



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES April 15, 2019

City Hall Council Chambers * 290 North 100 West Logan, UT 84321 * www.loganutah.org

The meeting of the Logan City Historic Preservation Committee convened in regular session on Tuesday, April 15, 2019. Chairman Lewis called the meeting to order at 12:00 p.m.

Committee Members Present: Amy Hochberg, Thomas Graham, David Lewis, Keith Mott, Gary Olsen, Christian Wilson

Committee Members Excused: Viola Goodwin

Staff Members Present: Aaron Smith, Paul Taylor, Debbie Zilles, Tom Dickinson

Minutes as written and recorded from the March 4, 2019 meeting were reviewed. Mr. Graham moved that the minutes be approved as submitted. Mr. Mott seconded the motion. The motion was approved.

HPC 19-003 Ellen Eccles Theater Facade Renovation (Certificate of Appropriateness) Cache Valley Center for the Arts (Wendi Hassan)/Logan City, authorized agent/owner, request a facade renovation to include removal of existing architectural detail that is falling off, repainting of existing brick, adding new low-maintenance trim above the lower windows, removing old column details and replacing with new low-maintenance polyurethane pilasters and columns, add gold leaf to the existing and new medallions and add new granite kick plate and column bases located at 43 South Main in the Town Center (TC-HD) zone; TIN 06-030-0033;-0030.

Mr. Wilson excused himself from the Committee because his is involved with this project.

STAFF: Mr. Smith reviewed the request to remodel the exterior facade to include removal of existing architectural details that are falling off, repainting the existing painted brick from a pale gray to a brick red, add new low maintenance metal trim above lower windows, replace old columns and pilasters with new low-maintenance polyurethane columns and pilasters, add gold leaf to the existing medallions, add new granite kickplate and column bases, and replace signage

This project impacts both 43 South Main and 37 South Main. The two buildings house the Ellen Eccles Theatre, Cache Center for the Arts, and the Bullen Center. The two buildings, while historically separate, have a shared facade. The entrance to Ellen Eccles Theatre includes a marquee that projects approximately 17' from the building facade. The properties have a total area of approximately 0.5 acres.

As the facade was extensively renovated during the 1990's, this proposal does not affect historic elements of the building. New paint is appropriate, as the brick is already painted. The proposed paint color more closely aligns with the original brick color. The metal window trim would replace a non-historic ornate trim, but will match existing trim materials. The replacement of the columns and pilasters with polyurethane is not permitted in the Historic District as synthetic materials are prohibited. The current columns and pilasters are a poly-blend and plaster-blend material. The columns at the front of the marquee include metal embellishments.

PROPONENT: Christian Wilson, the project architect, explained that the Cache Valley Center for the Arts (CVCA) received donated funds and have been working on interior remodeling. They would now like to do some exterior renovations. The facade was restored in 1993 by Newell Daines, however, some areas have deteriorated over time. The proposal includes a stone kickplate, cleaning up and reinforce the columns on the front entryway with a fiberglass material that holds the shape and lasts longer than wood. Marble would be cost prohibitive. The objective is to make it more maintainable and more durable. Some of the seals will be fixed, repaint the brick and add decorative elements to the upper portion of the building.

Wendi Hassan, CVCA Director, said the proposal is to replace the non-traditional material on the columns with a non-traditional material so that it can be better maintained. The brick that has deteriorated will be repaired and repainted. The community choice for the color of the facade was red.

Brandon Pierce, the Facility Manage of CVCA, has assessed the deterioration over the last 26 years and there is water damage, cracking paint, and warped window seals which allow for a free flow of air and moisture. The current columns are made of three pieces and the issue is with the ornamentation at the top potentially falling, replacing them with a one-piece column will result in less possible failure points. The proposed material is much better than what is currently there.

PUBLIC: None

COMMITTEE: Mr. Graham asked about the gold elements. Mr. Smith said most of the medallions are existing (have been painted over) with a few that will be added.

Mr. Wilson confirmed for Chairman Lewis that the gold decorative elements will be specifically outlined in the construction documents.

Chairman Lewis asked if there was any water damage to the brick that has been painted. Mr. Olsen said part of the problem with the brick is that in 1993 many areas of brick had pulled away and were replaced by different colored brick, therefore necessitating the need for repainting rather than stripping it down to the original.

Mr. Wilson clarified for Mr. Mott that the proposed polyurethane foam would extend to the stone kickplate.

Mr. Olsen said the synthetic material being proposed is the only option other than stone or metal (both which would be too expensive and too heavy). Tile on some of the other buildings is starting to deteriorate, whereas, this proposed high-density material will work much better. The material does not look synthetic but will help maintain the historic design of the building.

Mr. Mott said the updated standards are meant to prevent using materials that do not look historic, however, this provides a good approximation to the original material.

Mr. Smith said that under Section 9.8 of the Historic Design Standards regarding Materials & Finishes it reads "*Synthetic or substitute materials, such as vinyl, are prohibited*", which is quite broad and require interpretation. Mr. Graham said each project should be reviewed on a case-by-case basis.

Chairman Lewis said the cornices over the windows are historic, he has no problem with the proposed paint color of red, it will blend in with other buildings in the area and will help draw attention to the theater.

MOTION: Mr. Olsen moved that the Historic Preservation Committee **conditionally approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for HPC 19-003 as presented with the conditions for approval as listed below. Mr. Mott seconded the motion.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Any representations by the proponent at the Historic Preservation Committee hearing that are approved shall be incorporated into the final action as conditions of approval and recorded on the Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Replacement for columns and pilasters with a synthetic material, as proposed, may use used.
3. Architectural detailing on the facade or marquee with a synthetic material, as proposed, may be used.
4. All new signage shall obtain a sign permit in accordance with the Land Development Code and Center Street Historic District prior to installation.
5. The proponent is responsible to ensure that any construction is appropriately permitted and inspected by the Building Safety Division through timely scheduled inspections.
6. Failure to comply with any conditions of approval shall void the permit and require a new Historic Preservation Committee hearing.

FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

1. The project complies with all requirements imposed by Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code.
2. The project is consistent with the objectives and purpose of the General Plan and Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code by helping to maintain the Town Center (TC) zone as the central location for the community's historic and cultural resources.
3. The conditioned project will help to improve the contributory status of the building.
4. As conditioned, the project with not negatively impact the surrounding contributing structures inside the district.
5. The project substantially complies with standards outlined in the *Historic District Design Standards* and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Reconstruction*.

Moved: C. Wilson Seconded: T. Graham Passed: 5-0
Yea: Hochberg, Graham, Lewis, Mott, Olsen Nay: Abstain:

Center Street Update Redesign and Arch

Mr. Smith introduced the plan to redesign Center Street from Main to 100 West to help create a downtown usable space midblock crossings, benches and green space areas. An archway over the road is also being explored.

Tom Dickinson, the Assistant City Engineer and the project manager of this project, explained that a special assessment area was established and finalized in September 2018, which assessed a special tax to all the property owners along this street, equaling \$325,000, which is funding the project.

Some of the goals are to create a unique and inviting ambiance to the area, improve pedestrian mobility and access, relocate and reuse some of the decorative lighting that is in place and incorporate a prominent archway (showed an example of what is being considered). The project has included extensive interaction with the stakeholders on how to achieve the objectives. Parking was reduced by six stalls and the road was narrowed, which will help slow traffic. The idea is to make this area more attractive for pedestrians. A traffic analysis was done to review queuing and the impacts during peak hours.

Mr. Graham said he likes the concept, but the arch scale seems much too big for the area, especially with backlit lettering and the road being narrowed.

Ms. Hochberg said the black color really stands out and doesn't fit with the character of the street. Mr. Wilson said it is more of a bronzed metal color.

Mr. Dickinson said the general design concept is being finalized so that it can be included in the bid document so changes can still be made. He thanked the Committee for their input.

Meeting adjourned at 12:54 p.m.

Minutes approved as written for the Logan City Historic Preservation Committee meeting held on April 15, 2019.

Michael A. DeSimone
Community Development Director

David Lewis
Historic Preservation Committee Chairman

Debbie Zilles
Administrative Assistant

