

CR-05 - Goals and Outcomes

Progress the jurisdiction has made in carrying out its strategic plan and its action plan. 91.520(a)

This could be an overview that includes major initiatives and highlights that were proposed and executed throughout the program year.

PY2019 proved to be a challenging year because so many projects and activities were shut-down due to the COVID-19 pandemic. Construction projects had to stop, community enrichment programming had to cease, and businesses had to temporarily shutter. Despite these challenges, the City of Dunkirk was still able to make progress on a number of fronts, including providing assistance to many community members, completion of several projects, and continuing to improve the CDBG program. The CDBG program continues to provide valuable and much-needed resources to our community.

The following figures capture some of the impact that our CDBG program made during the 2019 program year:

- 4 tenants were assisted by Chautauqua Opportunities, Inc (COI) with rental assistance
- 8 new homeowners were assisted by Chautauqua Home REhabilitation and Improvement Corp (CHRIC) in the purchase of their first home
- 6 residents were assisted by CHRIC with major roof repairs
- 117 children were provided programming by Boys & Girls Club of Northern Chautauqua County
- 2330 individuals received food pantry services through the Salvation Army
- 33 Small Businesses received financial assistance to re-open and/or stay afloat during the pandemic shut-down
- Hundreds of residents are now enjoying the Hazelton Dog Park and
- Thousands of residents are enjoying the upgrades to the Dunkirk Pier

These benefits align with priority needs set forth in our 2018 - 2020 Consolidated Plan and 2019 saw significant progress in address the priority needs of housing rehabilitation and infrastructure improvements.

During the 2019 program year, we also made progress with a number of other CDBG efforts including:

Engaging the public, non-profits, and other community stakeholders resulting in a strong application and Consolidated Plan

Improving program performance and maintaining strong compliance through implementation of standardized forms, training, and monitoring of sub-recipients

Our work in 2019 has also put us in a strong position to have an even better 2020 with projects that continues to improve our community. In summary, while 2019 program year was faced with unimaginable challenges due to the pandemic, we still say much progress being made in addressing the needs in our strategic plan and in improving the working of our CDBG program. We look forward to carrying this progress into PY2020.

Comparison of the proposed versus actual outcomes for each outcome measure submitted with the consolidated plan and explain, if applicable, why progress was not made toward meeting goals and objectives. 91.520(g)

Categories, priority levels, funding sources and amounts, outcomes/objectives, goal outcome indicators, units of measure, targets, actual outcomes/outputs, and percentage completed for each of the grantee’s program year goals.

Goal	Category	Source / Amount	Indicator	Unit of Measure	Expected – Strategic Plan	Actual – Strategic Plan	Percent Complete	Expected – Program Year	Actual – Program Year	Percent Complete
Creative Economic Development Solutions	Non-Housing Community Development Economic Development		Jobs created/retained	Jobs	60	0	0.00%			
Enhanced Recreation Opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development		Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	500	12000	2,400.00%			

Improve Community Outreach	Affordable Housing Public Housing Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$37000	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	300	2330	776.67%	100	2330	2,330.00%
Improve Infrastructure/Pedestrian Infrastructure	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$268830	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	0	0		1000	24513	2,451.30%
Provide Education Programming for Students	Public Services for Youth	CDBG: \$30000	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	300	131	43.67%	70	131	187.14%
Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$139000	Public service activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	0	5		0	5	

Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$139000	Rental units rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	0	0		0	0	
Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$139000	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	0	0		1	0	0.00%
Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$139000	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	6	6	100.00%	6	6	100.00%
Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$139000	Direct Financial Assistance to Homebuyers	Households Assisted	8	8	100.00%	8	8	100.00%

Table 1 - Accomplishments – Program Year & Strategic Plan to Date

Assess how the jurisdiction's use of funds, particularly CDBG, addresses the priorities and specific objectives identified in the plan, giving special attention to the highest priority activities identified.

PY2019 was a successful program year in terms of addressing the highest priority activities identified in our strategic plan as best we could. The majority of CDBG funds expended in PY2019 were used for two of the priority needs outlined in the strategic plan: infrastructure development and housing rehabilitation.

In total persons assisted breaks down as such:

Enhanced recreation = 12,000 residents of the City of Dunkirk enjoying the Pier improvements

Improve Community Outreach = 2330 residents assisted through the Salvation Army food pantry program

Affordable Housing/Homeowner housing rehabbed: 6 CHRIC roof repair projects

CR-10 - Racial and Ethnic composition of families assisted

Describe the families assisted (including the racial and ethnic status of families assisted).

91.520(a)

	CDBG
White	96
Black or African American	17
Asian	0
American Indian or American Native	0
Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander	0
Total	113
Hispanic	68
Not Hispanic	45

Table 2 – Table of assistance to racial and ethnic populations by source of funds

Narrative

Dunkirk's population is majority White but increasingly diverse; CDBG assistance was well-distributed relative to the demographic profile of the city. Many of the home repairs done through CHRIC's programs assisted elderly homeowners who were unable to or not in a strong enough financial position to take care of the repairs themselves leaving an already vulnerable population even moreso.

Additional households were assisted indirectly through projects like the Pier improvement project however accurately determining the demographic make-up of these households is beyond our capacity.

CR-15 - Resources and Investments 91.520(a)

Identify the resources made available

Source of Funds	Source	Resources Made Available	Amount Expended During Program Year
CDBG	public - federal	474,831	219,752

Table 3 - Resources Made Available

Narrative

Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Target Area	Planned Percentage of Allocation	Actual Percentage of Allocation	Narrative Description
DUNKIRK	100	100	

Table 4 – Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Narrative

The location of projects completed and households assisted in 2019 was spread throughout the low to moderate income portions of the City as defined by HUD LMI block group data. CDBG assistance occurred in every ward.

Leveraging

Explain how federal funds leveraged additional resources (private, state and local funds), including a description of how matching requirements were satisfied, as well as how any publicly owned land or property located within the jurisdiction that were used to address the needs identified in the plan.

We did our best to utilize CDBG to leverage additional resources for a number of projects with several successes. For example, \$147,282 was used as match for the \$1.5 million Pier Improvement project. We also used \$32,955 of CDBG funds to help leverage an additional \$100,000 in NY State funds + \$20,000 in private funding for the Hazelton Dog Park land acquisition project. Finally we used \$7840 of CDBG Planning and Admin funds as match for the joint project of developing a Redevelopment Alternatives and Feasibility Study for the now shuttered NRG Power Plant in the City of Dunkirk.

CR-20 - Affordable Housing 91.520(b)

Evaluation of the jurisdiction's progress in providing affordable housing, including the number and types of families served, the number of extremely low-income, low-income, moderate-income, and middle-income persons served.

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	0	0
Number of Non-Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	15	14
Number of Special-Needs households to be provided affordable housing units	0	0
Total	15	14

Table 5 – Number of Households

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of households supported through Rental Assistance	25	4
Number of households supported through The Production of New Units	1	0
Number of households supported through Rehab of Existing Units	6	6
Number of households supported through Acquisition of Existing Units	8	8
Total	40	18

Table 6 – Number of Households Supported

Discuss the difference between goals and outcomes and problems encountered in meeting these goals.

There is 1 acquisition / rehab / resale project that has been delayed in starting due to the pandemic halting foreclosures and construction so it has not yet been completed to produce any new units at this time. This was due to the following factors:

- NY State foreclosure moratorium resulted in the County not having a foreclosure auction so few, if any, properties were available to be acquired

- NY State order to halt construction projects earlier in 2020 resulting in 2018 projects being stalled / unable to complete thus creating a timeline lag

The Rental Assistance project goal was added to this program year using CDBG-CV funds and is just beginning. So far, 4 tenants have been assisted.

Discuss how these outcomes will impact future annual action plans.

The 2018 acquisition project has completed and was sold to a low-income first time homebuyer. With that project now complete, albeit slowed due to the pandemic, the subrecipient is now actively looking for a new property to rehabilitate.

Include the number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons served by each activity where information on income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity.

Number of Households Served	CDBG Actual	HOME Actual
Extremely Low-income	0	0
Low-income	6	0
Moderate-income	8	0
Total	14	0

Table 7 – Number of Households Served

Narrative Information

The programs that directly assisted low to moderate income households, where information in income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity were:

- CHRIC's closing cost and down payment assistance program
- CHRIC's roof repair program
- COI Rental Assistance program using CDBG-CV funds

CR-25 - Homeless and Other Special Needs 91.220(d, e); 91.320(d, e); 91.520(c)

Evaluate the jurisdiction's progress in meeting its specific objectives for reducing and ending homelessness through:

Reaching out to homeless persons (especially unsheltered persons) and assessing their individual needs

The City continues to work with the Chautauqua County Homeless Coalition to work on a plan to eradicate homelessness. The CoC facilitates the process and establishes procedures for the region's coordinated entry system, which includes a detailed assessment to evaluate a person's vulnerability and acuity of needs and is conducted during the intake process of emergency shelters and social service agencies in the region. This information is then used to refer the individual to appropriate housing resources.

Key strategies include addressing chronic homelessness through PSH, applying for Rapid Rehousing bonus funds, and ramping up outreach efforts. The Continuum is made up of a variety of service providers that assist homeless families and individuals to access mainstream benefits, mental health and chemical dependency services, and emergency shelter and domestic violence services. Part of these outreach services include education of both the service providers and the community services available to assist in eradicating homelessness.

While local social service agencies are more likely to interact directly with individuals who are homeless, the City can provide valuable support and guidance by remaining informed of available resources and efforts. We do this by being an involved partner in the CoC.

Addressing the emergency shelter and transitional housing needs of homeless persons

The emergency shelter and transitional housing needs for homeless persons in our community are primarily handled by Chautauqua Opportunities, Inc (COI), the local Continuum of Care coordinator. As resources allow we support COI in their multitude of housing programs, attend CoC meetings, and serve on the NOFA rank and review committee. There are also domestic violence and runaway youth emergency shelters in our region. This year COI applied for Rapid Rehousing bonus funds to assist our region in making homelessness rare, brief, and non-recurring.

Helping low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless, especially extremely low-income individuals and families and those who are: likely to become homeless after being discharged from publicly funded institutions and systems of care (such as health care facilities, mental health facilities, foster care and other youth facilities, and corrections programs and institutions); and, receiving assistance from public or private agencies that address housing, health, social services, employment, education, or youth needs

We continue to work with our CoC to find ways to help low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless utilizing a variety of strategies. We are working to improve the local economy and provide more safe, affordable housing, both of which will help low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless. In addition, the CoC works in partnership with providers of mental health care, physical health care, veteran and youth service providers to address homelessness and housing stability concerns utilizing a cross-system approach. The approach allows the CoC to help establish appropriate discharge and housing plans throughout all aspects of the system of care.

Helping homeless persons (especially chronically homeless individuals and families, families with children, veterans and their families, and unaccompanied youth) make the transition to permanent housing and independent living, including shortening the period of time that individuals and families experience homelessness, facilitating access for homeless individuals and families to affordable housing units, and preventing individuals and families who were recently homeless from becoming homeless again

One of the ways we are working towards this goal is by working with Southern Tier Environments for Living (STEL) on their Dunkirk Renovation and Ownership program, which is creating close to 50 new housing units in our community, a number of which will be targeted to veterans and persons who are homeless and will provide additional wrap-around services to help these clients make the transition a success. Our CoC works with chronically homeless individuals and families in permanent supportive housing, helping them stay successfully housed and preventing incidents of recidivism. Finally, we're pleased to see COI was awarded bonus funding last NOFA to implement a new Rapid Rehousing program in the region. Prior to this, we did not have any Rapid Rehousing projects in our region but we do feel that this is an extremely beneficial strategy to help our area reduce lengths of time homeless so we are pleased to see the new funding award.

In general, one of the primary goals of our CDBG program is to provide more safe, affordable housing for our community. This goal is intended to benefit all low to moderate income residents, including those that are experiencing homelessness. In the upcoming program year, one of the ways we are addressing this goal is by funding a number of activities through local non-profits that will increase the supply of safe, affordable housing in Dunkirk.

CR-30 - Public Housing 91.220(h); 91.320(j)

Actions taken to address the needs of public housing

The Dunkirk Housing Authority (DHA) has 2 public housing communities consisting of a total of 223 rental units. It has an internal monitoring system and uses a project based management model to identify the unique needs of each of the properties. This allows the DHA to be better able to identify the needs of the residents as well as streamlining the functions and processes of the housing authority. The needs are then addressed and incorporated into a future assessment to address any problems and prioritize those. Property management is tailored to the portfolio as a whole.

Actions taken to encourage public housing residents to become more involved in management and participate in homeownership

The Dunkirk Housing Authority strives to work closely with the tenants to provide activities and opportunities to its residents. It holds monthly open board meetings and is well attended by the residents. There are two resident representatives on the board of directors that collect and voice the needs and concerns of the residents. Residents have access to office staff daily and well as the Executive Director.

Residents that are paying close to market rents are encouraged to consider home ownership. We have an asset based approach in the discussions and encourage their interest. Interested residents are connected to the local Community Action Agency or Chautauqua Home Rehab and Improvement Corporation for these services.

The City Planning and Development Department aims to expand economic opportunities for our community, a primary need also identified for DHA residents. We continue to look for ways to promote opportunity and provide assistance to the DHA where feasible and encourage its residents to participate in homeownership and economic opportunities.

Actions taken to provide assistance to troubled PHAs

The Dunkirk Housing Authority is not considered to be a troubled PHA

CR-35 - Other Actions 91.220(j)-(k); 91.320(i)-(j)

Actions taken to remove or ameliorate the negative effects of public policies that serve as barriers to affordable housing such as land use controls, tax policies affecting land, zoning ordinances, building codes, fees and charges, growth limitations, and policies affecting the return on residential investment. 91.220 (j); 91.320 (i)

The City of Dunkirk has not identified any barriers to affordable housing and is not currently aware of any public policies that serve as such. With that, given the importance of affordable housing to our community, we will continue to monitor for any policies that do have the effect of creating barriers to affordable housing.

Actions taken to address obstacles to meeting underserved needs. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The largest obstacle to meeting underserved needs in our community is a lack of funding. As a result, we continue to diligently look for additional grant opportunities that will allow us to meet the underserved needs, of which there are many in our community. As in the past, we will look for opportunities to seek out new, non-entitlement funding and utilize CDBG as leverage.

Actions taken to reduce lead-based paint hazards. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The CDBG Program Administrator attended the HUD Sponsored Lead Safe Housing Rule training in Buffalo in 2019 who then provided the training materials and information to subgrantees. We also continue to work with Chautauqua Home Rehabilitation and Improvement Corp (CHRIC) and the Chautauqua County Department of Health and Human Services that aim to reduce lead-based paint hazards in our community. Where possible, we also seek out grant opportunities to address these hazards.

In addition, Chautauqua County Department of Health and Human Services just received a \$3,000,000 grant from HUD for the lead-based paint services they provide to the county, including the City of Dunkirk.

That being said, we feel that given the advanced age and poor condition of much of our community's housing stock, addressing lead-based paint hazards more explicitly should be a priority for our department and CDBG program.

Actions taken to reduce the number of poverty-level families. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

Much of the work undertaken in the Planning and Development Department are intended to reduce the number of poverty-level families in our community. Amongst the actions we have taken or are currently undertaking include:

- funding programs through CDBG that create more housing security for low to moderate income households
- working to create more economic opportunities in our community by supporting local businesses and by seeking out opportunities for new businesses
- seeking out additional grant funding to provide economic opportunities in our community

Additional economic development, along with safe/affordable housing, is one of the primary needs in our community. One of the Planning and Development Department's primary goals is to foster this economic development, which will help reduce the number of poverty-level families in Dunkirk.

Actions taken to develop institutional structure. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

We have taken a number of actions over the past couple of years to help develop stronger institutional structure including:

- Creating checklists to ensure proper steps are taken with CDBG procedures
- Fostering better relationships with our subrecipients
- Continuing education of the CDBG program for staff, taking advantage of learning resources and training opportunities provided by HUD
- Ongoing creation of systems and internal structures to guide the City's CDBG program in the future

We intend to maintain these efforts and pursue other that can help us create greater sustainability for our CDBG program and the people we serve

Actions taken to enhance coordination between public and private housing and social service agencies. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

During the PY2019 the City has undertaken a number of actions to enhance our coordination with local organizations including:

- better planning of the application process to ensure applications better matching community needs, including the development of a community input survey in both English and Spanish
- more local training opportunities for subgrantees
- more regular email updates on CDBG related matters and training

In a smaller community with a smaller Planning and Development Department such as Dunkirk coordinating effectively with local housing and social service agencies is essential to a successful CDBG program.

Identify actions taken to overcome the effects of any impediments identified in the jurisdictions analysis of impediments to fair housing choice. 91.520(a)

We are not aware of any impediments to fair housing choices in our community

CR-40 - Monitoring 91.220 and 91.230

Describe the standards and procedures used to monitor activities carried out in furtherance of the plan and used to ensure long-term compliance with requirements of the programs involved, including minority business outreach and the comprehensive planning requirements

Each CDBG assisted activity is monitored throughout all phases of the project and standardized forms have been implemented for more accurate reporting. Documentation is requested from subrecipients for a desk review and an on-site inspection. On-site monitorings are also being conducted and documented in the file with any deficiencies noted and reported back to the agency for corrective action.

To ensure compliance with program requirements the City Program Administrator:

- participates in available webinars, conferences, and training classes offered by HUD
- regularly reviews printed CDBG guides
- regularly communicates with HUD staff
- regularly communicates with subrecipients
- conducts on-site monitoring visits

With regard to minority business outreach the City participates in NY State sponsored MWBE seminars and trainings and recently provided an updated list of NY State MWBE certified businesses to subrecipients encouraging them to do more to outreach, engage, and assist MWBE's with contracting opportunities

Citizen Participation Plan 91.105(d); 91.115(d)

Describe the efforts to provide citizens with reasonable notice and an opportunity to comment on performance reports.

As with all of the CDBG documents we prepare, we take care to follow the public notice guidelines set forth in our Citizen Participation Plan. For our 2019 CAPER, citizens were provided with a seven day notice of the availability of the draft plan through a legal notice in the Observer newspaper, a notice on the City's website, public posting of the plan in the Dunkirk Development and Clerk's offices, and an email to interested organizations/individuals. We value the comments of citizens on our CDBG program

and will continue to provide reasonable notice and an opportunity for citizen comment on performance reports and other CDBG documents

CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)

Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction's program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.

The City of Dunkirk did not change its program objectives and is not considering any changes at this time.

Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?

No

[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.

CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)

Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction's program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.

The City of Dunkirk did not change its program objectives and is not considering any changes at this time.

Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?

No

[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.