
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES February 6, 2017

City Hall Council Chambers * 290 North 100 West Logan, UT 84321 * www.loganutah.org

The meeting of the Logan City Historic Preservation Committee convened in regular session on Monday, February 6, 2017. Chairman Lewis called the meeting to order at 12:00 p.m.

Committee Members Present: Viola Goodwin, Amy Hochberg, David Lewis, Keith Mott, Gary Olsen, Christian Wilson, Gene Needham (Council liaison)

Committee Members Excused: Tom Graham

Staff Members Present: Mike DeSimone, Russ Holley, Amber Pollan, Debbie Zilles, Paul Taylor

Minutes as written and recorded from the December 5, 2016 meeting were reviewed. Ms. Hochberg moved that the minutes be approved as submitted. Mr. Olsen seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

Mr. Wilson recused himself prior to the public hearing for HPC 17-001 because he is the proponent of the project.

PUBLIC HEARING

HPC 17-001 Larsen Facade Remodel Center Street Architects/Larsen Family Holdings, authorized agent/owner request to renovate the north, west and south facades of the existing Auto Parts store located at 48 North 100 West in the Town Center-Historic District (TC-HD) zone; TIN 06-026-0008.

STAFF: Ms. Holley reviewed the project. The property is approximately 0.16 acres (6,970 SF) with an existing single-story commercial building fronting 100 West and a small landscaped front yard. The property has no private vehicular access from the street or on-site parking stalls. Logan City has a large public parking lot directly north of this property that serves the majority of the vehicular patrons to the commercial businesses on this block. The flat-roofed building built in 1943, is painted concrete block with store-front windows and the main entrance on the west facade. The side and rear facades are primarily blank, with the exception of garage roll-up doors and service entrances. The approximate eastern (rear) third of the building is owned by the neighboring Anderson Seed store and used for business storage. The proposal is for a facade remodel that includes an outer coat of stucco, horizontal metal siding accents, exposed steel beams and new color schemes.

The proposed renovation includes placing new materials over older existing materials. HDDS CC-6 encourages brick as the primary material and exterior materials should be compatible with and enhance existing historic facades. The use of stucco could be considered compatible with buildings in the vicinity, as many contain portions of stucco. The proposed accent horizontal metal siding, especially when used for architectural articulation as opposed to trim, is uncommon in the historic district. Exposed steel beams are typically associated with mid-century modern architecture. Although constructed in that era, this building does not currently contain mid-century modern design features, and should be considered as new construction rather than historic preservation.

PROPONENT: Christian Wilson provided a brief history of the building and explained that the goal is to improve the exterior appearance. The applicant believes this proposal is an affordable upgrade. Mr. Wilson advised that the box-shaped building lends itself to a mid-century modern design. The windows will be kept and a framed (wood or steel element) pop out area will be added which will help add interest and create depth. The trellis will run parallel to the angled portion.

Kris Larsen said he has owned the building for a long time and it is in need of repair.

PUBLIC: None

COMMITTEE: Ms. Goodwin asked about the plat map. Chairman Lewis noted that a corrected map was emailed to the Committee prior to the meeting. Mr. Holley highlighted the location on the slide.

Chairman Lewis pointed out that staff has encouraged to the Committee to consider this request as “new construction” and debate the appropriateness of the proposed materials.

Mr. Olsen suggested brick instead of plaster, which is what has been encouraged in the historic district. Mr. Holley noted that quite a bit of stucco, which is considered under the umbrella of masonry materials, has been allowed in the district.

Chairman Lewis asked if the Committee could dictate what material should be used on the exterior since there is currently stucco there. Mr. Holley advised that the proposal is for new stucco, which would be maintenance of the existing material. Mr. Olsen said it will be a vast improvement.

Mr. Mott asked about the choice for metal instead of a canvas awning; the metal seems to stand out. Mr. Wilson explained that it is not awning but more of a framed entry. Mr. Olsen noted that the same look could be achieved with another masonry material. Mr. Wilson agreed that hardie board could be used as well.

Mr. Wilson assured Mr. Mott that the accent color will be appropriate and not too bold.

Mr. Olsen asked if it would be aluminum siding. Mr. Wilson said that commercial-grade metal siding will be used.

Chairman Lewis noted that this proposal has many of the same features as the Bishop’s Storehouse project. Mr. Wilson agreed that there are many similarities.

Chairman Lewis said he understands that there may be some concerns regarding the metal material, however, this proposal looks good and offers an argument for a mid-century modern aesthetic.

Mr. Wilson advised that cleaning up the stucco is a very affordable option. A smoother texture can be achieved. The metal trellis and colored element will be long-lasting and will not require much maintenance.

Mr. Olsen asked if there was a sample of the metal material being proposed. Mr. Wilson said that will be further refined as the project moves forward, at this point they are asking for approval to begin investing in improvements to the building.

Ms. Goodwin said the proposal is a bit modern, she is not sure how historic it will look, however it is a great improvement. Mr. Mott agreed that this will be a good improvement.

MOTION: Ms. Hochberg moved that the Historic Preservation Committee conditionally approve a Certificate of Appropriateness as outlined in HPC 17-001 with the conditions of approval as listed below. Mr. Olsen seconded the motion.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Any representations by the proponent at the Historic Preservation Committee hearing that is approved shall be incorporated into the final action as conditions of approval and recorded on the Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. The Historic Preservation Committee accepts the project materials as proposed.
3. The landscaping and pedestrian sidewalk shall be retained or replanted after construction.
4. Any signage changes shall receive an approved sign permit prior to installation.
5. The proponent is responsible to ensure that any construction is appropriately permitted and inspected by the Building Safety Division through timely scheduled inspections.
6. Failure to comply with any conditions of approval shall void the permit and require a new Historic Preservation Committee hearing.

FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

1. The project complies with all requirements imposed by Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code.
2. The project is consistent with the objectives and purpose of the General Plan and Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code by helping to maintain the Town Center (TC) zone as the central location for the community's historic and cultural resources.
3. The building is considered a "B" evaluation in the 2011 Reconnaissance Level Surveys, and considered eligible and contributory to the historic district.
4. As conditioned, the new design, construction and materials share the same general features as the majority of the surrounding contributing structures and will therefore be compatible to the entire district.
5. The project substantially complies with standards outlined in the *Historic District Design Standards* and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Reconstruction*.

Moved: Amy Hochberg Seconded: Gary Olsen **Passed: 4-0**
Yea: V. Goodwin, A. Hochberg, K. Mott, G. Olsen Nay: Abstain:

Mr. Wilson rejoined the Committee.

Review of HPC 16-005 Zions Bank Remodel

This project was approved at the August 15, 2016 meeting for an exterior facade remodel of the west elevation with the conditions of approval as listed below:

1. Any representations by the proponent at the Historic Preservation Committee hearing that are approved shall be incorporated into the final action as conditions of approval and recorded on the Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. The Historic Preservation Committee accepts the proposal as resubmitted, with the additional code-required egress door on the east facade near the northeast corner of the building.
3. The ATM shall have spandrel glass that closely matches the surrounding windows and the kick-plate and lower pre-cast foundation shall closely match the horizontal lines on both sides. The ATM and kick-plate area can be flush or slightly recessed as per code functionality requirements.
4. Any new signage requires a separate sign permit to be issued by the Community Development Department.
5. The proponent is responsible to ensure that any construction is appropriately permitted and inspected by the Building Safety Division through timely scheduled inspections.
6. Failure to comply with any conditions of approval shall void the permit and require a new Historic Preservation Committee hearing.

The Community Development Department issued a building permit with the exterior ATM portion of the project in accordance with the conditional approval (condition #3) by the Historic Preservation Committee. The construction of the project did not follow these plans and was built in a different manner. The applicant is requesting that the Committee review and accept the constructed alternative.

Mr. Mott asked if there was any practical or security reason for the change to the original approval. Mr. Holley said it was the result of miscommunication between the applicant and the contractor.

Ms. Goodwin asked if the step on the bottom portion would allow for wheelchair accessibility. Mr. Holley said it should meet all ADA requirements.

Chairman Lewis noted that the idea of spandrel glass was supposed to help the ATM area blend in with the building.

PROPONENT: Jared Larson, the project architect, explained that there was some miscommunication, as well as decisions made to comply with FDIC deadlines, which resulted in a change from the approved design. During the installation process there were some conditions with the interior construction which shifted the ATM to the north 6-7" which made it impossible to align with the existing exterior mullions. Three design option illustrations were distributed to the Committee for review. Some of the ideas included carrying the kick plate around, a sheet metal being used to mimic an opening, and adding control joints on either side of the ATM to break up the panel.

Paul Poorte, representing Zions Bank, noted that a horizontal line could be added, however, there would be gap on either side of the night drop and the ATM. Mr. Olsen pointed out that Cache Valley Bank (located across the street) is made of steel which can be slid in and out. Mr. Poorte said the back part of the head of the AMT needs to be a flat surface, which will result in an approximate 2" gap from each side for accessibility.

COMMITTEE: Chairman Lewis asked if it would be possible to put in glass around the ATM to create the look of a window, which would help the area blend in. Mr. Larson explained that the scored line does not align with the existing mullions, it would be offset on both sides, which would likely call more attention to the fact that it does not line up.

Mr. Olsen said that visually there is just a big slab of plaster without any element lines. Mr. Larson said there is no doubt that that what is there was not what was approved, the question is how to proceed from this point.

Mr. Mott asked if it would be possible to carry the horizontal precast line across and make the upper portion darker. The fact that the entire area is one solid color is troubling. Mr. Larson said the request for the lower band would be possible.

Chairman Lewis said the important issue is to provide a visual break. Mr. Larson showed an illustration of the addition of a dark sheet metal.

MOTION: Mr. Olsen moved that the Historic Preservation Committee conditionally approve a Certificate of Appropriateness as outlined in the discussion with the addition of a dark material to a provide horizontal breakup. Mr. Mott seconded the motion.

Moved: Gary Olsen **Seconded:** Keith Mott **Passed:** 5-0

Yea: V. Goodwin, A. Hochberg, K. Mott, G. Olsen, C. Wilson **Nay:** **Abstain:**

OTHER BUSINESS

Chairman Lewis asked for an update on the Historic District Design Standards review. Mr. Holley advised that final redlines have been sent to the consultant and there will a draft for the Committee to review at the next scheduled meeting.

Chairman Lewis asked who ensures that the conditions of approval for a project are met. Mr. Holley explained the process and advised that if something is found to be incorrect it will be brought back before the Committee to review and approve any changes.

Meeting adjourned at 1:15 p.m.

Minutes approved as written and digitally recorded at the Logan City Historic Preservation Committee meeting of February 6, 2017.

Michael A. DeSimone
Community Development Director

David Lewis
Historic Preservation Committee Chairman

Russ Holley
Senior Planner

Amber Pollan
Senior Planner

Debbie Zilles
Administrative Assistant