenue	Spring Street	Martine Avenue: less strong Hillside Avenue to Woodland Road). Where will the break occur?
Highland Avenue	Watchung Avenue	Thornton Avenue: Medium strength street-many of the structures have been diminished by additions and repairs.
Kensington Avenue		
Martine Avenue (Park Avenue to Hillside Avenue)		
Prospect Avenue (1 house- Lot 31)		
Woodland Avenue (from Prospect and Watchung)- both sides		

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public. Carol Bicket of 1083 Hillside Avenue said the Streetscape Summary shows 6 properties on Hillside but there are actually 2: Lots 3 and 4. Lot 1 faces Chetwynd Avenue, Lot 42 faces Marlborough, and Lot 5 faces Thornton Avenue. Joyce Phipps of 1200 Martine Avenue asked the question "what is the conceptual framework of architectural integrity?" Ms. Hunton responded "degree and kind": it is a judgement call; you look for distinguishing features and if a certain percentage of features are gone or missing, then the building has lost its architectural integrity. Ms. Phipps followed up by asking "what is the conceptual integrity for the geographical area that you have chosen for this study?" Ms. Hunton responded by saying some historic districts have a strong central theme; Plainfield as an affluent suburb is still the theme, the area being studied represents a certain period of growth in the city.

A discussion ensued over the positive and negatives of being in a historic district. Chairwoman Gurshman instructed the Commission members to look at the streets that needed further examining for next month.

VI. Old Business

1. Historic Designated Properties with Code / Maintenance Violations

The HPC discussed the status of the Lampkin House on Terrill Road, 187 North Avenue, and 822 Webster Place.

VII. Adjournment

There being no further business, Ms. Kavanaugh made a motion for adjournment, and seconded by Ms. King the commission voted all in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 10:15 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read 'S. Bauman'.

Scott Bauman, AICP, PP
Principal Planner / HPC Secretary
Plainfield Planning Division
May 2, 2010

Minutes of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting
May 25, 2010, 8:00 PM, City Hall Library, 1st Floor, 515 Watchung Avenue, Plainfield, NJ

I. Open Public Meeting Statement

Chairwoman Sandra Gurshman called the May 25, 2010, regularly scheduled meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:35 PM and read the following into the record: *"This meeting has been duly advertised in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, 10:4-6 et seq. The annual schedule of board meetings has been published in the Courier-News newspaper. In addition, copies of the notice have been posted in the City Clerk and Planning Division offices. This is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Commission."*

Name, Class Designation (term expires)	1/26/10	3/23/10	4/27/10	5/25/10	6/22/10	7/27/10	8/24/10	9/28/10	10/26/10	11/16/10	12/14/10
Chairwoman Sandra Gurshman / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X	X	X							
William Michelson, Esq. / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X		X							
Lawrence Ferrara / Class C (1/1/2011)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X							
Patricia Turner Kavanaugh / Class C (1/1/2012)	X	X	X	X							
Elizabeth King / Class C (1/1/2013)		X	X	X							
Vice Chairman Reginald Thomas, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)		X	X								
David Westlake, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X							
Bill Garrett / Class B (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X							
John Favazzo / Class C (1/1/2014)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X							
Alternate #1 Jan Jasper / Class C (1/1/2011)	X	X	X								
Alternate #2 vacancy / (unexp. 1/1/2011)	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a							
HPC Consultant Gail Hunton	X	X	X	X							
HPC Secretary Scott Bauman, PP/AICP		X	X								

Chairwoman Sandra Gurshman welcomed new HPC members Lawrence Ferrara and John Favazzo and introduced them to the Commission.

II. Adoption of the April 27, 2010, Regular Meeting Minutes

On motion made by Ms. Kavanaugh and seconded by Ms. King, the HPC unanimously adopted the April 27, 2010, meeting minutes as corrected; all voted in favor, none opposed.

III. Certificate of Appropriateness Applications

There were no carried or new applications.

IV. New Business

1. Meeting with Assemblyman Jerry Green

Chairwoman Gurshman briefed Commission members about the meeting held on May 25, 2010 at the Assemblyman's office to discuss the benefits to Plainfield of the proposed Historic Property Reinvestment Act now before the NJ Legislature. Bill Nierstedt, Gail Hunton and Sandra Gurshman attended the meeting. Assemblyman Green agreed to sign on as a co-sponsor of the bill.

2. Request for membership renewal from Preservation New Jersey

On motion made by Mr. Garrett and seconded by Ms. King, the HPC unanimously approved renewal of the Preservation New Jersey membership.

V. Old Business

1. Historic Preservation Commission Website

Chairwoman Gurshman reported there is agreement with Chris Payne, the City's webmaster, that the City's website will host the HPC meeting minutes, agendas, membership roster, the Design Guidelines, maps, and the portions of the land use ordinance pertaining to the HPC. The HPC website will host the list of historic districts

and sites, a photo gallery of representative historic structures in the City, news, and links to other resources and historic preservation organizations.

2. Survey of 413 Properties for Proposed Historic District

The HPC had a brief discussion about the ongoing survey, and Chairwoman Gurshman reminded members that they should complete their surveys of the area so that a decision may be reached about boundaries for a new historic district. She also proposed that the HPC work on the designation of the Evergreen Cemetery, and suggested that it have higher priority than the new historic district due to the need to protect it.

3. Historic Designated Properties with Code / Maintenance Violations

The HPC discussed the status of the Lampkin House on Terrill Road. The court hearing has been rescheduled for June 18th. Chairwoman Gurshman will follow up about a meeting with the Municipal Prosecutor and Corporation Counsel to review the citations against the property currently in Municipal Court, which in the HPC's opinion only exacerbate the situation and are an obstacle to negotiations regarding any potential sale.

VI. Discussion with Assemblyman Jerry Green

At this point Assemblyman Green joined the meeting and there was an informal discussion about a range of historic preservation issues in the City. Mr. Green stated his desire to partner with the HPC on preservation of historic resources in Plainfield, and is concerned in particular about maintenance of older buildings in the downtown area. There was also extended discussion about possible ways to save the Lampkin House without any specific course of action decided.

VII. Sutphen House

Chairwoman Gurshman reviewed Bill Nierstedt's memo advising the HPC about the current status of the Sutphen House in a development application for the property that will be coming to the Planning Board. The developer (Mr. Cretella of Landmark Properties) wants to move the house and has proposed several options. The HPC would like to invite the developer to an informational meeting in June to discuss the matter.

VIII. Adjournment

There being no further business, Ms. Kavanaugh made a motion for adjournment, and seconded by Ms. King the commission voted all in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 9:30 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,



Gail L. Hunton, HPC Consultant, for Scott Bauman, AICP, PP
Principal Planner / HPC Secretary
Plainfield Planning Division
June 18, 2010

**Minutes of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting
June 22, 2010, 7:30 PM, City Hall Library, 1st Floor, 515 Watchung Avenue, Plainfield, NJ**

I. Open Public Meeting Statement

Chairwoman Sandy Gurshman called the June 22, 2010, regularly scheduled meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:43 PM and read the following into the record: *"This meeting has been duly advertised in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, 10:4-6 et seq. The annual schedule of board meetings has been published in the Courier-News newspaper. In addition, copies of the notice have been posted in the City Clerk and Planning Division offices. This is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Commission."*

Name, Class Designation (term expires)	1/26/10	3/23/10	4/27/10	5/25/10	6/22/10	7/27/10	8/24/10	9/28/10	10/26/10	11/16/10	12/14/10
Chairwoman Sandra Gurshman / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X	X	X	X						
William Michelson, Esq. / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X		X	X						
Lawrence Ferrara / Class C (1/1/2011)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X						
Patricia Turner Kavanaugh / Class C (1/1/2012)	X	X	X	X							
Elizabeth King / Class C (1/1/2013)		X	X	X							
Vice Chairman Reginald Thomas, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)		X	X								
David Westlake, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X	X						
Bill Garrett / Class B (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X	X						
John Favazzo, RA / Class A (1/1/2014)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X						
Alternate #1 Jan Jasper / Class C (1/1/2011)	X	X	X		X						
Alternate #2 vacancy / (unexp. 1/1/2011)											
HPC Consultant Gail Hunton	X	X	X	X							
HPC Secretary Scott Bauman, PP/AICP		X	X		X						

II. Adoption of the May 25, 2010, Regular Meeting Minutes

On motion made by Mr. Michelson and seconded by Mr. Westlake, the HPC unanimously adopted the May 25, 2010, meeting minutes as submitted; all voted in favor, none opposed.

III. Certificate of Appropriateness Applications

There are no carried or new applications.

IV. New Business

1. Request for membership renewal from National Alliance of Preservation Commission (NAPC)

On motion made by Mr. Michelson and seconded by Ms. Jasper, the HPC unanimously approved renewal of the NAPC membership in the amount of \$80.00.

V. Old Business

1. Historic Preservation Commission Website

No new news to report. Ms. Jasper gave members the website link to the HPC members so they can view the site as it exists. Ms. Jasper asked members for positive propaganda material for the website.

2. Historic Designated Properties with Code / Maintenance Violations

- a) 957-963 Central Avenue: HPC members expressed concern with the partially finished porch restoration work- the porch is being propped up by wood beams. There are also reports of water damage to the interior.
- b) 311 Franklin Place (Catherine Webster House): HPC members noted that there are piles of house debris accumulating on the side and rear yard.

3. Survey of 413 Properties for Proposed Historic District

The HPC had a brief discussion about the ongoing survey. Ms. Hunton was not present to answer specific questions about the survey area. Commission members discussed the different streets in the proposed district and

the type and condition of housing within each street. Edward Ristoro of 1354 Chetwynd Avenue wanted to know how the HPC intended to inform residents of the historic district and what are the advantages / disadvantages of being in a district. Chairwoman Gurshman said the district plans are not on a time line, the HPC will conduct meetings for property owners in the area that is delineated for a new district. HPC members David Westlake and John Favazzo prepared color maps of the study area; color copies will be made for HPC members for the July meeting.

VI. Adjournment

There being no further business, Mr. Michelson made a motion for adjournment, and seconded by Mr. Westlake the commission voted all in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 8:46 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "S. Bauman", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Scott Bauman, AICP, PP
Principal Planner / HPC Secretary
Plainfield Planning Division
July 21, 2010

file

Minutes of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting
July 27, 2010, 7:30 PM, City Hall Library, 1st Floor, 515 Watchung Avenue, Plainfield, NJ

I. Open Public Meeting Statement

Chairwoman Sandy Gurshman called the July 27, 2010, regularly scheduled meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:35 PM and read the following into the record: *"This meeting has been duly advertised in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, 10:4-6 et seq. The annual schedule of board meetings has been published in the Courier-News newspaper. In addition, copies of the notice have been posted in the City Clerk and Planning Division offices. This is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Commission."*

Name, Class Designation (term expires)	1/26/10	3/23/10	4/27/10	5/25/10	6/22/10	7/27/10	8/24/10	9/28/10	10/26/10	11/16/10	12/14/10
Chairwoman Sandra Gurshman / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X	X	X	X	X					
William Michelson, Esq. / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X		X	X	X					
Lawrence Ferrara / Class C (1/1/2011)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X	X					
Patricia Turner Kavanaugh / Class C (1/1/2012)	X	X	X	X		X					
Elizabeth King / Class C (1/1/2013)		X	X	X							
Vice Chairman Reginald Thomas, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)		X	X			X					
David Westlake, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X	X	X					
Bill Garrett / Class B (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X	X	X					
John Favazzo, RA / Class A (1/1/2014)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X	X					
Alternate #1 Jan Jasper / Class C (1/1/2011)	X	X	X		X	X					
Alternate #2 vacancy / (unexp. 1/1/2011)	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a					
HPC Consultant Gail Hunton	X	X	X	X		X					
HPC Secretary Scott Bauman, PP/AICP		X	X		X	X					

II. Adoption of the June 22, 2010, Regular Meeting Minutes

On motion made by Mr. Michelson and seconded by Ms. Turner Kavanaugh, the HPC unanimously adopted the June 22, 2010, meeting minutes as submitted; all voted in favor, none opposed.

III. Certificate of Appropriateness Applications

There are no carried or new applications for the July 27, 2010 meeting.

IV. New Business

1. Informational Hearing: Homefirst, Inc.- Improvements to Properties in the Historic Districts:

Appearing on behalf of Homefirst: Ellen McGovern (Executive Director), Susan Laffler (Director of Development and Public Relations), and architect Mark Bess (211 Glen Ridge Avenue, Montclair). Homefirst has the opportunity to apply for grant funds to renovate 4 properties; Homefirst wants feedback from the HPC on each of the proposals. Homefirst plans to apply for funding in September for the 2011 funding cycle.

- A. 114 Crescent Avenue; Block 829, Lot 2. Crescent Area Historic District
Homefirst proposes to blow in insulation and would prefer to install storm windows on each of the windows rather than install new vinyl replacement windows.
- B. 307-309 Franklin Place; Block 643, Lot 13. Crescent Area Historic District
The first floor exterior is painted brick, the second floor exterior is decorative wood scallop shingle siding. Windows have already been replaced. The proposal for this property calls for removing existing wood siding and replace with Hardiplank, clean/repair, and repaint the brick facade.
- C. 310-314 Franklin Place; Block 642, Lot 23. Crescent Area Historic District
Wood siding and wood windows are in disrepair, the structure needs a new roof and soffits. Of the 4 houses this one is in the worst shape. Homefirst proposes to remove the wood siding and install Hardiplank siding and replace the windows with new vinyl replacement windows. Ms. Hunton commented that Hardiplank is

good but the question is: “is the wood you are replacing beyond repair?”. Ms. McGovern said she will look at the siding; she acknowledged that Homefirst still needs to do a full review of all of the existing conditions of all four properties. The windows are original, single-pane, non-functional, and not energy efficient. Chairwoman Gurshman asked if the windows were repairable; Ms. McGovern responded by saying that Homefirst wanted energy efficient windows. Ms. Hunton said a compromise could be the installation of storm windows.

- D. 901-909 Watchung Avenue; Block 642, Lot 22. Putnam Watchung Historic District
Homefirst proposes to remove existing exterior wood siding and replace with Hardiplank siding. The roof and windows are in good condition.

Mr. Bess passed around foam boards showing pictures of each of the houses. A general discussion took place concerning the need to replace siding if it is too deteriorated to repair. Several members had questions about the use of Hardiplank siding on the structures. A fair amount of discussion took place about the condition of original windows and the need to replace those windows versus installing storm windows. At the end of the discussion, no one from the public commented; the representatives of Homefirst thanked the HPC for their time and said they will return should they decide to file an application for any of the work they are proposing, if funding for these projects is achieved.

2. **Informational Hearing: Richard Lear & Carlos Ponton- 925 Madison Ave; Block 758, Lot 27.**

The Applicants presently live at 136 Prospect Street in Jersey City; they have purchased this property and will be closing soon. They are seeking guidance from the HPC on several projects they plan to start once they close on the property.

- A. The walkway in front of the house and the porch columns are sinking; the Applicants propose to dig under the foundation, add cement, break up the walkway, replace the walkway, and repair the columns.
- B. Clean and remove the mold in the basement.
- C. Confront the drainage issues in the front and back yards.
- D. Fence in the back yard, relocate a rear yard gate. The side and rear yard fences will be 6’ in height up to the front of the house.
- E. Replace the flat roof, replace the terra cotta ridge row coping.
- F. Remove an interior non-weight bearing wall in the kitchen, remove one double hung window and one casement window and install a new divided light window to match remaining windows; this area is at the rear of the house and cannot be seen from the street.
- G. Replace the garage doors on the detached garage. The garage doors in place now are not original and are in poor shape, the Applicants prefer a style with windows, 16’ door, four-panel- a single door for a two car garage.

The Applicant and the HPC discussed each of the projects and offered helpful information. The Applicants said they would be back in August with a Certificate of Appropriateness application.

V. Old Business

1. Historic Preservation Commission Website

Ms. Jasper informed the HPC that the site is almost ready for primetime; she gave members the website link so they can view the site. Chairwoman Gurshman is working on text for the front page. Ms. Jasper asked members to provide her with positive information and material for the website.

2. Historic Designated Properties with Code / Maintenance Violations

- a) 957-963 Central Avenue: HPC members expressed concern with the partially finished porch restoration work- the porch is being propped up by wood beams. There are also reports of water damage to the interior.
- b) 850 Terrill Road (Lampkin House): HPC members noted that there are piles of house debris accumulating on the side and rear yard.

3. Survey of 413 Properties for Proposed Historic District

The HPC had a brief discussion about the ongoing survey. Ms. Hunton said she is waiting for further direction from the HPC. Mr. Michelson expressed his interest in having the south side of Thornton Avenue part of the study area. Ms. Hunton commented that many of the houses on Thornton Avenue had replacement windows and siding. Chairwoman Gurshman said visually there appears to be two districts forming from the study area and rather than expanding the Hillside District, the HPC should consider two districts. Ms. Hunton said she will proceed to do individual building analysis and will have them ready for the September 28 meeting.

Michael Banick of 1306 Marlborough Avenue asked how long of a process it is before action is taken. Chairwoman Gurshman said at the September meeting the HPC will decide from the study area which parts will be considered for a district. The HPC will then conduct meetings for property owners in the area that is delineated for a new district. Full property surveys will be prepared describing each property. The timeline is to complete the district by the winter or spring of 2011.

Ms. Hunton added that the HPC has not yet gotten out the word on the benefits of historic preservation.

Robert Hinnen of 1351 Chetwynd Avenue asked about the pros and cons of historic preservation. Several HPC members answered Mr. Hinnen's questions.

VI. Adjournment

There being no further business, Mr. Michelson made a motion for adjournment, and seconded by Mr. Westlake the commission voted all in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 9:38 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,



Scott Bauman, AICP, PP
Principal Planner / HPC Secretary
Plainfield Planning Division
September 17, 2010

file

Minutes of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting
August 24, 2010, 7:30 PM, City Hall Library, 1st Floor, 515 Watchung Avenue, Plainfield, NJ

I. Open Public Meeting Statement

Chairwoman Sandy Gurshman called the August 24, 2010, regularly scheduled meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:37 PM and read the following into the record: *"This meeting has been duly advertised in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, 10:4-6 et seq. The annual schedule of board meetings has been published in the Courier-News newspaper. In addition, copies of the notice have been posted in the City Clerk and Planning Division offices. This is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Commission."*

Name, Class Designation (term expires)	1/26/10	3/23/10	4/27/10	5/25/10	6/22/10	7/27/10	8/24/10	9/28/10	10/26/10	11/16/10	12/14/10
Chairwoman Sandra Gurshman / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X				
William Michelson, Esq. / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X		X	X	X	X				
Lawrence Ferrara / Class C (1/1/2011)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X	X	X				
Patricia Turner Kavanaugh / Class C (1/1/2012)	X	X	X	X		X					
Elizabeth King / Class C (1/1/2013)		X	X	X							
Vice Chairman Reginald Thomas, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)		X	X			X					
David Westlake, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X				
Bill Garrett / Class B (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X				
John Favazzo, RA / Class A (1/1/2014)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X	X	X				
Alternate #1 Jan Jasper / Class C (1/1/2011)	X	X	X		X	X	X				
Alternate #2 vacancy / (unexp. 1/1/2011)	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a				
HPC Consultant Gail Hunton	X	X	X	X		X	X				
HPC Secretary Scott Bauman, PP/AICP		X	X		X	X	X				

II. Adoption of the July 27, 2010, Regular Meeting Minutes

HPC Secretary requested that adoption of the July 27, 2010 meeting minutes be carried to the September 28 meeting.

III. Certificate of Appropriateness Applications

1. HPC 10-04; 925 Madison Avenue; Block 758, Lot 27; Van Wyck Brooks Historic District

Richard Lear & Carlos Ponton- Applicant & Owners

Messrs. Lear and Ponton presently live at 136 Prospect Street, Jersey City. Mr. Lear informed the Commission that he is proposing the following work: remove an existing concrete walkway in front of his house and replace it with a new concrete walkway, underpin and repair stucco porch columns adjacent to the walkway, replace a garage door on an existing detached garage with a new garage door, replace an existing 6' high wood stockade fence along the rear and side lot line with a new flat-top board on board wood fence, and remove two deteriorated double-hung wood windows at the rear and side elevations with new 48" x 44" in-kind casement wood windows.

- a) As a result of hydrostatic water pressure in the courtyard, the walkway in front of the house has collapsed and as a result the stucco columns are damaged. Mr. Lear proposes to remove the old walkway, shore up the house foundation, and repair the columns. HPC members did not have any questions about this proposal.
- b) Mr. Lear provided pictures of the detached garage, and a cut sheet showing the garage door replacement. He proposes one door for both garage openings; the material of the door is steel. Mr. Michelson suggested that the owner may wish to have two doors instead of one. HPC members cited no objection to the proposed garage door or if the owner wished to have two doors instead of one.
- c) Mr. Lear provided the HPC with a property survey showing the proposed location of the new 6' high flat-top board on board wood fence. There were no objections to the type of fence proposed or its location.
- d) As a result of poor water drainage from the roof, two double-hung wood windows on the rear and side elevations have become rotted. Mr. Lear explained to the HPC that he intends to replace the deteriorated windows with new 48" x 44" in-kind wood casement windows (Pella Architectural series). Mr. Lear

provided a video of the exterior of the house showing that the location of these windows cannot be seen from the public right of way.

Chairwoman Gurshman asked Mr. Lear about the progress made on his roof- the HPC previously approved the work since there was no change in exterior appearance. Mr. Lear said he still needs to supply the HPC with specifications on the ridge tile.

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public. Will Gipp of 1325 Chetwynd Avenue questioned why the owner needed to provide the HPC with a roof tile sample. Chairwoman Gurshman told Mr. Gipp that the new roof tile needs to match the original roof tile so a sample is being provided to ensure that the new roofing material is the same as the original material.

On a motion made by Mr. Michelson and seconded by Mr. Westlake, the Historic Preservation Commission unanimously approved the Certificate of Appropriateness application as presented with the condition that the Applicant provides a specification sheet for the roof ridge tile, and the 48" x 44" casement window.

IV. Referral Applications from Planning Board & Zoning Board of Adjustment

1. ZB 09-28; 200-212 Park Avenue; Block 245, Lot 7.01; North Avenue Historic District

The Bank, LLC- Applicant / PNC Bank, National Association- Owner

Attorney Jay Bohn (1771 Front Street, Scotch Plains, NJ) and Frank Cretella (675 Garfield Avenue, Jersey City) were present to discuss their proposal to renovate the existing four-story PNC bank building for a retail and nightclub use, and construct a fifth floor addition for nightclub use. Mr. Cretella described how he intends to restore the exterior of the building and how the proposed addition will impact the building and the North Avenue Historic District.

Mr. Cretella said the fifth floor addition will be 12' in height which will increase the height of the building from 49' to 62' and it will be set back 37' back from Park Avenue; you will not see the addition from the street level in front of the building but you will see the addition from West Second and Park Avenue. The addition will be constructed of mostly non-reflective glass, which will be a new added element to the building. There will also be a non-reflective glass awning approximately 18' above grade which will tilt towards the building for drainage via an internal gutter system. Ms. Hunton commented that she would like to see a "line street" drawing which would show what the addition looks like from the northern part of Park Avenue and North Avenue.

Ms. Hunton told the HPC that the Zoning Board needs the HPC to speak on the height variance only- not the architectural design of the addition- just the concept of the building increasing in height from 49' to 62'. After further discussion and no comment from the public, Mr. Michelson made a motion stating the HPC has no objection to the 49' high building increasing in height to no more than 62' with the provision that the addition is set back at least 37' from the Park Avenue elevation. Mr. Garrett seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

2. PB 10-10; 101-209 West Second Street; Block 245, Lots 3 & 4; Titsworth-Sutphen House

West Second Street Commons Urban Renewal, LLC- Applicant / PNC Bank, National Association- Owner

Attorney Jay Bohn (1771 Front Street, Scotch Plains, NJ), architect Dennis Devino (675 Garfield Avenue, Jersey City), and Frank Cretella (675 Garfield Avenue, Jersey City) were present to discuss their proposal to relocate the Titsworth-Sutphen House as part of their project to construct a five-story mixed use retail and residential building. The Titsworth-Sutphen House is located where the driveway is proposed for the new development.

Mr. Devino said that the house is a two story frame structure that his client would like to relocate to a more significant and suitable area, if the proposed building is built around the Sutphen House, it would lose its historical significance; Mr. Devino believes this is the right decision. There is no set relocation space yet; Mr. Cretella is working with city officials on obtaining a suitable location. Mr. Cretella expressed a preference for the southeast corner of Madison and West Second Street- a vacant city owned lot suitable for retail use. When asked about the condition of the house Mr. Devino said the front part of the structure can be moved easily, the rear addition is not significant, the foundation is brick.

Ms. Hunton commented that the city typically doesn't move historic buildings because they lose their integrity and historic association. There must be a sizable benefit to the building to justify its relocation. Rudolph Titsworth was a clothing manufacturer and prominent Plainfield citizen in the mid 1800s; he was integral in advancing Plainfield from a hamlet to a city. The house is one of the few pre-Civil War buildings left in downtown Plainfield- much of downtown Plainfield consisted of structures like the Titsworth-Sutphen house in the mid nineteenth century.

Mr. Cretella said by moving the building he intends to renovate it and utilize it for retail use. Right now the building serves as storage for the PNC bank. Mr. Devino added if the HPC wants to make recommendations for renovation they will be happy to work with the Commission. Ms. Gurshman asked if anyone has checked the condition between the modern addition and the back of the original side. Mr. Devino said no one has. Ms. Hunton said it would be useful for members of the HPC to tour the inside of the house.

Ms. Hunton said she is personally uncomfortable with recommending moving the house without a site established- she cited examples in Monmouth County of partially completed moves where the buildings wind up on temporary foundations and remain vacant. The HPC should know where the house is going and the scope of the renovations. Ms. Hunton recommended that the HPC referral should include a condition that the city identifies a suitable relocation site for the building.

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public; there was no comment from the public. Mr. Michelson made a motion to return the application to the Planning Board citing no objection to the relocation of the Titsworth-Sutphen House provided that a location is decided upon and condition upon HPC inspection of the structure and review its plans for its renovation. Ms. Jasper seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

IV. New Business: no new business

V. Old Business

1. Historic Preservation Commission Website

Ms. Jasper informed the HPC that the site is coming along nicely- a lot of information has been added since last month and she encourages everyone to look at it.

2. Historic Designated Properties with Code / Maintenance Violations

- a) 957-963 Central Avenue: HPC members expressed concern about rumors that the house has been repeatedly broken into and occupied by squatters. Code Enforcement should secure the building.
- b) 850 Terrill Road (Lampkin House): The municipal court case for property code violations has been postponed until October 1.

3. Survey of 413 Properties for Proposed Historic District

Ms. Hunton said she will have her final analysis of the study area completed by the September 28 meeting. Chairwoman Gurshman acknowledged that there were many members of the public present and those who wished to speak could do so at this time.

- a) Will Gipp of 1325 Chetwynd Avenue said in July 2009 he spoke with a woman who was taking pictures of his house; that woman said she was taking pictures for a historic district study- that was the only notice he received. Since then he attended all of the Historic Preservation Commission meetings and he came to the conclusion that living in a historic district is restrictive everything that is visible from the street needs approval, there is a \$60 fee every time you want to work on your house. Mr. Gipp said he has witnessed favoritism on the Commission. Mr. Gipp presented Chairwoman Gurshman with a petition containing 97 signatures of residents who oppose the creation of a historic district in their neighborhood. Ms. Hunton said that the Commission is studying an area for a potential district and it should not be interpreted as a strategy to compromise resident's rights; the Commission's motives are genuine, she has served as the City's historic preservation consultant since 1983 and she takes exception to Mr. Gipp's accusation of favoritism on the Commission. Ms. Jasper said the study area is the first step in looking at the properties to see if they are appropriate to be included in a district; she also found Mr. Gipp's comments regarding favoritism alarming.

Chairwoman Gurshman commented that current and past Commission chairs and members all go through the same review process as everyone else and the HPC conducts its business as even handed as possible.

- b) Michelle and Zachery Glover of 1314 Chetwynd Avenue said that they signed the petition and they do not want to be in any historic district.
- c) Kathy Hilliard of 1421 Marlborough Avenue asked about the process and time frame of the project. Ms. Hunton said she conducted a preliminary review street by street, the HPC then requested specific information which she will get to them in September. Ms. Hilliard asked how the specific streets were selected; Ms. Hunton said a survey of historic structures was conducted in 1985 and that survey recommended additional historic districts. Buildings over 50 years of age are considered potentially historic- sometimes there are enough potentially historic houses in a neighborhood that could justify the creation of a district. Mr. Michelson cited his personal story on how a neighbor brick faced his house before the Netherwood Heights Historic District was created.
- d) Ray Chase of 1350 Marlborough Avenue cited a color coded map showing the study area and noted that Marlborough Avenue is not being considered but from what he is hearing tonight Marlborough Avenue may be considered- what is the truth? Chairwoman Gurshman said that announcement will be made in September.
- e) Demetrius Carson of 1314 Marlborough Avenue commented on Mr. Michelson's personal story- that is the problem- people telling him what he can do with his house. Mr. Carson cited neighborhood watch successes in his neighborhood. Kiabi Carson asked who has final say on the district; Chairwoman Gurshman said the Historic Preservation Commission sets the boundaries and recommends the district to the Planning Board, should they endorse the plan they send it to City Council and City Council has the final say. Fifty one percent have to not object in order for it to be heard by the Council.
- f) Wanda Roberts of 1360 Chetwynd Avenue said she knew nothing of tonight's meeting until her neighbors told her; the Commission should not be a steward over her property. She does not want to go through the process of Chetwynd Avenue being part of a historic district.
- g) Joe DaRold of 1404 Martine Avenue said cited the Historic Preservation Element of the Master Plan, Objective 2.9 which states: "in order to maintain its leadership role in municipal historic preservation, the HPC should continue its educational outreach program, both inside and outside the city, to increase awareness of and pride in Plainfield's historic resources and the benefits of historic preservation." Mr. DaRold questioned the Commission's fulfillment of objective 2.9.
- h) Edward Ristoro of 1353 Chetwynd Avenue said the "opt-out" process bugs him. Ms. Hunton commented that the procedures are consistent with the municipal zoning ordinance and state enabling legislation; the city did not make up the process.
- i) Helena Pepe of 1414 Marlborough Avenue asked what constitutes "historic." Ms. Hunton cited the criteria for designating historic sites and districts which includes: 1) significant people associated with the property, 2) significant cultural patterns, 3) significant representation of a building style, patterns, 3) association with a significant person or event, and 4) significant information important in prehistory or history.
- j) Mara Applebaum of 1340 Marlborough Avenue said she signed the petition opposing the historic district. She asked if the Commission will consider those who are opposed to the district. Chairwoman Gurshman said the Commission will take into consideration those who oppose the district.
- k) Deborah Thomas of 1441 Martine Avenue said she was not opposed to the historic district.
- l) Pat Sibbles of 1424 Martine Avenue asked how the process was going to move forward. Ms. Hunton recommended that the Commission establish a time frame shortly. Mr. Michelson shared his experiences with the creation of the Netherwood heights Historic District.

Ms. Jasper left the meeting at 9:47 PM

- m) Oscar Riba of 1338 Martine Avenue said he was in favor of the district. Plainfield is a historically rich city, a watchdog group to ensure that any work done to a house in a historic district is a good thing. Citing a flier that is going around the neighborhood, Mr. Riba said there is a lot of misinformation being circulated. Mr. Riba lives in a 1926 Tudor house and he loves it; he said different people have different tastes but we are a community and we have to work together. Mr. Riba said there is a lot of dubious thought out there and he researched the pros and cons of historic districts and real estate values of homes in districts versus homes not in districts. Being in a historic district is a very small price to pay to enjoy what the city has to offer. Mr. Favazzo said historic districts are a holistic and civic approach to preserve the character of the city; we are all part of a community with an incredible resource- our history- a foundation on how the city will grow and those who live here should protect what we have and preserve what we fell in love with.
- n) Helena Pepe of 1414 Marlborough Avenue said how she found out about the district is what made her become frightened; she likes her neighborhood and her neighbors, she is proud of her home and neighbors; she is on the fence as to whether to support the creation of a historic district.
- o) Demetrius Carson of 1314 Marlborough Avenue said his neighborhood has been the same for the last 25 years; he doesn't need people to tell him what kind of window he can put on his house, he finds that offensive and has a problem with that. He wants to know what the myths are and what the truths are.

There was no additional public comment; Chairwoman closed the public hearing and informed those present that the proposed historic district discussion will continue on September 28, 2010 during the regularly scheduled Historic Preservation Commission meeting scheduled for 7:30 PM in the City Hall Library.

VI. Adjournment

There being no further business, Mr. Michelson made a motion for adjournment, and seconded by Mr. Westlake the commission voted all in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 10:13 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,



Scott Bauman, AICP, PP
Principal Planner / HPC Secretary
Plainfield Planning Division
September 23, 2010

Minutes of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting
September 28, 2010, 7:30 PM, City Hall Library, 1st Floor, 515 Watchung Avenue, Plainfield, NJ

I. Open Public Meeting Statement

Chairwoman Sandy Gurshman called the September 28, 2010, regularly scheduled meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:37 PM and read the following into the record: *"This meeting has been duly advertised in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, 10:4-6 et seq. The annual schedule of board meetings has been published in the Courier-News newspaper. In addition, copies of the notice have been posted in the City Clerk and Planning Division offices. This is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Commission."*

Name, Class Designation (term expires)	1/26/10	3/23/10	4/27/10	5/25/10	6/22/10	7/27/10	8/24/10	9/28/10	10/26/10	11/16/10	12/14/10
Chairwoman Sandra Gurshman / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X			
William Michelson, Esq. / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X		X	X	X	X	X			
Lawrence Ferrara / Class C (1/1/2011)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X	X	X	X			
Patricia Turner Kavanaugh / Class C (1/1/2012)	X	X	X	X		X		X			
Elizabeth King / Class C (1/1/2013)		X	X	X							
Vice Chairman Reginald Thomas, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)		X	X			X		X			
David Westlake, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X				
Bill Garrett / Class B (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X				
John Favazzo, RA / Class A (1/1/2014)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X	X	X	X			
Alternate #1 Jan Jasper / Class C (1/1/2011)	X	X	X		X	X	X	X			
Alternate #2 James Galvin, PE / (unexp. 1/1/2011)	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	X			
HPC Consultant Gail Hunton	X	X	X	X		X	X	X			
HPC Secretary Scott Bauman, PP/AICP		X	X		X	X	X	X			

II. Swearing in New Historic Preservation Commission Member Jim Galvin

Chairwoman Sandy Gurshman introduced to the Commission Jim Galvin who was recently appointed to the Commission to fill an unexpired term ending January 1, 2011. Mr. Galvin was sworn in by Mr. Michelson.

III. Adoption of the July 27, 2010, Regular Meeting Minutes

On a motion made by Ms. Kavanaugh and seconded by Mr. Michelson, the July 27, 2010 meeting minutes were approved unanimously as amended with comments made by Mr. Michelson and Chairwoman Gurshman.

IV. Adoption of the August 24, 2010, Regular Meeting Minutes

On a motion made by Mr. Michelson and seconded by Mr. Favazzo, the August 24, 2010, meeting minutes were approved unanimously as amended with comments made by Mr. Michelson and Chairwoman Gurshman.

IV. Certificate of Appropriateness Applications

- HPC 10-05; 501-511 Stelle Avenue / 900-910 Field Avenue; Block 754, Lot 6; Van Wyck Brooks Historic District / Jonathan Payumo- Applicant & Owner**

The Applicant Jon Payumo (501 Stelle Avenue) informed the Commission that he wishes to construct a 14' x 24' x 15' high accessory structure (garage) and locate it in the rear yard area of his property. He also wishes to install a six-foot high wood stockade fence at side and rear yard, and a four-foot high aluminum fence in the front yard. Mr. Payumo submitted a site plan and cut sheets showing the shed, fences, and their respective locations. The garage will have concrete footings and will have gravel flooring. The garage will be barn style and have a gable roof.

Mr. Thomas arrived at the meeting at 7:50 P.M.

Mr. Payumo asked for a time extension for HPC 03-23 (last amended June 25, 2004) to complete the porch railing and balusters, and to amend HPC 03-23 to close the French doors on the second story projecting bay rather than replace the French doors with curved windows. Mr. Payumo submitted an elevation drawing of his house and pointed out the porch railing and balusters as well as the 2nd floor French doors. Mr. Payumo originally wanted to

close up the French doors with a curved window. Cost estimates for the curved window were expensive so instead he would like to close up the doors and install siding on the bottom half. Ms. Hunton asked Mr. Payumo if her were opposed to a straight pane window. Mr. Payumo said other windows in the house are curved. Mr. Galvin said that framing a straight window may be an issue and that proportionally the combination of doors and the glass would not look right. Chairwoman Gurshman said she can foresee problems with weatherproofing an irregular curved surface area. Mr. Galvin asked Mr. Payumo if he would be opposed to taking out the doors entirely and siding the area for the time being. Mr. Payumo said he would not be opposed to that idea but he does want a curved window. Vice Chairman Thomas said he has a contact he can give to Mr. Payumo with regards to finding a less expensive curved window.

Ms. Jasper arrived at the meeting at 8:02 P.M.

Chairwoman Gurshman asked if there were any questions about the garage or the fence. There were no questions about the garage. Mr. Galvin wanted to know how the fence was being mounted. Mr. Payumo said the fence would have concrete footings every two feet. Mr. Michelson cited to objections to the extension of the approvals that were previously granted by the Commission. Ms. Gurshman said with regards to the French doors, the Applicant has the option of 1) replace the doors with a window, 2) removing the doors entirely and closing it in with shingles, or 3) closing it partially. Mr. Favazzo recommended enclosing it entirely with shingles or consulting with a window maker on obtaining the correct window style at a reasonable price. Chairwoman Gurshman recommended bifurcating the application and carry the French door / window matter to the October 26 meeting. With no further discussion by Commission members Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public for comment. No one from the public commented. Mr. Michelson made a motion to bifurcate the application and carry the French door / window matter to the October 26, 2010 meeting and approve a two year extension through 9/28/12 of Certificate of Appropriateness HPC 03-23 (previously amended 8/31/03, 6/25/04, and 10/26/05), and approve plans for the proposed fence and shed as submitted by the Applicant. Ms. Turner Kavanaugh seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved by voice vote.

V. Referral Application from the Zoning Board of Adjustment

1. ZB 10-13; 340-344 Franklin Place; Block 642, Lot 28; Crescent Area Historic District

Shelby L. Netterville - Applicant & Owner

The Applicant Shelby Netterville (645 Belvidere Avenue, Plainfield) introduced himself and his architect Roger Winkle (947 Park Avenue, Plainfield). Mr. Winkle explained to the Commission why the application was going before the Zoning Board of Adjustment; he passed out pictures of the property and informed the Commission that his client intends to clean and restore the vacant building that was previously a six family dwelling and convert it to a 4 family dwelling. If the Zoning Board approves his client's application, he will be back before the Commission for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Mr. Winkle showed the Commission pictures of the property as it looks now. Mr. Winkle said he proposes to rebuild an L shaped front porch and an L shaped addition to the rear of the building. The addition will be the same height and will line up with the existing building. Mr. Winkle showed the Commission proposed front and rear elevation drawings. The front will be the same as what exists with exception to the new front porch. The rear elevation shows the proposed addition – he is still working on the materials. The existing materials are brick and wood siding. Mr. Winkle thinks that stucco could be a suitable material. Mr. Winkle stated that the entire left half of the rear elevation is all existing material- the new proposed addition is just past the center line of the elevation and to the right. Massing is similar in size. Mr. Winkle showed the Commission the left side elevation drawing: the only new area is a small sliver on the extreme left- approximately ten feet.

Mr. Winkle showed the Commission floor plans for the proposal including the L shape addition at the rear of the building. The new addition will consist of a stair tower, second means of egress for all units, and a residential unit (3-story brownstone style). All units will be large and contain two bedrooms. The first floor unit will be 1,576 feet, the second floor unit will be 1,629 square feet, the third floor unit will be 1,707 square feet, and the unit in the new addition will be 1,426 square feet. The Commission engaged in a brief discussion with the Applicant about the variances he is requesting from the Zoning Board of Adjustment.

Mr. Michelson said that normally he is not in favor of increased density but is willing to bend in this case; he is looking forward to discussing materials at a later date should the Zoning Board approve the application. Mr.

Michelson added that he is happy about getting rid of the fire escape and the reduced buffer space around the parking lot is not objectionable. Vice Chairman Thomas asked that if the Applicant returns, that he provide more detailed drawings addressing the historic nature and continuity of the addition to the rest of the house including arches, spandrels, brick work, etc. Mr. Favazzo asked the Applicant to save as much original woodwork as possible.

Chairwoman Gurshman asked if there were any questions about the density, or parking; there were no additional questions by the Commission. Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public. No one from the public made comment. Mr. Michelson made a motion that the Commission report back to the Zoning Board of Adjustment that the Commission is comfortable with the project in terms of density, and the parking lot; with no strong objections the Commission will deal with materials at the Certificate of Appropriateness meeting. Ms. Turner Kavanaugh seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote. A copy of the referral letter from the Commission to the Zoning Board dated October 5, is added to the record:

On September 28, 2010 the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) heard the above-referenced referral from the Zoning Board of Adjustment. The applicant is requesting a variance to convert a former one-family dwelling into a four-family dwelling. Originally constructed as a one-family residence, the now-vacant building had been previously subdivided into six residential units. The applicant is also requesting relief from impervious lot coverage requirements.

The HPC reviewed the architectural plans prepared and presented by Roger C. Winkle, Architect and dated August 13, 2010. Typically, the HPC would object to conversions of this kind due to the impacts on the historic structure, its site and the surrounding historic district. In this case, however, the building has been vacant for several years and has suffered from progressive deterioration and vandalism, resulting in considerable loss of historic fabric on both the exterior and interior. The HPC believes that this application represents an opportunity to save the formerly grand Victorian residence from demolition. Due to the amount of work that will be required to rehab this building and make it habitable, it appears that the project is economically feasible only if it is supported by multiple residential units. Consequently the HPC has no objection to the variance application.

The footprint and massing of the proposed addition comply with the *City of Plainfield Design Guidelines for Historic Districts and Sites*. The architectural design features (such as exterior siding, roof pitch, windows, doors, and porches) were not reviewed or approved. If the variance is granted, the Applicant will be required to submit complete architectural plans for the rehabilitation of the entire building for HPC review and compliance with the *Design Guidelines*. Thank you for your consideration.

VI. New Business: no new business

VII. Old Business

1. Final Recommendations of the Study Area for the Proposed Historic District

Ms. Hunton provided the Commission and the public with an institutional history of historic preservation in the City of Plainfield. Ms. Hunton began consulting for the city in the early 1980s. In the 1970s the city became concerned about its main asset- historic neighborhoods. Residents were concerned about neglect of historic properties by absentee landlords, and the construction of large apartment buildings in historic neighborhoods. Concerned citizens got together and asked the City Council to enact a Historic Preservation Review Committee. By 1982 Plainfield had three historic districts- Crescent Area, Hillside Avenue, and Van Wyck Brooks. In 1985 the State amended the Municipal Land Use Law which permitted municipalities to create Historic Preservation Commissions. Plainfield was in the forefront and the Commission was created in 1986. Since 1986 the city has expanded its historic districts and has slowly and steadily built relationships with property owners in the city. Ms. Hunton informed the public that there can be difference of opinions on boundaries but let's be polite to one another.

Ms. Hunton unraveled a map displaying the study area; Ms. Hunton explained that the green streets are the ones recommended to be included in a new district; streets included: Brook, Cedar Brook, Evergreen, Highland, Kensington, Prospect, and Woodland. There are some possible individual designations of key buildings along Prospect and the Evergreen School. Ms. Hunton recommended that the Commission look at these streets more carefully- she reiterated that she is not recommending any new historic districts at all right now. Ms. Hunton said

she purposely did not lump buildings into contributing / non-contributing categories. Ms. Hunton further recommended that before anything else, the Commission should initiate a program of outreach- work with neighborhood associations and block associations; create partnerships with residents.

Mr. Favazzo said we are close to what he has envisioned; he is on the fence about the west side of Martine Avenue but it is a little broken up. Ms. Hunton said that area is possible for individual property designations. Mr. Michelson said he is the most assertive when it comes to including marginal blocks- he seeks the input of residents of included streets and marginal areas too. Mr. Michelson still wants to include the west side of Martine Avenue- possibly a two stage study area; as the Commission does its outreach, let's see what emerges.

Chairwoman Gurshman said that the next step is to locate neighborhood associations and arrange for meetings. Chairwoman Gurshman acknowledged that there were many members of the public present and those who wished to speak could do so at this time.

- a) Charles Sporn of 960 Woodland Avenue said he grew up in Brooklyn; his roots are in New York City and the historic preservation movement from the 1950's. He brought that mentality of preserving neighborhoods to Plainfield. Preserving neighborhoods results in an economic asset. Mr. Sporn is fully in favor of his house and street being part of a designated historic district. He was surprised that his street was never included in a district- it is a very diverse street with a lot of architectural style.
- b) Dr. Jacqueline Napper of 1345 Marlborough Avenue asked how will designation benefit the people in the district. Mr. Favazzo cited case studies that show neighborhoods are slowly lost when they do not preserve their identities and neighborhoods that are committed to preserving their history are protected and can survive through time. This has huge economic benefits- entering a neighborhood knowing that there is no chance of a big change to a neighborhood. Dr. Napper asked Mr. Favazzo to discuss the benefits to those who live in historic neighborhoods- like the Hillside Historic District. Mr. Favazzo said walk through the Hillside Historic District and you will notice where the district begins and where it ends. Ms. Hunton said people are more willing to invest into their property if they have the security knowing that their neighborhood will be stable. Mr. Michelson added that he has lived on Belvidere Avenue for 24 years, his neighborhood is 1,000 percent better than when he first moved in. Historic districts also add to neighborhood social organizations too, progressive dinners, neighborhood watch groups. The Historic Preservation Commission offers a lot to people- most of us are professionals; we give helpful advice. Mr. Favazzo added that historic designation also protects property owners from municipal actions too such as widening streets.
- c) Bernice Paglia of 124 East Seventh Street said most historic districts are supposed to have associations. Some districts aren't strong or active- who can support these groups? Chairwoman Gurshman and Ms. Hunton said that is a big issue. Mr. Michelson said associations help with safety and crime control; the Commission need to mail notices to people, meet each other and see who shows up.
- d) Tony Rucker of 825 Berkeley Avenue said when he was part of the Netherwood Heights Historic District; they used to try to collaborate with other historic districts and meet at different people's homes. Having a place where all members of historic districts can meet would be helpful in creating the synergy needed to boost the district's presence in the city.
- e) Oscar Riba of 1338 Martine Avenue asked Commission members to speak of the financial impact in being part of a historic district, such as the money spent on renovations and materials. Vice Chairman Thomas said it doesn't take any more money to do the work correctly; using correct materials helps property values. Neighbors with vinyl windows will decrease the value of your home. The value of homes in the Broadway Historic District were \$200,000 less in the mid 1990s; now values have jumped \$200,000 and realtors have taken notice- there is pride in ownership. Ms. Jasper commented about the payback period on energy savings for vinyl windows is long, the greenest what windows that are already being used. Ms. Jasper further commented on the environmental impacts of historic preservation. Mr. Galvin commented that there are contractors in the community that will charge \$200 to fix wood windows, or a new window sales person can charge you \$300 plus for vinyl window and tell you that wood windows are no good. If you ask the right questions, most contractors will go away. If you maintain your wood windows they shouldn't cost you anything. A discussion ensued over vinyl siding. The contractor community is part of the problem we have-

they blame historic preservation, but realtors drive people through historic districts. Ms. Hunton added that there are 31 states in the United States with preservation tax credits- unfortunately New Jersey is not one of them but that could change.

- f) Mike Banick of 1306 Marlborough Avenue supported the first speaker's comments. Mr. Banick said the size of the lots on Marlborough Avenue are smaller, he is glad Marlborough is not selected to be in a district. Mr. Banick asked if we can tell residents on Marlborough Avenue to rest easy now and not attend future Commission meetings? Chairwoman Gurshman said that maybe someday Marlborough Avenue could be part of a district; Ms. Turner Kavanaugh added to the conversation by telling Mr. Banick that the residents of Marlborough Avenue are safe for the foreseeable future; to work with what is already recommended will take a lot of research and effort.

There was no additional public comment; Chairwoman Gurshman thanked those present for their comments. Ms. Jasper left the meeting at 9:49 PM.

2. Historic Designated Properties with Code / Maintenance Violations

- a) Chairwoman Gurshman noted that 307 Franklin Place replaced front porch steps but the steps are not bull nosed.
- b) 850 Terrill Road (Lampkin House): Mr. Bauman reported that he is in the process of working with the Public Works Department on locating some dumpsters on site.

VIII. Adjournment

There being no further business, Mr. Michelson made a motion for adjournment, and seconded by Mr. Westlake the commission voted all in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 10:00 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,



Scott Bauman, AICP, PP
Principal Planner / HPC Secretary
Plainfield Planning Division
November 29, 2010

Minutes of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting
November 16, 2010, 7:30 PM, City Hall Library, 1st Floor, 515 Watchung Avenue, Plainfield, NJ

I. Open Public Meeting Statement

Chairwoman Sandy Gurshman called the November 16, 2010, regularly scheduled meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:37 PM and read the following into the record: *"This meeting has been duly advertised in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, 10:4-6 et seq. The annual schedule of board meetings has been published in the Courier-News newspaper. In addition, copies of the notice have been posted in the City Clerk and Planning Division offices. This is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Commission."*

Name, Class Designation (term expires)	1/26/10	3/23/10	4/27/10	5/25/10	6/22/10	7/27/10	8/24/10	9/28/10	11/16/10	12/14/10
Chairwoman Sandra Gurshman / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	
William Michelson, Esq. / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	
Lawrence Ferrara / Class C (1/1/2011)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X	X	X	X		
Patricia Turner Kavanaugh / Class C (1/1/2012)	X	X	X	X		X		X	X	
Elizabeth King / Class C (1/1/2013)		X	X	X						
Vice Chairman Reginald Thomas, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)		X	X			X		X	X	
David Westlake, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	
Bill Garrett / Class B (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X			
John Favazzo, RA / Class A (1/1/2014)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X	X	X	X	X	
Alternate #1 Jan Jasper / Class C (1/1/2011)	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	
Alternate #2 James Galvin, PE / (unexp. 1/1/2011)	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X	
HPC Consultant Gail Hunton	X	X	X	X		X	X	X		
HPC Secretary Scott Bauman, PP/AICP		X	X		X	X	X	X	X	

II. Adoption of the September 28, 2010, Regular Meeting Minutes

On a motion made by Mr. Michelson and seconded by Mr. Westlake, consideration of the adoption of the September 28, 2010 meeting minutes was carried to the December 16, 2010 meeting.

III. No Carried or New Certificate of Appropriateness Applications

IV. New Business

1. Review of the Draft Downtown Streetscape Design Manual

Chairwoman Gurshman provided the Commission with a brief background on the meetings she attended with the Planning Division which resulted in the creation of the draft downtown streetscape design manual. Ms. Hunton reviewed the draft but could not attend tonight's meeting so Chairwoman Gurshman read Ms. Hunton's email aloud and into the record:

Hi, I have a few comments on the streetscape manual, which I assume is a draft (?):

- The all-black bench is preferable - looks more long-wearing than the wood-slatted option.
- Has April reviewed the trees? Need the landscape architect's input. Likewise the tree guards.
- Of the street light options, I would choose the least ornate. The two styles with all the decorative scrolls, etc are too fancy and will be very expensive. A traditional but simpler style should be considered. Ask for more styles to review.
- Omit the planter - it's awful! It looks like a trash receptacle and will become one soon enough. It's always best to try to place plantings in the ground.
- Kiosks - I'm not sure where these kiosks would go. Does the City have specific intended locations for kiosks? It makes a difference which kiosk style is chosen. Again, simpler is better.
- Bollards - where are these going?

- Concrete pavers - the paver that looks very similar to real brick and is very elegant (I have used it on several projects) is made by EP Henry, Coventry Brick Stone, Strasburg Red. They are laid individually like brick but are more durable than brick.

Hope this helps.

Gail L. Hunton

Chairwoman Gurshman explained the location of the bollards, she said any concrete used for sidewalks and curbing will be tinted dark. There is an interest to eliminate the parking meters and instead install muni-meters (a centralized area to collect parking fees). A discussion ensued over North Avenue- the proposed parking loss, the location of pick up / drop off area.

Ms. Jasper recommended putting the draft document on the city's website for all to see. Mr. Bauman described the administrative procedures that would be necessary for the city to adopt the design manual in the ordinance. Mr. Galvin recommended using HADCO Bollards, looking into translucent trash cans for security reasons, and he commented that the North Avenue streetscape elements should tie into the train station. Mr. Galvin further commented that the brick pavers will settle and if they are used they should be laid on a concrete slab instead of a sand bed.

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public for comment. Carol Bicket of 1083 Hillside Avenue said in her experience with observing brick pavers, when they settle water collects in the low spots and it becomes a safety issue.

V. Discussion

1. HPC 09-23: 926 Putnam Avenue

Dwayne Wiggins of POB 5446, Somerset, NJ is the contractor for the owner of 926 Putnam Avenue. In January 2010 the HPC approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for improvements at 926 Putnam Avenue. Mr. Wiggins summarized the work that he has completed; the purpose of his visit is to request a change in the Certificate of Appropriateness- Mr. Wiggins wants permission to install hanging gutters rather than built in gutters and he would like to relocate the driveway.

A discussion ensued over the events that transpired at the January 26, 2010 Commission meeting. Mr. Bauman read aloud a portion of the January 26 meeting minutes. After considering the January meeting minutes and reviewing pictures of the house, the Commission determined that an error was made at the January hearing and that the applicant should be able to install hanging gutters; a personal site inspection by several members will help determine what type of hanging gutters will be permitted- K style or half round.

Chairwoman Gurshman changed topics by moving on to the next matter- the informal review of the proposed driveway relocation. Mr. Wiggins explained that there is a clean out pipe in the middle of the existing driveway; he discussed this pipe with the Public Works Department and the pipe cannot be relocated. Mr. Wiggins presented several scenarios for accommodating the parking. After further discussion Mr. Wiggins agreed to work with Mr. Bauman of the Planning Office to design a parking arrangement that does not require variances. Should the parking be seen from the public right of way, the Applicant would have to appear before the Commission for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

2. Historic Designated Properties with Code / Maintenance Violations

Mr. Bauman provided the Commission with an update on all of the properties the Commission is keeping track of:

- a) **808-814 Central Avenue "Abbott Manor"**: 12/14/10: Certificate of Appropriateness hearing for porch renovation.
- b) **957-963 Central Avenue / 308-326 Stelle Avenue "Coriell Mansion"**: In July 2010 the front porch was propped up, water damage observed. In September 2010 the city was informed that Wells Fargo is now responsible for maintaining the property

- c) **701-707 Dixie Lane / 723-729 Ravine Road:** In December 2009 the Planning Division informed the Applicant of the changes made to roof peaks over garage (mansard roof), and the addition of new window on first floor – these changes were not approved by the HPC. To date the Applicant has not responded to our repeated inquiries. Zoning Officer will request that the Construction Official pull the Certificate of Occupancy.
- d) **311-315 Franklin Place:** Certificate of Appropriateness issued for building restoration on July 28, 2009.
- e) **340-344 Franklin Place:** Referred to the HPC by the Zoning Board in September 2010. In October 2010 the Zoning Board granted a use variance and site plan approval. Applicant needs to come back to the HPC for a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- f) **187-191 North Avenue:** In April 2010 the building collapsed and it was demolished.
- g) **926-928 Putnam Avenue:** Certificate of Appropriateness issued on February 12, 2010. Amended on November 16 to include installation of half round gutters.
- h) **1113-1115 Putnam Avenue:** Cited by Inspections Division on April 22, 2010 for demolishing rear porch / fire escape. November 2010: ongoing email exchange about windows.
- i) **715 Ravine Road:** On September 21, 2010 the Division of Inspections referred structural violations to the Zoning Officer for his action
- j) **850 Terrill Road “Lampkin House”:** Upcoming court date of November 19, 2010.
- k) **822 Webster Place:** Certificate of Appropriateness issued on November 9, 2009.
- l) **313 West Ninth Street:** Decorative wall constructed without approval

Chairwoman Gurshman asked that 307 Franklin Place be added to the list- the owner replaced the front porch steps but the steps are not bull nosed.

3. Outreach & Education


Chairwoman Gurshman asked Mr. Favazzo for his insight on historic preservation outreach and education to the public. Mr. Favazzo said as a group the Commission needs to start talking about ways to reach out and educate the public. Get the public's feedback and have physical meetings with people in neighborhoods. Outreach did not happen before when it should have happened. Ms. Jasper said there is a need to increase public awareness of our mission. The public needs to explore our intent, and how individual homeowner's inquiries fit into the larger picture. Chairwoman Gurshman asked Mr. Favazzo if he was willing to participate in a subcommittee to address public outreach and education. Mr. Favazzo said he would participate; Ms. Jasper and Mr. Michelson also volunteered to assist.

Ms. Turner Kavanaugh mentioned that the Commission could submit outreach material to Mark Spivey's micro site. She heard that the Courier News received almost zero press releases from Plainfield- she takes this as a challenge.

VI. Adjournment

There being no further business, Mr. Michelson made a motion for adjournment, and seconded by Mr. Westlake the commission voted all in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 9:34 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,


 Scott Bauman, AICP, PP
 Principal Planner / HPC Secretary
 Plainfield Planning Division
 December 1, 2010

Minutes of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting
December 14, 2010, 7:30 PM, City Hall Library, 1st Floor, 515 Watchung Avenue, Plainfield, NJ

I. Open Public Meeting Statement

Chairwoman Sandy Gurshman called the December 14, 2010, regularly scheduled meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:40 PM and read the following into the record: *"This meeting has been duly advertised in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, 10:4-6 et seq. The annual schedule of board meetings has been published in the Courier-News newspaper. In addition, copies of the notice have been posted in the City Clerk and Planning Division offices. This is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Commission."*

Name, Class Designation (term expires)	1/26/10	3/23/10	4/27/10	5/25/10	6/22/10	7/27/10	8/24/10	9/28/10	11/16/10	12/14/10
Chairwoman Sandra Gurshman / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
William Michelson, Esq. / Class B (1/1/2011)	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Lawrence Ferrara / Class C (1/1/2011)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X	X	X	X		X
Patricia Turner Kavanaugh / Class C (1/1/2012)	X	X	X	X		X		X	X	
Elizabeth King / Class C (1/1/2013)		X	X	X						X
Vice Chairman Reginald Thomas, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)		X	X			X		X	X	
David Westlake, RA / Class A (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	X
Bill Garrett / Class B (1/1/2013)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X			
John Favazzo, RA / Class A (1/1/2014)	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X	X	X	X	X	
Alternate #1 Jan Jasper / Class C (1/1/2011)	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X
Alternate #2 James Galvin, PE / (unexp. 1/1/2011)	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	X	X	X
HPC Consultant Gail Hunton	X	X	X	X		X	X	X		X
HPC Secretary Scott Bauman, PP/AICP		X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X

II. Adoption of the September 28, and November 16, 2010, Regular Meeting Minutes

On a motion made by Mr. Michelson and seconded by Ms. King, the September 28, 2010 meeting minutes were adopted as amended; all in favor, none opposed.

On a motion made by Mr. Michelson and seconded by Mr. Westlake, the November 16, 2010 meeting minutes were adopted as amended; all in favor, none opposed.

III. Carried Certificate of Appropriateness Applications

- HPC 10-05; 501-511 Stelle Avenue / 900-910 Field Avenue; Block 754, Lot 6;
Van Wyck Brooks Historic District / Jonathan Payumo- Applicant & Owner**

Carried from the September 28, 2010 meeting: Applicant is requesting that the amendment to close the French doors on the 2nd story rotunda rather than replace the French doors with a curved window be carried to January 25, 2011.

IV. New Certificate of Appropriateness Applications

- HPC 10-08; Roadway Improvements on Watchung Avenue from East 7th Street to Hillside Avenue
Crescent Area, Putnam-Watchung, and Hillside Avenue Historic Districts**

Chairwoman Gurshman announced that most of the work has already been completed and this hearing is ex post facto. Jackie Fouche of Remington Vernick Engineers (City Engineer) apologized for coming to the Commission after the project was completed. The City needed to expend a CDBG grant before the end of the year. In the project area the bluestone curbing was reset, and broken bluestone curbing was replaced with new bluestone. In areas with no curbing new gray concrete curbing was used. Old slate sidewalks were reset, new slate was installed in the historic district area as well as new gray tinted concrete. The roadway was resurfaced and striped. A certified landscape architect visited the site to monitor the removal and pruning of street trees. Twenty trees were replaced.

Mr. Galvin asked Ms. Fouche when the project was advertised; Ms. Fouche replied July 15, 2010. Mr. Galvin asked why the City engineer couldn't come to the HPC between July and when work begun; Ms. Fouche said she

could not offer an explanation; she was not working for Remington Vernick at the time. Chairwoman Gurshman said Ms. Fouche was before the Planning Board with the same application for capital project review on November 16. Chairwoman Gurshman asked Ms. Fouche if there were any salvageable slates; Ms. Fouche responded that there were three slates and two or three bluestone curbs salvaged which are now in the public works yard. Ms. Hunton asked Ms. Fouche to confirm the presence of the salvaged slate sidewalk and curbs with the public works yard. Chairwoman Gurshman asked about driveway aprons; Ms. Fouche said they are gray concrete.

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting for public discussion, no one from the public commented. Chairwoman Gurshman thanked Ms. Fouche for her presentation.

**2. HPC 10-06; 801-807 Park Avenue / 100-104 Crescent Avenue; Block 828, Lot 1 (Corner Property)
Crescent Area Historic District; Lamont Gibson - Applicant & Owner**

Mr. Bauman informed the Commission that the Applicant has provided adequate notice to the property owners within 200 feet of the subject site and that the Commission has jurisdiction to hear this application. The Applicant Lamont Gibson (801 Park Avenue, Plainfield) is proposing to remove slate roof shingles and built-in gutters and install new 30 year Timberline asphalt shingles on the roof and new hanging gutters. Mr. Gibson introduced his contractor David Ellis of Allaico Construction, LLC, 1221 Salem Avenue, Hillside.

Mr. Michelson asked if there are problems with the built in gutters; Mr. Gibson said they were damaged beyond repair. Mr. Gibson distributed pictures depicting the existing condition of the roof and built in gutters. Mr. Galvin asked what warranted the Applicant ripping off the entire slate roof when it is just a few courses of slate near the gutters that are damaged. Mr. Ellis said the gutters are not repairable. Mr. Galvin asked if the gutters are damaged enough to justify removing the entire roof. Mr. Ellis said the roof is damaged all over. Mr. Galvin asked the applicant if he had contractors with slate roof experience look at his roof. Mr. Gibson said he met with several roofers and all agreed that the slates are brittle and cracked and are very difficult to patch or repair. Chairwoman Gurshman asked how much water is leaking from the flat roof versus the peaked roof. Mr. Westlake asked the Applicant if he had a chance to look at the underside of the roof inside the attic; Mr. Gibson said he did and observed wood slats and insulation. Mr. Gibson added that his contractor wants to re-sheath the roof. Chairwoman Gurshman asked about the plan for the flat roof; Mr. Ellis replied that the flat roof is in good condition but he plans to re-roof it with 8 rolls of torch down rubber membrane.

Mr. Gibson said he would love to keep the slate, but the 5 contractors he spoke with were unsure about repairing the slate- conditions can deteriorate once work begins. Mr. Galvin asked Mr. Gibson if any of the contractors he spoke with had slate roof experience; Mr. Gibson did not answer the question. Mr. Galvin pointed out areas on the roof that are in good shape and said he has more gutter, cornice, and trim issues than a roof issue. Mr. Galvin continued by saying there is some serious wood work needed to be fixed on the house; the roof is probably still good, the issues are with flashing up top, the slates look intact. Mr. Gibson said the slates that have fallen off the roof are very fragile. Mr. Galvin asked if the decorative flashing is copper; Mr. Gibson said he wasn't sure.

Ms. Jasper suggested all Commission members inspect the property; she is having trouble seeing the big picture. Mr. Michelson said there was no need and expressed a strong preference to keep and repair the Yankee gutters. Mr. Michelson said he supports keeping the historic materials and expressed preference for slate; the water caused damage to the roof is at the bottom and the eaves, not to the slates.

Chairwoman Gurshman said there are two issues to consider: 1) the applicant is asking to replace the Yankee gutters with hanging gutters, 2) the Applicant is requesting to change the roof material from slate to asphalt shingle. Mr. Gibson expressed concern in repairing the Yankee gutters- they have leaks and he said he would have to re-visit and do work two times. Chairwoman Gurshman asked if his roofing contractor is a wood worker too; Mr. Gibson responded that he was. Mr. Galvin asked Mr. Gibson how his contractor will do all of the wood work for \$3,500. Mr. Galvin commented that there are some areas of the roof that hanging gutters cant be installed. Chairwoman Gurshman said that hanging gutters would give the house a different look altogether. Mr. Galvin showed Mr. Gibson a picture of a Yankee gutter and demonstrated that there was no cornice to hang a gutter. Mr. Westlake said he cannot tell the condition of the roof by looking at the pictures- in the attic you can inspect the slates to see if they are spalling. Ms. Hunton said the slates look original to the house- about the 1870s. Mr. Gibson said his contractor recommends a three dimensional tab shingle and hanging gutters. Ms.

Hunton said a quality built-in gutter is more in character with the building. Ms. Hunton requested from the Applicant additional information on the ornamental and flashing materials.

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public. Rich Sudal of 313 Franklin Place said when he bought his house the shingles on his roof were half slate and half asphalt; he got two shingle experts and both agreed that the slate shingles surpassed their life expectancy. Mr. Sudol replaced all of his roof shingles with architectural Slateline shingles, he relined his built in gutters and rebuilt the soffits and cornice. The house would have looked very different with hanging gutters. Mr. Gibson's house is highly visible and it is important to pay attention to details. There is a seamless lining that contractors use to repair built in gutters- it is easy to maintain and it is less expensive to install.

Brian Merlin of 313 Franklin Place said most of the slate shingles in this area were originally harvested from Bangor, Pennsylvania. If he had to replace the slate roof on his house it would have been a six figure job, he would like to see the Commission approve Slateline shingles with built in gutters.

Mariam Shastri of 806 Third Place said she has been watching the roof of Mr. Gibson's house slowly fall apart over the last 10 years. She loves the house and noted that it has seen a lot of neglect. She cited her past experiences with roofers.

Mr. Gibson said he would like to go with Slateline shingles and is willing to entertain retaining the Yankee gutters. Chairwoman Gurshman stated the options to Mr. Gibson- the HPC could carry the application for a month, or issue a Certificate of Appropriateness with conditions telling him what he can do. Chairwoman asked the Commission members for a motion for a Certificate of Appropriateness; hearing none, Chairwoman asked the Commission if there was a sense to carry the application to the January meeting. Carol Bickett of 1083 Hillside Avenue asked how old the slate shingles are; Ms. Bickett and Ms. Shastri engaged in a dialog over the age of the slate shingles.

Ms. Jasper commented that the shingles may be salvageable but cost prohibitive, Mr. Westlake said roofs have a finite life span. Chairwoman Gurshman expressed a preference to have the Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness tonight with conditions, those conditions being sketches and a material list. Chairwoman Gurshman would hate to have the Applicant wait five weeks for the next meeting. Mr. Michelson made a motion granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for complete roof replacement with Slateline shingles and repairing the existing Yankee gutters, and the replacement / repair of the wood trim and cornice along with appropriate sketches and a list of product materials including flashing replacement and ridge caps with the exception of the chimney. Ms. King seconded the motion and it was passed unanimously by voice vote.

**3. HPC 10-07; 808-814 Central Avenue; Block 760, Lot 6; Van Wyck Brooks Historic District
William G. Burris, Jr.- Applicant; CPR Holdings- Owner**

Ms. Margaret Westfield of Westfield Architects & Preservation Consultants, 425 White Horse Pike, Haddon Heights, NJ is representing the owner. The owner's contractor William Burris of Burris Construction co., 1 East Main Street, Moorestown, NJ was present to answer questions. The Applicant's architect Ms. Westfield explained to the Commission that her client is proposing to rehabilitate the existing front porch which includes structural repairs, woodwork repairs, repair of steps and porch screening, and painting. Ms. Westfield is proposing to replace the porch columns; she passed around an original porch capital to show its design and state of deterioration. Mr. Galvin asked Ms. Westfield if she could cast the ornamentation on the capital; Ms. Westfield responded that she could but it would be costly. Ms. Westfield said she is proposing to replace a structural beam that can't be seen from the street- the new beam will be laminated and curved. Mr. Westlake asked Ms. Westfield if the porch screening is being replaced; Ms. Westfield responded that that the screening will remain intact for the duration of the porch rehabilitation project. Ms. Westfield added that the contractor will hang the front door properly and will replace stair treads where needed; the handicap access ramp will not be disturbed.

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public; hearing no public comment Chairwoman Gurshman asked the Commission for a motion. Mr. Westlake made a motion that the application be approved as presented; Mr. Galvin seconded the motion. All of the Commission members voted in favor of the motion with exception of William Michelson who abstained from voting.

V. Discussion

1. Bruce Singleterry of 249 Oakland Avenue, South Plainfield spoke on behalf of the Plainfield Christian Science Church located at 905 Prospect Avenue, Plainfield. Mr. Singleterry passed out pictures of the church building—each showing the 12x12 original wood sash, double hung windows. Mr. Singleterry explained that the windows are 4.5' wide x 10' high, they are made of wood and are original to the building which was built in the 1920s. Plexiglas storm windows were installed in the 1980s. The building is 20 to 40 feet from the sidewalk. Mr. Singleterry informed the Commission that his church is considering removing the original windows and replacing them with new vinyl, wood, or wood composition windows. Mr. Singleterry cited concerns regarding the thermal efficiency and maintaining the windows. His church is in the information gathering stage about potential window replacement. Ms. Hunton asked Mr. Singleterry about the condition of the windows; Mr. Singleterry said that the windows are well maintained and in good operating condition. Mr. Michelson asked Mr. Singleterry if the windows are openable and weather-stripped; Mr. Singleterry said the windows are openable and are fairly weather-tight. Ms. Hunton informed Mr. Singleterry that he is looking at a possible replacement cost of \$10,000 per window, which translates to a very long payback time to recover the replacement cost. Ms. Hunton recommended new tinted storm windows which would cost significantly less. Mr. Westlake recommended a good weather stripping called "Spring Bronze". After further discussion, Mr., Singleterry thanked the Commission for their time and he will keep the Commission updated on his research and proposal.

2. Historic Designated Properties with Code / Maintenance Violations

Mr. Bauman provided the Commission with an update on all of the properties the Commission is keeping track of:

- a) **808-814 Central Avenue "Abbott Manor"**: 12/14/10: Certificate of Appropriateness heard on 12/14/10 for porch renovation.
- b) **957-963 Central Avenue / 308-326 Stelle Avenue "Coriell Mansion"**: In July 2010 the front porch was propped up, water damage observed. In September 2010 the city was informed that Wells Fargo is now responsible for maintaining the property.
- c) **701-707 Dixie Lane / 723-729 Ravine Road**: In December 2009 the Planning Division informed the Applicant of the changes made to roof peaks over garage (mansard roof), and the addition of new window on first floor – these changes were not approved by the HPC. To date the Applicant has not responded to our repeated inquiries. Zoning Officer will request that the Construction Official pull the Certificate of Occupancy.
- d) **307 Franklin Place**: the owner replaced the front porch steps but the steps are not bull nosed.
- e) **311-315 Franklin Place**: Certificate of Appropriateness issued for building restoration on July 28, 2009.
- f) **340-344 Franklin Place**: Referred to the HPC by the Zoning Board in September 2010. In October 2010 the Zoning Board granted a use variance and site plan approval. Applicant needs to come back to the HPC for a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- g) **187-191 North Avenue**: In April 2010 the building collapsed and it was demolished.
- h) **926-928 Putnam Avenue**: Certificate of Appropriateness issued on February 12, 2010. Amended on November 16 to include installation of half round gutters.
- i) **1113-1115 Putnam Avenue**: Cited by Inspections Division on April 22, 2010 for demolishing rear porch / fire escape. November 2010: ongoing email exchange about windows.
- j) **715 Ravine Road**: On September 21, 2010 the Division of Inspections referred structural violations to the Zoning Officer for his action
- k) **850 Terrill Road "Lampkin House"**: Upcoming court date of January 7, 2011.

l) **822 Webster Place:** Certificate of Appropriateness issued on November 9, 2009.

m) **313 West Ninth Street:** Decorative wall constructed without approval

3. Outreach & Education

Chairwoman Gurshman asked Mr. Favazzo, Mr. Michelson, and Ms. Jasper to get together to discuss projects to present at the January 25 meeting.

VI. Adjournment

There being no further business, Mr. Michelson made a motion for adjournment, and seconded by Mr. Westlake, all voted in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 10:00 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "S. Bauman".

Scott Bauman, AICP, PP

Principal Planner / HPC Secretary

Plainfield Planning Division

Prepared January 13, 2011

Revised February 9, 2011 as per comments made by the HPC on January 25, 2011