



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES December 16, 2019

City Hall Council Chambers * 290 North 100 West Logan, UT 84321 * www.loganutah.org

The meeting of the Logan City Historic Preservation Committee convened in regular session on Monday, December 16, 2019. Chairman Lewis called the meeting to order at 12:00 p.m.

Committee Members Present: Gary Olsen, Thomas Graham, David Lewis, Christian Wilson, Keith Mott

Committee Members Excused: Amy Hochberg, Viola

Staff Members Present: Holly Daines, Paul Taylor, Mike DeSimone, Kymber Housley, Craig Carlston, Kirk Jensen, Russ Holley, Aaron Smith, Amanda Hovey, Tom Dickinsen, Paul Lindhardt, Bill Young

Minutes as written and recorded from the November 18, 2019 meeting were reviewed. Christian Wilson moved that the minutes be approved as submitted. Keith Mott seconded the motion. The motion was approved.

HPC 19-005 Emporium Demolition (Certificate of Appropriateness) Logan City Municipal Corp/Tom Dickinson, owner/authorized agent request demolition of 41, 45, 47, 55, 67 N Main Street in the Town Center 1 District (TC-1) zone; TIN 06-025-0011, -0009, 06-028-0016, -0015.

STAFF: Aaron Smith reviewed the history of the buildings and the previous plans reviewed in the last meeting. The new site plan shows a 5-story mixed-use building with commercial store front on the first floor along main street, residential apartments, and the public plaza with an ice rink, stage, and water feature. The Plaza design includes an entry feature that helps to frame the plaza to main street and lessen the impact of missing façade. Designs outside the demolition area include a 3 ½ story parking structure, commercial development along 100 West, surface parking, and residential development. There is a design alternative, Option B, that does not propose development outside the demolition space. Option B includes a 2-story commercial building and a smaller plaza.

PROPONENT: Corey Solum with Think Architecture talked about the plans and how they have been working to incorporate all elements from public comments.

Christian Wilson asked if they used internal or external sources to get the cost estimate for the project, and what the cost per square foot is. Cory said that currently they have only used internal sources for the cost, the commercial space is \$140.00 per square foot, and the residential is at \$120.00 to \$130.00 per square foot. These costs do not include parking or the plaza.

Holly Daines talked about the new proposal that was received and taking adequate time to consider it, and not start any demolition until Feb 20th.

Tom Dickinson talked about the cost estimates he has received to repair the building. The cost to repair the structural alone would be 3.6 to 4.7 million.

PUBLIC: Nancy Burr read a letter from Julie Hollist Terrill, director of the Cache Valley Visitors Bureau. (letter is part of the record)

Jon Jenkins read a letter from Tracy McKay, previous owner of the Emporium. (letter is part of the record) Also expressed his concern that a demo of this scale would destroy the fabric of the historic zone.

Gene Needham talked about remodeling the Emporium, bringing retail back into the old buildings and finding other areas for the apartments to go.

Debbie Miller asked the committee to keep Logan unique, special, and timeless.

Jason Jones talked about Logan's pioneer heritage, and not turning Logan into another nameless, faceless suburb with the exact same buildings.

Tony Johnson talked about purchasing and preserving the buildings and the cost involved to restore them. Also talked about the restoration of the bourdon lofts building.

Keith Schnare talked about the parking issue, the need for the parking structure and the need to bring people downtown.

George Daines asked the committee to enforce their rules and not approve the demolition for the city while they're still working on the plans. Went over the demolition standards, and how they are not being met. He also talked about his offer to purchase the building and restore it.

Cory Solum responded to some of the public comments regarding the plans.

Kymber Housley said that if the city was to restore the buildings, they would not just reestablish the building to the minimum standards. The building would meet the seismic standards to ensure that it is safe for the public.

COMMITTEE: Thomas Graham stated that he is uncomfortable with a hole in the façade and losing the two contributory buildings 41 & 67.

Keith Mott said as a citizen he likes the idea and thinks it will revitalize the downtown. As a member of this committee he is uncomfortable with the demo of two contributory buildings, especially where there are alternate proposals to purchase and restore the buildings.

Christian Wilson stated that he likes the direction the city wants to go. Concerned about the cost and that the projections may not be adequate. Said that he would like to see more costs estimates, and a bid made.

Gary Olsen said that something needs to be done downtown to compete with what is happening on the south end of town.

David Lewis said there is still room for discussion beyond what happens today. The city has received proposals that they are going to consider, but they are coming at the last minute. This has not been a last-minute project; the first public meeting was a year ago July. Historic preservation is about allowing people to change the structures that they own within certain parameters to make them livable, useful, and workable.

Thomas Graham stated that the committee needed to make a decision allowing the groups to start making plans for alternate proposals.

MOTION: Thomas Graham moved that the Historic Preservation Committee deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for HPC 19-005. Keith Mott seconded the motion.

Moved: Thomas Graham Seconded: Keith Mott **Passed: 4 - 1**

Yea: Mott, Wilson, Graham, Olsen Nay: Lewis Abstain:

HPC 19-007 Broadavis Renovation Broadavis LLC/Andrea McCulloch, owner/authorized agent request a renovation that includes a new entrance, street level lobby, façade changes, new elevator, and roof addition located primarily on the south façade of the building located at 160 N Main Street in the Town Center (TC) zone; TIN 06-018-0038.

STAFF: Aaron went over the proposed project to include a new street level entrance along Federal Avenue, a roof top addition, and the installation of an elevator. No changes are proposed along the Main Street façade of the building *1978 Survey for Historic Homes for Logan City*, found that it was “Contributory” to the district. The 1999 and 2011 Reconnaissance Level Surveys both gave the building a “B” evaluation.

PUBLIC: Helen Rigby expressed how she was in favor of the elevator adding easier access to the building.

MOTION: Thomas Graham moved that the Historic Preservation Committee **conditionally approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for HPC 19-007 as presented with the conditions for approval as listed below. Christian Wilson seconded the motion.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Any representations by the proponent at the Historic Preservation Committee hearing that is approved shall be incorporated into the final action as conditions of approval and recorded on the Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. All window that are visible from public streets shall match existing historic window color and design.
3. No synthetic materials, such as vinyl, may be used on exterior.
4. All new signage shall obtain a sign permit in accordance with the Land Development Code and Center Street Historic District prior to installation.
5. The proponent is responsible to ensure that any construction is appropriately permitted and inspected by the Building Safety Division through timely scheduled inspections.
6. Failure to comply with any conditions of approval shall void the permit and require a new Historic Preservation Committee hearing.

FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

1. The project complies with all requirements imposed by Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code.
2. The project is consistent with the objectives and purpose of the General Plan and Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code by helping to maintain the Town Center-1 (TC-1) zone as the central location for the community’s historic and cultural resources.
3. The project with not negatively impact the surrounding contributing structures inside the district.
4. The project substantially complies with standards outlined in the *Historic District Design Standards* and the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Reconstruction*.

Moved: Thomas Graham Seconded: Christian Wilson **Passed: 5 - 0**

Yea: Mott, Wilson, Graham, Olsen, Lewis

Nay:

Abstain

Meeting adjourned at 2:05 p.m.

Minutes approved as written for the Logan City Historic Preservation Committee meeting held on October 07, 2019.

Michael A. DeSimone
Community Development Director

David Lewis
Historic Preservation Committee Chairman

Amanda Hovey
Secretary II

