



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES November 2, 2020

City Hall Council Chambers * 290 North 100 West Logan, UT 84321 * www.loganutah.org

The meeting of the Logan City Historic Preservation Committee convened in regular session on Monday, November 2, 2020. Chairman Lewis called the meeting to order at 12:00 p.m.

Committee Members Present: Bronwyn O'Hara, Thomas Graham, David Lewis, Keith Mott, Christian Wilson, Gary Olsen, Amy Hochberg

Committee Members Excused: Gary Olsen,

Staff Members Present: Russ Holley, Tanya Rice, Mike DeSimone, Kirk Jensen, Holly Daines, Craig Carlston

Minutes as written and recorded from the September 8, 2020 meeting were reviewed. Thomas Graham moved that the minutes be approved as submitted. Keith Mott seconded the motion. The motion was approved.

HPC 20-004 Proposed Demolition of Thatcher Mill Ruin (Certificate of Appropriateness) BBI Land LLC/Mountain States Property Management, owner/authorized agent, are requesting a demo of the existing Thatcher Mill ruin. The proposal is to salvage and preserve some of the rock stones and any other mill remnants that can be found and re-construct them in a memorial plaza which would be built at the entrance to the new development. The stones will be utilized to create a stone plaza, wall remnant, memorial interpretive monument, bench seating, and landscaping rock features, and will be located at 74 West 100 South in the Town Center 1 District (TC-1) zone; TIN 02-046-0014.

STAFF: Russ Holley went over the project site, canal, and the history of the Thatcher Mill that was likely the largest in Utah in the early 1900s. The mill burned down in January of 1946 and was not re-built. The stone foundation ruin is all that remains today. Russ also went over the eight standards in the Center Street Historic District Design Standards that need to be met for demolition to be warranted.

Amy Hochberg asked about the location of the ruins on the site map for the new project. Russ said they are on the southwest corner of the first proposed building. David suggested a field trip may be in order, to see where exactly on the site the ruin sits.

PROPONENT: Paul Willie spoke about trying to memorialize and preserve some of the rock materials by recreating something new. Paul also talked about the site being too small to be able to both preserve and build on and how utilizing the rock material into a plaza is the best option.

PUBLIC: Michael Timmons spoke about bringing in different engineers and architects to offer other alternatives to preserve the site.

Todd Johnson spoke about the three mill sites in Logan and how they are an important part of the city's history. He talked about the city and the developer working together and hiring a consultant to determine some viable options.

Caroline Lavoie spoke about the importance of the canal staying at the street level and how it brings life to the city. She also talked about the canal at the high school and the effort they had to make to keep it there and make it safe.

Michael Timmons spoke about being able to stabilize the ruin and incorporating it into new modern architecture. He also talked about keeping the large water canal along the street with pedestrian bridges.

Holly Daines spoke about the cost of coming up with a new plan, the resources available to the city, and the future projects the city is currently working on. She also mentioned the future of the canals and the possibility that they may get covered by the canal companies.

Thomas Graham said that there is not enough information in the current plan. There should be more options reviewed to allow the public to understand the issues and know the right decision is being made.

Kae Lynn Beacher spoke about her family trying over the years to develop this property. As-is the property presents a huge liability, this project is the only option received, and the only alternative would be to put up a chain-link fence around it.

COMMITTEE: Thomas Graham said that he does not think the proponent meets the eight conditions for demolition. Keith said there is a lot more at the site. It is far more interesting than it looks from the street. No one seems interested because they do not know it is there. Amy said that every piece of history counts and that the historic committee should have been brought into this project sooner, during the initial planning phase. The committee is here to support this ruin. There are ways to preserve it without dismantling and moving it elsewhere. Bronwyn stated that this would be a good use of that corner and a great way to incorporate history. Christian said that without the needed resources, the current plan is the best option. David said he likes the idea of downtown housing but thinks there needs to be more time and better planning. Tom said that this can be done without costing a lot of money, they just need to take the time. Keith stated that conditions one, two, and eight have not been met. Amy said that number four is not consistent with the city's objective to preserve the historic integrity and bring tourism.

MOTION: Bronwyn O'Hara moved that the Historic Preservation Committee **conditionally approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for HPC 20-004 as presented with the conditions for approval. Christian Wilson seconded the motion.

Moved: Bronwyn O'Hara

Seconded: Christian Wilson

Failed: 2-4

Yea: Bronwyn, Christian

Nay: Thomas, David, Keith, Amy

Abstain:

There was a brief discussion on the eight conditions that need to be met and alternative motions that can be made.

REVISED MOTION: Thomas Graham moved that the Historic Preservation Committee **deny** a Certificate of Appropriateness for HPC 20-004 due to conditions one, two, three, four, and eight not being met. Keith Mott seconded the motion.

Moved: Thomas Graham

Seconded: Keith Mott

Passed: 4-2

Yea: Thomas, David, Keith, Amy

Nay: Bronwyn, Christian

Abstain:

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Any representations by the proponent at the Historic Preservation Committee hearing that is approved shall be incorporated into the final action as conditions of approval and recorded on the Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. The Historic Preservation Committee approves the demolition request based on the review and analysis of the eight demolition standards.
3. The proponent shall build the plaza, water feature and interpretive monument on-site as submitted. The monument signage content shall be reviewed and approved by City staff and state historic officials.
4. The proponent is responsible to ensure that any demolition is appropriately permitted and inspected by the Building Safety Division through timely scheduled inspections.
5. The proponent shall provide a Historic Record Report to the Community Development Department that encompasses the project site.
6. Failure to comply with any conditions of approval shall void the permit and require a new Historic Preservation Committee hearing.

FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

1. The project complies with all requirements imposed by Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code.
2. The project meets the eight criteria or standards for demolition listed in the Historic District Design Standards.
3. The project meets the stated goals for development in the Logan Downtown Specific Plan.
4. The legal and public noticing procedures were followed and the project process, including the public hearing and public meeting complies with code standards.

Discussion: Russ asked the committee their thoughts on moving the historic boundary line for the construction of the new building on this site, if this project does get an approval.

Meeting adjourned at 2:12 p.m.

Minutes approved as written for the Logan City Historic Preservation Committee meeting held on November 02, 2020.

Michael A. DeSimone
Community Development Director

David Lewis
Historic Preservation Committee Chairman

Amanda Hovey
Secretary III