

# **SUBSTITUTE ROOFING MATERIALS ON EXISTING BUILDINGS**

## **HUNTINGTON WOODS HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION Guidelines for Historic Districts and Designated Historic Properties**

**I. Definitions:** For the purpose of these guidelines, the terms "substitute roofing materials and trim" shall be understood to encompass the use of any contemporary asphalt shingles, metal or other man-made material intended to replace or cover all, or any part of, the roof, drip edge, metal flashing or other roof elements of existing structures located within a designated historic district.

**NOTE:** This guideline covers existing structures; there are separate guidelines for roofing on "Infill Development (New Structures)" and "Additions".

## **II. Policy**

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Historic Buildings ***recommend against:***

"Radically changing, damaging, or destroying roofs which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished."

"Removing a major portion of the roof or roofing material that is repairable, then reconstructing it with new material in order to create a uniform, or "improved" appearance."

"Changing the configuration of a roof by adding new features such as dormer windows, vents, or skylights so that the historic character is diminished."

"Stripping the roof of sound historic material such as slate, clay tile, wood, and architectural metal."

"Applying paint or other coatings to roofing material which has been historically uncoated."

"Replacing an entire roof feature such as a cupola or dormer when repair of the historic materials and limited replacement of deteriorated or missing parts are appropriate."

"Failing to reuse intact slate or tile when only the roofing substrate needs replacement."

"Using a substitute material for the replacement part

that does not convey the visual appearance of the surviving parts of the roof or that is physically or chemically incompatible."

"Removing a feature of the roof that is unrepairable, such as a chimney or dormer, and not replacing it; or replacing it with a new feature that does not convey the same visual appearance."

"Creating a false historical appearance because the replaced feature is based on insufficient historical, pictorial, and physical documentation."

"Introducing a new roof feature that is incompatible in size, scale, material and color."

"Installing mechanical or service equipment so that it damages or obscures character-defining features; or is conspicuous from the public right-of-way."

"Radically changing a character-defining roof shape or damaging or destroying character-defining roofing material as a result of incompatible design or improper installation techniques."

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Number 6 states: "Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials."

The following guidelines concerning substitute roofing material and trim are provided to assist in the interpretation and application of the Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines.

### **III. Guidelines**

#### **A. *Materials***

The use of substitute roofing material and trim in any form on an existing building is ***not recommended***. Substitute roofing materials rarely replicates the dimensions or appearance of original materials. The use of original or comparable building materials is the only historically appropriate approach to the rehabilitation of any structure located in a designated historic district.

#### **B. *Exceptions***

In order to qualify for the rare approval of substitute roofing material on an existing building, the application must meet **all three (3)** of the following tests:

1. The substitute roofing material will replace other substitute roofing material on the structure; or, there are other practical reasons to approve new substitute roofing material, such

as:

- a. unreasonable cost of restoring the original material, judged in relation to the market value of the property; (the fact that the original material is more expensive than the substitute roofing material does not in itself, indicated "unreasonable costs").
- b. lack of availability of original materials (or other suitable alternatives) or the skills necessary to apply those materials (an uncommon situation, probably applying only with rare shingle materials);
- c. an emergency (probably temporary) need to provide roofing material in a time period which does not allow use of the original material (or other suitable alternative).

**NOTE:** Existing substitute roofing material or trim may be repaired with the same substitute materials without review. If a new substitute roof is proposed, Commission approval is required.

2. The substitute roofing material will be applied in such a manner that distinctive architectural details will be preserved.
3. The proposed installation of substitute roofing shall take into account the size, shape, color, texture and linear direction of the original building material. Substitute roofing which possesses a simulated slate surface or simulated wood grain surface is not considered appropriate.

### ***C. Information Requirements***

The Commission shall review each application proposing the installation of substitute roofing material or trim on its merits. In any case where substitute roofing is proposed, the following information should be included in the application:

1. A detailed statement of the purpose and scope of the proposed installation of substitute roofing or trim.
2. Identification of any deterioration of the existing roofing and trim, including the nature and extent of the deterioration, with cost estimates for repair and replacement of existing roofing or trim.

3. Detailed photographs of existing roofing material and trim to be replaced and detailed drawings showing how the proposed substitute roofing material and trim is to be installed. Material and color samples should be included.

These guidelines were approved on \_\_\_\_\_, 2004 by the Michigan State Historic Preservation Office under the provisions of Michigan's Local Historic District Act (1970 PA 169, Section 5.(3); MCL 399.205)