



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES July 17, 2017

City Hall Council Chambers * 290 North 100 West Logan, UT 84321 * www.loganutah.org

The meeting of the Logan City Historic Preservation Committee convened in regular session on Monday, July 17, 2017. Chairman Lewis called the meeting to order at 12:00 p.m.

Committee Members Present: Viola Goodwin, Amy Hochberg, David Lewis, Keith Mott, Gary Olsen, Christian Wilson

Committee Members Excused: Tom Graham

Staff Members Present: Russ Holley, Amber Pollan, Debbie Zilles

Minutes as written and recorded from the July 3, 2017 meeting were reviewed. Ms. Hochberg moved that the minutes be approved as submitted. Ms. Goodwin seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

PUBLIC HEARING

HPC 17-003 Madden Porch, Doors & Paint – *continued from July 3, 2017* - Gregory J. Madden, authorized owner, requests to build a small porch to provide cover over the front door, a new front door will be installed with side lights and the existing siding will be primed and painted gray, shutters will be painted black at 120 North 200 West in the Neighborhood Residential-Historic District (NR6-HD) zone; 06-021-0011.

STAFF: Ms. Pollan reviewed the request for a facade modification including an expanded porch, a new front door with side lights and the existing siding and shutters will be repainted. Mr. Madden submitted a drawing that was presented to the Committee for review. The width of the front of the home is 35' and the proposed porch will be 10'. The design includes an arched design to allow for the reuse of the pediment element. The current columns will be removed, sidelights and new columns, similar in style, will be added.

PROPONENT: Carrie Madden advised that the porch will be short entry porch, likely not deeper than 4-5'. Ms. Pollan noted that the setback does allow for the porch extension. Mr. Olsen advised that the construction will be required to meet standard.

PUBLIC: Mark Goodwin asked if there would be access to the porch from the sides. Ms. Madden said there would only be stairs on the front portion.

COMMITTEE: Mr. Wilson said he appreciated the submitted drawing and thought it looked good.

Chairman Lewis complimented the door sidelights which added the historic square element.

MOTION: Mr. Olsen moved that the Historic Preservation Committee **conditionally approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for HPC 17-003 as presented with the conditions for approval as listed below. Ms. Goodwin seconded the motion.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Any representations by the proponent at the Historic Preservation Committee hearing that are approved shall be incorporated into the final action as conditions of approval and recorded on the Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. The porch and door modifications are approved as proposed.
3. Exterior lighting shall comply with the Land Development Code §17.37.090 and be down-lit concealed source type lighting.
4. The proponent is responsible to ensure that any construction is appropriately permitted and inspected by the Building Safety Division through timely scheduled inspections.
5. Failure to comply with any conditions of approval shall void the permit and require a new Historic Preservation Committee hearing.

FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

1. The project complies with all requirements imposed by Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code.
2. The project is consistent with the objectives and purpose of the General Plan and Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code by maintaining the area as a historic home in the Traditional Neighborhood Residential.
3. The building is considered a “B” evaluation in the 2011 Reconnaissance Level Surveys, and considered eligible and contributory to the historic district.
4. As conditioned, the new construction and materials share the same general features as the majority of the surrounding contributing structures and will therefore be compatible to the entire district.
5. The project substantially complies with standards outlined in the *Historic District Design Standards* and the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Reconstruction*.

Moved: Gary Olsen Seconded: Viola Goodwin **Passed: 5-0**

Yea: V. Goodwin, A. Hochberg, K. Mott, G. Olsen, C. Wilson Nay: Abstain:

Mr. Wilson recused himself from the Committee as he is the proponent on the project.

HPC 17-005 Historic Thatcher Bank Renovation Center Street Architects/Thatcher Building LLC, authorized agent/owner, request to restore the east and north facade to the original historic design located at 5 South Main in the Town Center-Historic District (TC-HD) zone; TIN 06-030-0022.

STAFF: Ms. Pollan reviewed the request for facade changes including replacing the Main Street entrance with a historic-style revolving door, adding a second entrance on Main Street and an entrance on Center Street. Canopies with historic detail will be added over the entrances. Stairwells are proposed in the right-of-way to provide access to the basement and window wells for additional lighting. There are 42” historic-style guardrails proposed around the stair and window well areas.

As this is a prominent and significant building in Logan’s downtown there are a number of historical photographs. The historic information shows that the existing Main Street entrance had a revolving door with large glass panels on either side. The proposal would restore a revolving door in this location. The illustrations indicate a dark metal finish and kick plate on the glass panels. The other Main Street entrance was for the Thatcher Bros Bank office. The plans and photos indicate that there was a neo-classical entry with pilasters on either side of the metal doors and a pediment. There was a row of transom windows above the door. The proposed doorway is fully consistent with the historic entrance, including matching stone and the addition of historic light fixtures and bracket details.

The Center Street facade originally had an entrance on the west end of the building. It included a simple commercial door with panel glass on either side and a metal kick plate. The proposal restores a doorway at this location in a storefront system that matches the original layout.

The proposed doorway locations, sizes, level of detail, and designs are appropriate and consistent with the original construction of the building. The original construction included an ornate metal awning over the revolving door. The awning had a chain support attached to the building. The proposal is to add a new entry canopy on the Main Street entrance and the Center Street entrance that matches the original design. The canopy will extend 8' from the building and be approximately 22' wide on Main and 18' wide on the Center Street entrance. The shape, style, and proportion will be consistent with the original and appropriate for the area.

The awning will impact some existing signage areas. There are some existing nonconforming cabinet signs that are intended to be removed and staff recommends that they be removed prior to building permits for work in this request being issued. Cabinet signage is no longer permitted and replacement signage could include individual lettered signage and perpendicular signs.

The Center Street side of the building did not originally have basement access. A stairwell and a window well area that extends into the sidewalk by 8' is being proposed. The Center Street sidewalk is approximately 13' wide and the 8' encroachment only leaves a 5' wide area. This 5' area includes a street light and would not meet the 5' minimum clear area required.

PROPONENT: George Daines said they are aware of the technical issues and concerns along Center Street and will continue to work through those. At this time, they would like to know if they should proceed with the proposal. He explained that there are rooms located underneath the north sidewalk (about 12' from the perimeter of the building) which have been there for over 100 years. The ceiling has had some leaking and they are not planning on opening that area entirely up and removing the sidewalk. The goal is to use 3-4' of that area and the window wells are proposed to allow for daylight into the basement. Center Street is a busy street with 4 lanes and the sidewalk cannot be pushed out too far. He explained that the original design east side of the building had a stairway going up the middle to the north, however, it was actually built from the corner to the south. There are still markings from the barber pole that was located on the corner. The landing, underneath the sidewalk, has been cinder blocked, however, he believes there is still a stairway there. There are windows all along the east wall of the building which will help provide daylight to the basement. One of the reasons for the request to open up the north side is for fire access to exit the northwest portion of the building. There is an exit from the southwest corner into The Owl. There is a portion of the building that goes underneath the alleyway to the south. The north side used to have a freight entrance with a slide access. The desire is to be consistent with the historic design. The proposed railings and marquee on the north façade were not originally there, however, the request is to add them to match the east facade. Future signage will be tenant driven. There may be a revolving door added to the east side, however, that may be dependent upon the interior layout.

Mr. Wilson advised that they have had a meeting with the Public Works Director and the Community Development Director on some of the specific requirements which will be handled by a civil engineer. The proposal, at this point, is conceptual. The technical details will be worked out.

PUBLIC: Mark Goodwin suggested moving the lamp post closer to the building for less impact in the right-of-way. Chairman Lewis said this will be determined by the Light & Power Department.

COMMITTEE: Ms. Pollan confirmed for Chairman Lewis that the Committee's charge is to determine the compatibility of the design. The right-of-way encroachment is a technical issue that will be handled by the Public Works Department.

Mr. Mott asked if the existing lamp post was the only nonconforming issue on Center Street. Ms. Pollan said there is also a garbage can which could easily be relocated if necessary.

Mr. Olsen asked about lighting on Center Street. Mr. Holley explained that the lamp posts were recently installed to triangulate along the street. Mr. Olsen suggested possibly relocating it between the window wells and stairway. Mr. Holley said it would be up to the Light & Power Department to adjust the public lighting. Ms. Goodwin asked if lights could be added on the building. Mr. Holley explained that the preference is for free-standing lights not mounted onto buildings.

Mr. Mott noted that narrowing the sidewalk could create a problem because that is quite a busy corner.

Mr. Olsen said the proposed railing on the north side enhances the building design. Ms. Hochberg agreed.

Ms. Goodwin likes the proposed railing and marquee because they are historic elements.

Chairman Lewis asked about the Wells Fargo sign on the top of the building. Mr. Holley explained that it is currently a legally existing nonconforming use (the Code was modified 20 years ago prohibiting rooftop signs) and can continue to exist as long as the use is not abandoned for 90 days or longer.

MOTION: Mr. Olsen moved that the Historic Preservation Committee **conditionally approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for HPC 17-005 as presented with the conditions for approval as listed below with strong encouragement for the addition of a historic revolving door. Mr. Mott seconded the motion.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Any representations by the proponent at the Historic Preservation Committee hearing that are approved shall be incorporated into the final action as conditions of approval and recorded on the Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. The proposal, with the reintroduction of doorways and awnings, is appropriate as presented.
3. Architectural details and new facade materials are approved as proposed. All metal finishes shall be dark metal, such as a bronze or copper, consistent with existing and original materials.
4. The existing, nonconforming cabinet signage on the facade will be removed prior to any building permits for work included in this Certificate. New signage shall obtain a sign permit prior to installation.
5. A right-of-way encroachment permit is required for awnings, stairwells, and window wells extending into the right-of-way. A minimum of 5' of clear area sidewalk is required.
6. The proponent is responsible to ensure that any construction is appropriately permitted and inspected by the Building Safety Division through timely scheduled inspections.
7. Failure to comply with any conditions of approval shall void the permit and require a new Historic Preservation Committee hearing.

FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

1. The project complies with all requirements imposed by Logan Municipal Code Title 17.
2. The project is consistent with the objectives and purpose of the General Plan and Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code by helping to maintain the Town Center (TC) zone as the central location for the community's historic and cultural resources.
3. The building is considered a "A" evaluation in the 2011, 1999, and 1978 Reconnaissance Level Surveys, and is considered eligible and significant to the historic district.
4. The modifications are consistent with restoration of historic details and design of the building.
5. The new construction and materials share the same general features as the majority of the surrounding contributing structures and will therefore be compatible to the entire district.
6. The project substantially complies with standards outlined in the *Historic District Design Standards* and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Reconstruction*.

Moved: Gary Olsen Seconded: Keith Mott **Passed: 4-0**
Yea: V. Goodwin, A. Hochberg, K. Mott, G. Olsen Nay: Abstain:

WORKSHOP ITEM FOR August 7, 2017 Meeting:

- ✓ HPC 17-006 Arimo Building Restoration

OTHER BUSINESS

Zions Bank ATM update. Mr. Holley informed the Committee that a requested sign permit from the bank has been delayed until the approved adjustments to the exterior ATM are completed. Mr. Holley said he has been advised that they have a contractor working on it.

Library. Ms. Pollan advised that the Library Steering Committee is considering sites other than the Emporium building. When a decision on the Emporium building is made, any changes or renovations will come through the Historic Preservation process.

Resolution 17-27 for Designation of a Historic Theatre District. Mr. Holley advised that the Municipal Council will be discussing this resolution at the July 19, 2017 meeting which will designate the block bounded by Center Street and 100 South and Main Street and 100 West as the Logan City Historic Theatre District and endorses the district's goals of economic vitality and enhancing community life through participation in cultural experiences unique to the community.

Historic District Design Standards (HDDS) update. The final draft of the update should be completed in a few weeks. The steering committee has suggested holding an open house on the changes to receive public feedback. Ms. Pollan will continue to update the Committee on the progress and timeline.

Meeting adjourned at 1:05 p.m.

Minutes approved as written and digitally recorded at the Logan City Historic Preservation Committee meeting of July 17, 2017.

Michael A. DeSimone
Community Development Director

David Lewis
Historic Preservation Committee Chairman

Russ Holley
Senior Planner

Amber Pollan
Senior Planner

Debbie Zilles
Administrative Assistant