



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES July 15, 2019

City Hall Council Chambers * 290 North 100 West Logan, UT 84321 * www.loganutah.org

The meeting of the Logan City Historic Preservation Committee convened in regular session on Monday, July 15, 2019. Chairman Lewis called the meeting to order at 12:00 p.m.

Committee Members Present: Amy Hochberg, David Lewis, Keith Mott, Gary Olsen

Committee Members Excused: Thomas Graham, Christian Wilson, Viola Goodwin

Staff Members Present: Aaron Smith, Russ Holley, Mike DeSimone, Debbie Zilles, Amanda Hovey

Minutes as written and recorded from the April 15, 2019 meeting were reviewed. Mr. Olsen moved that the minutes be approved as submitted. Mr. Mott seconded the motion. The motion was approved.

HPC 19-004 Budge Building Exterior Façade Renovation (Certificate of Appropriateness) Davis Bros. LLC/Andrea McCulloch, authorized agent/owner, request a facade renovation to include painting the existing façade with a more timeless color palette. In addition, recap the metal roof, replace all the external light fixtures and place new fabric awnings over the appropriate windows. The south portico would be updated with historic signage and the bay window would have a newly clad copper roof located at 11 West Center in the Town Center (TC-HD) zone; TIN 06-025-0004

STAFF: Mr. Smith reviewed the Budge Building façade renovation at 11 W Center. The project is to repaint the existing stucco a medium grey color, remove some of the stucco embellishments on the second floor, recap the metal roof, replace exterior light fixtures, replace awning with a black fabric, update the south portico with new signage, install a new copper roof on bay window, replace/repair trim along top of the bay window, existing brick will be cleaned and preserved, second floor detailing above the windows will have a pre cast concrete appearance. The proposed color palette is to create a more complimentary color scheme for the building and the historic district. The proposed cosmetic improvements do not negatively impact historic elements of the building

The building was built in 1892 by Charles Nibley for one of his wives, it was rented as a retail building for income for her. Prominent features of the building's design include a large second floor bay window on the southeast corner, and arch detailing around the second-floor windows. Historic photographs of the building during the early 20th century show a red brick masonry building with a contrasting bay window and prominent arch detailing. The first story features awnings with signs located above the awnings.

The buildings masonry was painted sometime before the exterior renovation in 1998, the building was painted cream white with green/grey accents. At that time, the first floor Main Street frontage had stucco. In 1998, following review by the HPC and Planning Commission, stucco was approved and installed on the second floor.

The application of stucco covered the painted brick. The conversation at that time centered around cost for full restoration, and the need to have a more long-term solution for the facade. The portico over the entrance to Northern Title was constructed at that time as well. The brick on the first floor of the south façade was restored.

The 1978 Historic Survey describes the building as well preserved, and the condition as good, and the integrity of the building as unaltered and contributory to the district. The 1999 and 2011 Historic Survey's noted the stucco and the building was given a B evaluation.

The lighting should be a simple design that is compatible with the character defining features of the building. Replacements should be limited to only materials that are damaged beyond repair and should match the original. Do not paint surfaces that were not originally painted.

Mr. Mott asked if the stucco applied in 1998 was the only stucco being removed. Mr. Smith said yes

PROPONENT: Andrea McCulloch, the project architect, explained that the Davis brothers purchased the building in the 1990's. When they beautified the building in 1998, their intentions were to improve what had already been covered up, so we had no way of knowing how bad the condition of that was. Before they did the stucco in 1998 they had made a significant attempt to get back to the brick and they found that it was a very soft, non-resilient brick so that's when they ended up moving towards the stucco. Both Jay and Paul have a love for the building, they love the historic peace that's there. What we're looking to do is soften some of those then trending colors from 1998 and bring them back down to a more historic palette. Going with the tone on tone grey, highlighting all the cornice pieces across the top, and removing the little circular motif that was brought in will elevate the prominence and the attractiveness of the building. On the bay window in the corner of the building, the damage on the crown molding, and even the metal itself doesn't give it the "pop" that we are looking to give it. To retrieve that, we will weigh the pros and cons between doing a re-milled wood product that will go underneath so it can have that historic look to it, versus the seamless metal option that is under there. We would be interested to hear Gary's opinions on that, as far as what would be the most resilient material to use. Mr. Olson said that there is sheeting that is available that molds just like wood. Mr. Olson asked if it was going to be a copper roof. Andrea said that they want to go with a copper that has already aged, so not to be a green color. Mr. Olson asked if this was going to be a standing seam. Andrea said No

PUBLIC: None

COMMITTEE: Mr. Lewis said it maintains the basic features. Mr. Olson said the focal point on the building is the bay window, and it needs to be done correctly.

MOTION: Mr. Mott moved that the Historic Preservation Committee **conditionally approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for HPC 19-004 as presented with the conditions for approval as listed below. Mr. Olson seconded the motion.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Any representations by the proponent at the Historic Preservation Committee hearing that is approved shall be incorporated into the final action as conditions of approval and recorded on the Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. No historic masonry or unaltered historic features may be painted.
3. No synthetic materials, such as vinyl, may be used to replace trim or other detailing.
4. Repair or replacement of trim details that is damaged or deteriorated beyond repair shall match the original in scale, material, design, color and texture.
5. All new signage shall obtain a sign permit in accordance with the Land Development Code and Center Street Historic District prior to installation.
6. The proponent is responsible to ensure that any construction is appropriately permitted and inspected by the Building Safety Division through timely scheduled inspections.
7. Failure to comply with any conditions of approval shall void the permit and require a new Historic Preservation Committee hearing.

FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

1. The project complies with all requirements imposed by Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code.
2. The project is consistent with the objectives and purpose of the General Plan and Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code by helping to maintain the Town Center (TC) zone as the central location for the community's historic and cultural resources.
3. The conditioned project will help to improve the contributory status of the building.
4. As conditioned, the project will not negatively impact the surrounding contributing structures inside the district.
5. The project substantially complies with standards outlined in the *Historic District Design Standards* and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Reconstruction*.

Moved: K. Mott Seconded: G. Olson **Passed: 4-0**
Yea: Hochberg, Lewis, Mott, Olsen Nay: Abstain:

Meeting adjourned at 12:24 p.m.

Minutes approved as written for the Logan City Historic Preservation Committee meeting held on July 15, 2019.

Michael A. DeSimone
Community Development Director

David Lewis
Historic Preservation Committee Chairman

Amanda Hovey
Secretary II

