



HON. MAYOR WILFRED ROSAS

# Draft 2018

## Consolidated Annual Performance and Evaluation Report

This document is made available for review starting on October 28, 2019 followed by a 15-day public review and comment period starting November 3, 2019 and ending on November 17, 2019. Please submit your name, address, phone number, and comments by mail, fax, telephone, or email to: City of Dunkirk Planning and Development Department (Attn: Jill Meaux), 342 Central Ave., Dunkirk, NY 14048; FAX 716-363-6460; PHONE 716-366-9878; or email: [jmeaux@cityofdunkirk.com](mailto:jmeaux@cityofdunkirk.com)

All comments must be in by midnight on November 17, 2019.

**Prepared by:**  
**City of Dunkirk Planning and Development Department**  
**Dunkirk, NY**

## CR-05 - Goals and Outcomes

### **Progress the jurisdiction has made in carrying out its strategic plan and its action plan. 91.520(a)**

This could be an overview that includes major initiatives and highlights that were proposed and executed throughout the program year.

During the PY2018 (April 1, 2018 - August 31, 2019) the City of Dunkirk made progress on a number of different fronts, including completion of several projects, providing assistance to many community members, and continuing to improve the management of our CDBG program. The CDBG program continues to provide valuable and much-needed resources to our community.

The following figures capture some of the impact that our CDBG program made during the 2018 program year:

- 3 residents were assisted by Chautauqua Opportunities, Inc (COI) with major home repairs
- 6 residents were assisted by Chautauqua Home Rehabilitation and Improvement Corp (CHRIC) with major roof repairs
- 9 new homeowners were assisted by CHRIC in the purchase of their first home
- 4 vacant and dilapidated homes were demolished
- 193 children were provided programming by Chautauqua Striders and Boys & Girls Club of Northern Chautauqua County
- 700 individuals participated in new arts programming activities through Adams Arts Center
- Dozens of residents were positively impacted by the waterline/fire hydrant replacement work on Seel Street
- 100+ residents were positively impacted by the sidewalk repair and replacement program
- 100+ residents are now enjoying the new Hazelton Dog Park

These benefits align with priority needs of our 2018 - 2020 Consolidated Plan and 2018 saw significant progress in addressing the priority needs of housing rehabilitation and infrastructure improvements.

During the 2018 program year, we also made progress with a number of other CDBG efforts including:

- Engaging the public and community organizations resulting in a strong application process for the 2019 program year
- Improving program performance and maintaining strong compliance through implementation of standardized forms, training, and monitoring of sub-recipients
- Resolved a number of past issues with our CDBG program

Our work in 2018 has also put us in a strong position to have an even better 2019 with projects that continue to improve our community.

In summary, our 2018 program year saw much progress made in addressing the needs outlined in our Strategic Plan and in improving the workings of our CDBG program. We look forward to carrying this progress into PY2019.

**Comparison of the proposed versus actual outcomes for each outcome measure submitted with the consolidated plan and explain, if applicable, why progress was not made toward meeting goals and objectives. 91.520(g)**

Categories, priority levels, funding sources and amounts, outcomes/objectives, goal outcome indicators, units of measure, targets, actual outcomes/outputs, and percentage completed for each of the grantee’s program year goals.

Goal	Category	Source / Amount	Indicator	Unit of Measure	Expected – Strategic Plan	Actual – Strategic Plan	Percent Complete	Expected – Program Year	Actual – Program Year	Percent Complete
Creative Economic Development Solutions	Non-Housing Community Development Economic Development	CDBG: \$34000	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	60	0	0.00%	0	0	
Enhanced Recreation Opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development		Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	500	800	160.00%			

Improve Community Outreach	Affordable Housing Public Housing Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$50000	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	300	1	0.33%	100	1	1.00%
Improve Infrastructure/Pedestrian Infrastructure	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$134864	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	1000	215	21.50%	500	800	160.00%
Provide Education Programming for Students	Public Services for Youth	CDBG: \$30000	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	300	193	64.33%	100	193	193.00%
Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$196000	Rental units rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	3	0	0.00%	0	0	

Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$196000	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	1	1	100.00%	2	1	50.00%
Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$196000	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	21	9	42.86%	6	6	100.00%
Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$196000	Direct Financial Assistance to Homebuyers	Households Assisted	22	9	40.91%	8	9	112.50%

**Table 1 - Accomplishments – Program Year & Strategic Plan to Date**

**Assess how the jurisdiction’s use of funds, particularly CDBG, addresses the priorities and specific objectives identified in the plan, giving special attention to the highest priority activities identified.**

PY2018 was a successful program year in terms of addressing the highest priority activities identified in our strategic plan. The majority of CDBG funds expended in PY2018 were used for two of the priority needs outlined in the strategic plan: infrastructure development and housing rehabilitation.

In total persons assisted breaks down as such:

Enhanced recreation = 700 attendees for various Adams Art programming + over 100 residents that are enjoying the new dog park with the land acquisition project using CDBG funds previously allocated prior to PY2018

Improve Community Outreach = even though HOPE Center building is still under construction and should be complete by the end of 2019, they were still able to provide some services including assisting 1 disabled veteran obtain a new wheelchair.

Public Facility/Infrastructure other than housing = Sidewalk replacement program: Estimated 140+ residents (56 addresses x 2.5 persons per

address) + Seel Street: approximately 75 residents (30 addresses x 2.5 persons per address)

Affordable Housing/Homeowner housing rehabbed: 6 CHRIC roof repair projects, 3 COI owner occupied rehab. projects + Homeowner housing added = 1 CHRIC acquisition/rehab/resale

In addition, Adams Art Center not only provided cultural benefits to the community, it also provided a positive economic impact by providing employment opportunities to over 60 performers, artists, and laborers (temporary so not listed above).

## CR-10 - Racial and Ethnic composition of families assisted

Describe the families assisted (including the racial and ethnic status of families assisted).

91.520(a)

	CDBG
White	155
Black or African American	54
Asian	0
American Indian or American Native	0
Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>209</b>
Hispanic	115
Not Hispanic	94

Table 2 – Table of assistance to racial and ethnic populations by source of funds

### Narrative

Dunkirk's population is majority White but increasingly diverse; CDBG assistance was well-distributed relative to the demographic profile of the city. Many of the home repairs done through CHRIC's programs assisted elderly homeowners who were unable to or not in a strong enough financial position to take care of the repairs themselves leaving an already vulnerable population even moreso.

Additional households were assisted indirectly through projects like the Sidewalk Repairs, Seel Street improvements, and the dog park land acquisition. Accurately determining the demographic make-up of these households is beyond our capacity.

The numbers above break down as:

- CHRIC Roof Repair program: 6
- CHRIC Closing Cost / Down Payment program: 9
- Boys & Girls Club: 131
- HOPE Center: 1
- Chautauqua Striders: 62

\*Note: 'Black or African American' includes 32 people of mixed race

**CR-15 - Resources and Investments 91.520(a)**

**Identify the resources made available**

Source of Funds	Source	Resources Made Available	Amount Expended During Program Year
CDBG	public - federal	480,864	858,115

**Table 3 - Resources Made Available**

**Narrative**

Although our PY2018 award amount was \$480,864, the funds 'expended during the program year' include all funds drawn down between April 1, 2018 - August 31, 2019 (as reported by IDIS) so it includes funds allocated to ongoing prior year activities to which all funding was not drawn until PY2018. This occurred both because we had a balance of pre-2018 funds left to spend and because our program year changed from April - April to September - August resulting in an additional 5 months in PY2018 (April 1, 2018 - August 31, 2019).

**Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments**

Target Area	Planned Percentage of Allocation	Actual Percentage of Allocation	Narrative Description
DUNKIRK	100	100	

**Table 4 – Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments**

**Narrative**

The location of projects completed and households assisted in 2018 was spread throughout the low to moderate income portions of the City as defined by HUD LMI block group data. CDBG assistance occurred in every ward.



## Leveraging

**Explain how federal funds leveraged additional resources (private, state and local funds), including a description of how matching requirements were satisfied, as well as how any publicly owned land or property located within the jurisdiction that were used to address the needs identified in the plan.**

We did our best to utilize CDBG to leverage additional resources for a number of projects with some success. For example, \$32,955 of CDBG funds helped leverage an additional \$100,000 in NY State funds + \$20,000 in private funding for the Hazelton Dog Park project. Also, publically owned land at Wright Park was used to address the desire for additional recreation options in our community with improvements completed during this reporting period. On that project we used \$85,000 of CDBG funds to help leverage an additional \$500,000+ in funding from the State of NY for those park upgrades, including the addition of a new splash pad, pickle ball courts and improvements to restroom facilities.

## CR-20 - Affordable Housing 91.520(b)

Evaluation of the jurisdiction's progress in providing affordable housing, including the number and types of families served, the number of extremely low-income, low-income, moderate-income, and middle-income persons served.

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	0	0
Number of Non-Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	16	15
Number of Special-Needs households to be provided affordable housing units	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>15</b>

Table 5 – Number of Households

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of households supported through Rental Assistance	0	0
Number of households supported through The Production of New Units	2	0
Number of households supported through Rehab of Existing Units	6	6
Number of households supported through Acquisition of Existing Units	8	9
<b>Total</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>15</b>

Table 6 – Number of Households Supported

**Discuss the difference between goals and outcomes and problems encountered in meeting these goals.**

There are 2 acquisition / rehab / resale projects that are currently underway but have not yet been completed to produce any new units at this time. This was due to the following factors:

- Lack of contractor response on 1 project necessitated the re-issuance of an RFP
- Inclement weather

**Discuss how these outcomes will impact future annual action plans.**

1 of the acquisition/rehab/resale projects is just about complete so we don't anticipate that impacting future AAP's. With regard to the other project, an RFP has been re-issued and the subgrantee was not awarded any funds in PY2019 so that they could finish this activity.

**Include the number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons served by each activity where information on income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity.**

<b>Number of Households Served</b>	<b>CDBG Actual</b>	<b>HOME Actual</b>
Extremely Low-income	1	0
Low-income	4	0
Moderate-income	10	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>0</b>

**Table 7 – Number of Households Served**

**Narrative Information**

The programs that directly assisted low to moderate income households, where information in income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity were:

- CHRIC's closing cost and down payment assistance
- CHRIC's roof repair
- CHRIC and COI Acquisition / Rehab / Resale program

## **CR-25 - Homeless and Other Special Needs 91.220(d, e); 91.320(d, e); 91.520(c)**

**Evaluate the jurisdiction's progress in meeting its specific objectives for reducing and ending homelessness through:**

### **Reaching out to homeless persons (especially unsheltered persons) and assessing their individual needs**

The City continues to work with the Chautauqua County Homeless Coalition to work on a plan to eradicate homelessness. The CoC facilitates the process and establishes procedures for the region's coordinated entry system, which includes a detailed assessment to evaluate a person's vulnerability and acuity of needs and is conducted during the intake process of emergency shelters and social service agencies in the region. This information is then used to refer the individual to appropriate housing resources.

Key strategies include addressing chronic homelessness through PSH, applying for Rapid Rehousing bonus funds, and ramping up outreach efforts. The Continuum is made up of a variety of service providers that assist homeless families and individuals to access mainstream benefits, mental health and chemical dependency services, and emergency shelter and domestic violence services. Part of these outreach services include education of both the service providers and the community services available to assist in eradicating homelessness.

While local social service agencies are more likely to interact directly with individuals who are homeless, the City can provide valuable support and guidance by remaining informed of available resources and efforts. We do this by being an involved partner in the CoC.

### **Addressing the emergency shelter and transitional housing needs of homeless persons**

The emergency shelter and transitional housing needs for homeless persons in our community are primarily handled by Chautauqua Opportunities, Inc (COI), the local Continuum of Care coordinator. As resources allow we support COI in their multitude of housing programs, attend CoC meetings, and serve on the NOFA rank and review committee. In addition, during Code Blue emergency weather instances, the City makes available the Senior Center for emergency sheltering. There are also domestic violence and runaway youth emergency shelters in our region. This year COI applied for Rapid Rehousing bonus funds to assist our region in making homelessness rare, brief, and non-recurring.

**Helping low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless, especially extremely low-income individuals and families and those who are: likely to become homeless after being discharged from publicly funded institutions and systems of care (such as health care facilities, mental health facilities, foster care and other youth facilities, and corrections programs and institutions); and, receiving assistance from public or private agencies that**

## **address housing, health, social services, employment, education, or youth needs**

We continue to work with our CoC to find ways to help low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless utilizing a variety of strategies. We are working to improve the local economy and provide more safe, affordable housing, both of which will help low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless. In addition, the CoC works in partnership with providers of mental health care, physical health care, veteran and youth service providers to address homelessness and housing stability concerns utilizing a cross-system approach. The approach allows the CoC to help establish appropriate discharge and housing plans throughout all aspects of the system of care.

**Helping homeless persons (especially chronically homeless individuals and families, families with children, veterans and their families, and unaccompanied youth) make the transition to permanent housing and independent living, including shortening the period of time that individuals and families experience homelessness, facilitating access for homeless individuals and families to affordable housing units, and preventing individuals and families who were recently homeless from becoming homeless again**

One of the ways we are working towards this goal is by working with Southern Tier Environments for Living (STEL) on their Dunkirk Renovation and Ownership program, which is creating close to 50 new housing units in our community, a number of which will be targeted to veterans and persons who are homeless and will provide additional wrap-around services to help these clients make the transition a success. Our CoC works with chronically homeless individuals and families in permanent supportive housing, helping them stay successfully housed and preventing incidents of recidivism. Finally, we're pleased to see that a member of the CoC applied for bonus funding this NOFA to implement a new Rapid Rehousing program in the region. Currently we do not have any Rapid Rehousing projects in our region but do feel that this would be an extremely beneficial strategy to help our area reduce lengths of time homeless.

In general, one of the primary goals of our CDBG program is to provide more safe, affordable housing for our community. This goal is intended to benefit all low to moderate income residents, including those that are experiencing homelessness. In the upcoming program year, one of the ways we are addressing this goal is by funding a number of activities through local non-profits that will increase the supply of safe, affordable housing in Dunkirk.

## **CR-30 - Public Housing 91.220(h); 91.320(j)**

### **Actions taken to address the needs of public housing**

The Dunkirk Housing Authority (DHA) has 2 public housing communities consisting of a total of 223 rental units. It has an internal monitoring system and uses a project based management model to identify the unique needs of each of the properties. This allows the DHA to be better able to identify the needs of the residents as well as streamlining the functions and processes of the housing authority. The needs are then addressed and incorporated into a future assessment to address any problems and prioritize those. Property management is tailored to the portfolio as a whole.

### **Actions taken to encourage public housing residents to become more involved in management and participate in homeownership**

The Dunkirk Housing Authority strives to work closely with the tenants to provide activities and opportunities to its residents. It holds monthly open board meetings and is well attended by the residents. There are two resident representatives on the board of directors that collect and voice the needs and concerns of the residents. Residents have access to office staff daily and well as the Executive Director.

Residents that are paying close to market rents are encouraged to consider home ownership. We have an asset based approach in the discussions and encourage their interest. Interested residents are connected to the local Community Action Agency or Chautauqua Home Rehab and Improvement Corporation for these services.

The City Planning and Development Department aims to expand economic opportunities for our community, a primary need also identified for DHA residents. We continue to look for ways to promote opportunity and provide assistance to the DHA where feasible and encourage its residents to participate in homeownership and economic opportunities.

### **Actions taken to provide assistance to troubled PHAs**

The Dunkirk Housing Authority is not considered a troubled PHA.

### **CR-35 - Other Actions 91.220(j)-(k); 91.320(i)-(j)**

**Actions taken to remove or ameliorate the negative effects of public policies that serve as barriers to affordable housing such as land use controls, tax policies affecting land, zoning ordinances, building codes, fees and charges, growth limitations, and policies affecting the return on residential investment. 91.220 (j); 91.320 (i)**

The City of Dunkirk has not identified any barriers to affordable housing and is not currently aware of any public policies that serve as such. With that, given the importance of affordable housing to our community, we will continue to monitor for any policies that do have the effect of creating barriers to affordable housing.

### **Actions taken to address obstacles to meeting underserved needs. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

The largest obstacle to meeting underserved needs in our community is a lack of funding. As a result, we continue to diligently look for additional grant opportunities that will allow us to meet the underserved needs, of which there are many in our community. As in the past, we will look for opportunities to seek out new, non-entitlement funding and utilize CDBG as leverage.

### **Actions taken to reduce lead-based paint hazards. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

The CDBG Program Administrator attended the HUD Sponsored Lead Safe Housing Rule training in Buffalo in July, 2019 who then provided the training materials and information to subgrantees. We also continue to work with Chautauqua Home Rehabilitation and Improvement Corp (CHRIC) and the Chautauqua County Department of Health and Human Services that aim to reduce lead-based paint hazards in our community. Where possible, we also seek out grant opportunities to address these hazards.

That being said, we feel that given the advanced age and poor condition of much of our community's housing stock, addressing lead-based paint hazards more explicitly should be a priority for our department and CDBG program.

### **Actions taken to reduce the number of poverty-level families. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

Much of the work undertaken in the Planning and Development Department are intended to reduce the number of poverty-level families in our community. Amongst the actions we have taken or are currently undertaking include:

- funding programs through CDBG that create more housing security for low to moderate income households
- working to create more economic opportunities in our community by supporting local businesses and by seeking out opportunities for new businesses

- seeking out additional grant funding to provide economic opportunities in our community

Additional economic development, along with safe/affordable housing, is one of the primary needs in our community. One of the Planning and Development Department's primary goals is to foster this economic development, which will help reduce the number of poverty-level families in Dunkirk

### **Actions taken to develop institutional structure. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

We have taken a number of actions over the past couple of years to help develop stronger institutional structure including:

- Creating checklists to ensure proper steps are taken with CDBG procedures
- Fostering better relationships with our subrecipients
- Continuing education of the CDBG program for staff, taking advantage of learning resources and training opportunities provided by HUD
- Ongoing creation of systems and internal structures to guide the City's CDBG program in the future

We intend to maintain these efforts and pursue other that can help us create greater sustainability for our CDBG program and the people we serve.

### **Actions taken to enhance coordination between public and private housing and social service agencies. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

During the PY2018 the City has undertaken a number of actions to enhance our coordination with local organizations including:

- better planning of the application process to ensure applications better matching community needs
- more local training opportunities for subgrantees
- more regular email updates on CDBG related matters and training
- more networking at meetings, roundtables, and other events so we can communicate with other local agencies
- inviting housing developers and social service agencies to public hearings

In a smaller community with a smaller Planning and Development Department such as Dunkirk coordinating effectively with local housing and social service agencies is essential to a successful CDBG program.



**Identify actions taken to overcome the effects of any impediments identified in the jurisdictions analysis of impediments to fair housing choice. 91.520(a)**

We are not aware of any impediments to fair housing choices in our community

## **CR-40 - Monitoring 91.220 and 91.230**

**Describe the standards and procedures used to monitor activities carried out in furtherance of the plan and used to ensure long-term compliance with requirements of the programs involved, including minority business outreach and the comprehensive planning requirements**

Each CDBG assisted activity is monitored throughout all phases of the project and standardized forms have been implemented for more accurate reporting. Documentation is requested from subrecipients for a desk review and an on-site inspection. On-site monitorings are also being conducted and documented in the file with any deficiencies noted and reported back to the agency for corrective action.

To ensure compliance with program requirements the City Program Administrator:

- participates in available webinars, conferences, and training classes offered by HUD
- regularly reviews printed CDBG guides
- regularly communicates with HUD staff
- regularly communicates with subrecipients
- conducts on-site monitoring visits

With regard to minority business outreach the City participates in NY State sponsored MWBE seminars and trainings and recently provided an updated list of NY State MWBE certified businesses to subrecipients encouraging them to do more to outreach, engage, and assist MWBE's with contracting opportunities.

## **Citizen Participation Plan 91.105(d); 91.115(d)**

**Describe the efforts to provide citizens with reasonable notice and an opportunity to comment on performance reports.**

As with all of the CDBG documents we prepare, we take care to follow the public notice guidelines set forth in our Citizen Participation Plan. For our 2018 CAPER, citizens were provided with a seven day notice of the availability of the draft plan through a legal notice in the Observer newspaper, a notice on the City's website, public posting of the plan in the Dunkirk Public Library, Dunkirk Development and Clerk's office, and an email to interested organizations/individuals. A 15-day public comment period was provided with the availability of the draft plan with comments due by 5pm on Monday, November

18, 2019 after which a public hearing is scheduled. Public comments will be added after the review and comment period.

We value the comments of citizens on our CDBG program and will continue to provide reasonable notice and an opportunity for citizen comment on performance reports and other CDBG documents.

### **CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)**

**Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction's program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.**

The City of Dunkirk did not change its program objectives and is not considering any changes at this time.

**Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?**

No

**[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.**

**CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)**

**Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction's program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.**

The City of Dunkirk did not change its program objectives and is not considering any changes at this time.

**Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?**

No

**[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.**