

**PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES  
Monday September 23, 2019  
City Hall, 7:00 pm**

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Michael Wright at 7:00 p.m.

**PRESENT:** Kimberly Watts, Jill Ingber, David Schwartz, Martha Shrode, Jill Plamper, Richard Polan, Sheldon Kohn, Joe Rozell and Michael Wright.  
Staff: Hank Berry

**ABSENT:** None

**Approval of Agenda**

**Motion to approve the agenda by Ingber, seconded by Plamper.**

**Yeas:** Wright, Plamper, Watts, Rozell, Polan, Kohn, Shrode, Ingber, Schwartz

**Nays:** None

**Absent:** None

**Motion passed.**

**Approval of Minutes from July 22, 2019**

**Motion to approve the minutes from July 22, 2019 as amended by Rozell, seconded by Kohn.**

**Yeas:** Wright, Plamper, Watts, Rozell, Polan. Ingber, Kohn, Shrode, Schwartz

**Nays:** None

**Absent:** None

**Motion passed.**

**Matter of Discussion of lane reductions for Eleven Mile Road and Coolidge Highway.**

Pat Cawley, traffic engineer from the Traffic Improvement Association presented information for discussion for the road diet for Eleven Mile Road and Coolidge Highway. He noted typical candidates for this type of lane reduction are roads that average less than 20,000 vehicles per day, significant left turn volume or access points, and crash history that includes left turn related or pedestrian and bicyclist accidents.

He further explained the goals of conversion are to improve safety, maintain operations, and provide space for other features like bike lanes, turn lanes, green space or parking.

The benefits for a four lane to three lane conversion include reducing left turn lane and rear end crashes, setting a uniformed speed and repurpose excess payment area. He further noted adding the turn lane will increase sight distance when turning left eliminating the side swipe and rear end crashes.

He further noted that speeds/traffic calming comes from the lane reduction reducing the drivers speed due to the perception that they don't have as much room.

This will also repurpose pavement to add non-motorized facilities such as pedestrian crossing islands, add parking, increase green space and reduce runoff.

Corridor specifics for Eleven Mile Road after the study suggested daily traffic is about 16,500 vehicles per day. Hourly directional traffic is about 750 vehicles. The road has a high driveway density particularly the east end of the road. Forty five crashes were looked at over three years that could be mitigated by a center left turn lane. Because Eleven Mile Road is over the 15,000 vehicle per day threshold that the Federal Highway Association looks at, it would then require a Synchro Analysis. A synchro analysis would provide for light timing and directional arrow analysis to maximize efficiency and traffic flow.

He also provided the data for the Coolidge from 696 to Eleven Mile Road. Daily volume was 18,000 to 24,000 with higher volumes closer to 696. The Synchro Analysis supports reduction language at Eleven Mile Road and Lincoln.

### **Commissioner Comments:**

Rozell has not heard good things from residents concerning the road diet in Berkley. Questioned if there has been an increase in the number of vehicle/bicycle crashes with the use of these bike lanes. He further noted the negative impacts it would have on traffic and the compounding effect it would have on Coolidge, outweighs the positive. He is not in favor of changes on Coolidge but is open to further looking at an Eleven Mile diet.

Kohn does not see the proposal for Coolidge corridor and the Eleven Mile corridor working well as it applies to Berkley's road diet between Eleven Mile and Twelve Mile Road. He questioned if there are left lane crash statistics and if there has been any feedback from the DPW and Public Safety. City Manager Sullivan clarified that the DPW only noted that if bollards were installed for the bike lanes that they would still be able to be plow. Public Safety said the road diet would be good for reducing crashes as well as reducing speeds.

Polan noted the intersection at Eleven Mile and Coolidge, the traffic backup was not clearing this morning and may need to be looked at again. Questioned what Oak Park is doing with this report. Manager Sullivan noted they are waiting for the City of Huntington Woods to decide. He also questioned what Berkley's process was for implementing the Coolidge road diet and how they are planning in the coming months to re-evaluate. Cawley noted they did public hearings along with presentations for the Council and installed the change as a pilot program. In two years, they will make a final determination on whether it will stay. Polan further questioned funding sources and if there were grants available. Cawley noted that Berkley used money through the DDA. Huntington Woods could use safety grant funding due to the demonstrated reduction in crashes in the left turn lane. If updating the corridor made it more aesthetically pleasing there is also the TAP Grant that could be looked at.

Plamper has seen the lineup on Coolidge going north at Eleven Mile and is concerned with the

safety in that area if a road diet was implemented. She has also observed people cutting through the neighborhoods which is worrisome for area children. She questioned if Cawley was just presenting data or was he giving a recommendation to the City. Cawley clarified this was more informational.

Shrode noted that the area of Eleven Mile and Woodward with the bus stops, is a dangerous area for pedestrians. She has concerns with narrowing down the lanes in that area. In the Clawson and Royal Oak areas she has witnessed a lot of people using the neighborhoods to cut through after their road diet was completed. Huntington Woods based on size, may not be a good candidate for the diet. Questioned if Eleven Mile would lose the existing green space. Cawley noted that the changes made in a diet are within the existing footprint of the road.

Schwartz noted concern with clearly defining the lanes for drivers. He has witnessed drivers using all lanes in Berkley regardless of the lane assignments and questioned the best practice in making that safe and workable.

Ingber does not think that this proposal is going to be any safer given the amount of traffic in the area of Woodward and Eleven Mile. Agrees with a lot of the sediments made by other Commissioners and again thinks it would be more dangerous.

Watts asked if Cawley had taken into consideration the volume of traffic moving across Woodward or the turning right onto Woodward when considering the feasibility of the project. Cawley clarified that the design for that area would be vitally important in making it feasible. She does see the value of the diet in reducing crashes and diverting rainwater but has concerns with including the major intersections of Woodward and Eleven Mile and Coolidge and Eleven Mile. She also asked if SMART had any input into these projects.

Wright noted he can see the value with the diet on Eleven Mile Road but does not quite get the plan for Coolidge yet.

### **Public Comments:**

Kevin Howley - 25474 Wareham

Noted he is not in favor of the change for Coolidge. The new configuration in Berkley for Huntington Woods residents traveling between the two cities has been difficult and become a hassle. He encouraged Huntington Woods residents to contact Berkley City Hall and let them know their concerns with the changes because it affects Huntington Woods residents as well.

Wendy Robins - 10775 W. Eleven Mile

Noted that after posting this proposal on Nextdoor, she received at least ninety four comments against the change. She is not in favor of the Eleven mile change due to the difficulty it will create when trying to exit the driveways with certain times of the day being almost impossible.

Jacob Umlah – 10073 W. Eleven Mile

Noted he likes the idea of the road diet for Eleven Mile. The current state of Eleven mile is dangerous due to the higher speeds and no crosswalks. He does not understand the proposed changes for Coolidge.

Tom Franco - 26370 Humber

Noted he is not in favor of the proposed change due to the cost in adding green space and the danger in including bike lanes. Encouraged crosswalks on Eleven Mile Road.

Becky Naghski - 13307 Vernon

Noted she is in favor for both Coolidge and Eleven Mile Road proposed changes. If Berkley and Huntington Woods participated together in incorporating this change, people would get used to the change and figure how to maneuver. Likes the idea of the space becoming more appealing with the addition of green space.

Garnet Robertson - 10787 W. Eleven Mile Road.

Noted concern with reducing the road to a single lane with a turn lane on Eleven Mile. She is not in favor of the proposed changes.

Susan Meinberg - 13130 Nadine

Noted that the changes to Coolidge and Eleven Mile in Berkley have created a lot congestion and hopes it is addressed with the proposed changes Huntington Woods is considering for Coolidge. She is not in favor of changes to Coolidge between 696 and Eleven Mile Road.

Sidney Kardon – 13307 Vernon

He is in favor of the changes specifically the bike lanes because it promotes slower traffic, helps the environment in reducing the carbon footprint and provides for a biking community.

### **Matter of Site Plan Review of a proposed addition to the Rocchi residence 25836 Dundee**

Savad Selimagic, general contractor, presented the site plan for an addition for the Rocchi residents at 25836 Dundee. They are looking to add a small mud room and a small powder room to the rear of the home along with a small master bathroom on the second floor. There will be no change in appearance to the front or south side of the home. They will be matching new windows with the existing windows. The plan is trying to match the existing home. He is aware after talking with Hank Berry that there are contradictory issues with the plans that does include the windows. He clarified that the windows proposed on one of the elevations does not match the existing windows which is incorrect, they will match. He noted the homeowners were not able to attend the meeting because they were out of the country.

Berry noted the plans presented were not complete. The windows Selimagic referenced as not matching were located on sheet A-10. The dimensions of the window were wrong as well as missing mutton bars and other details. The character details were not present so he could not give the character bonuses. The height of the addition is 26.5 so they could not get the height bonus. The plan also proposed EIFS and not stucco. Selimagic clarified that he was incorrect in listing EIFS and they would be matching the stucco.

Hank said the plans were confusing because the pages showing the existing plans also included proposed plans and are not consistent with what the Planning Commission is used to seeing.

Watts noted this is a minor exterior change and appreciated the window clarification. Not having east west north and south clarified on the plans made it difficult to review. Not fond of removing the window on the second floor. Does not like how the plans were presented but can be worked through.

Ingber understands the window on the second floor but is confused with the window in the living room on the left side why there isn't going to be more fenestration. Selimagic clarified a sliding door would be added. She aesthetically would like to see a bigger window.

Wright suggested a motion to table due to the confusion of the submitted plans.

Kohn questioned if the remaining comments should be heard to assist in educating the applicant as to what the Commission would like to see in his plan revisions. He is not comfortable voting on the existing plans.

Selimagic noted he would like additional feedback from the remaining members.

Michael Wright further clarified that the proposed plans will also require ZBA approval because it is over in size.

Wright suggested Mr. Selimagic work closely with Hank to ensure what he is proposing is clear to the Commission.

Berry noted there needs to be clarification with the windows and there is not a clear balance presented in the plans.

Shrode noted that the clarifications on the plans is not clear. Asked that he come back with plans that would show exactly what is going to be changed along with the elevations clearly providing a better visual. Is not comfortable voting on this at this point.

Plamper questioned the taking out of three windows, noting it was not clear what was being put back in. The plans presented showed a blank brick wall. She further referenced the EPDM roof, noting concern with it and how well it would hold up. A design that forces in a flat roof may want to be reconsidered. Selimagic clarified that the roof lines would not match without including the flat roof which is not visible from the street. She finds the plans are confusing and have an inconsistency with what is presented

Polan suggested labeling all elevations. He also thinks there is a better looking solution to the EPDM roof.

Wright suggested the homeowners be present at the next meeting so they can hear what is being discussed and needed for approval.

**Motion by Kohn and seconded by Plamper to table site plan review for the proposed addition at 25836 Dundee.**

**Yeas:** Wright, Plamper, Watts, Rozell, Polan, Kohn, Shrode, Ingber,  
Schwartz  
**Nays:** None  
**Absent:** None  
**Motion passed.**

**Public Participation**

None

**Motion by Kohn and seconded by Watts to adjourn.**

**Yeas:** Wright, Plamper, Watts, Rozell, Polan, Kohn, Shrode, Ingber,  
Schwartz  
**Nays:** None  
**Absent:** None  
**Motion passed.**

Meeting adjourned at 8:59 p.m.

Heidi Barckholtz  
Recorder