



HON. MAYOR WILFRED ROSAS

Draft (Version 8) 2020

Consolidated Annual Performance and Evaluation Report

This document is made available for review starting on April 25, 2022 followed by a 15-day public review and comment period starting May 2, 2022 and ending on May 17, 2022 at 5 PM. Please submit your name, address, phone number, and comments by mail, fax, telephone, or email to: City of Dunkirk Planning and Development Department (Attn: Nicole Clift), 342 Central Ave., Dunkirk, NY 14048; FAX 716-363-6460; PHONE 716-366-9878; or email nclift@cityofdunkirk.com

All comments must be in by midnight on May 17, 2022.

CR-05 - Goals and Outcomes

Progress the jurisdiction has made in carrying out its strategic plan and its action plan. 91.520(a)

This could be an overview that includes major initiatives and highlights that were proposed and executed throughout the program year.

The City of Dunkirk is an entitlement community that receives Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) funds via the US Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) each year. CDBG funds are managed between September 1, 2020 and August 31, 2021 for the Program Year 2020 (PY20). CDBG investments are guided by the City of Dunkirk's 2018-2020 Consolidated Plan with specific goals within the 2020 Annual Action Plan, (PY20 AAP) as adopted via City Council resolution on June 5, 2018. The PY20 AAP was revised on November 9, 2020 to account for HUD's allocation funding error which resulted in a \$61 decrease in the PY20 CDBG grant award and resulted in the PY20 Planning & Administration project decreasing by \$61. A second revision to the PY20 AAP was made in regards to the data clean-up needed in the IDIS software system, this stand-alone PY20 AAP was submitted to HUD on February 16, 2022. The City of Dunkirk received a PY20 annual CDBG award of \$465,061. Separate from CDBG, the City received a total of \$384,879 in CDBG-CV funds which are supplemental CDBG dollars created by the federal CARES Act which were planned for as part of the 2019 AAP. The original CDBG-CV amount totaled \$273,622 for the agreement on June 11, 2020, however more funding was awarded on May 21, 2021. Though the CDBG-CV funds were allocated to PY2019 activities, some of those will have left over funding that will require reallocation. PY20 proved to be another challenging year following up the PY19 COVID-19 pandemic, as the impact from this situation continued throughout the whole PY20 year. Many businesses, projects and auctions were shut down and very slow to re-establish movement. Despite these challenges, the City of Dunkirk was still able to make progress on a number of fronts, including providing assistance to many community members, completion of several projects, and continuing to improve the CDBG program. During PY20, the City of Dunkirk invested CDBG into the following AAP activities: Boys & Girls after school mentoring program (\$32,700, expenditures forthcoming in PY21); Access to the Arts Adams Center building improvements (\$5,000, expenditures forthcoming in PY21); Chautauqua Opportunities Inc. owner occupied housing rehab (\$15,000); City of Dunkirk Program Administration (\$68,024, expenditures forthcoming in PY21); Chautauqua Land Bank property in REM acquisition (\$40,000); Salvation Army food pantry (\$10,000, expenditures forthcoming in PY21); Chautauqua Home Rehabilitation and Improvement Corp (CHRIC) owner occupies roof repair (\$60,000); CHRIC closing cost & down payment assistance (\$30,000); CHRIC acquisition, rehab and resale (\$30,000, expenditures forthcoming in PY21); Historical Museum repairs (\$25,000, expenditures forthcoming in PY21); Public Library after school snack program (\$2,000); City of Dunkirk Tree planting towards the Lake Shore Drive project (\$3,000, expenditures forthcoming in PY21); City of Dunkirk Wright Park ADA inclusive playground (\$70,000 in CDBG); City of Dunkirk Revolving Loan Program (\$70,000 in CDBG RL Funding from previous program year's locked account). These figures capture some of the impact that the city's CDBG program made during PY20: 1 housing unit was rehabbed into affordable rental housing by Chautauqua Opportunities, Inc (COI), 8 new homeowners were assisted by CHRIC in the purchase of their first home, 5 residents were assisted

by CHRIC with major roof repairs, 120 children were provided programming by Boys & Girls Club of Northern Chautauqua County, 2616 children received relief from food insecurities by the Dunkirk Public Library, 3 small businesses were assisted per the Revolving Loan Program, approximately 12,000 community people are now enjoying a new ADA compliant playground at Wright Park, the first in Northern Chautauqua County.

Comparison of the proposed versus actual outcomes for each outcome measure submitted with the consolidated plan and explain, if applicable, why progress was not made toward meeting goals and objectives. 91.520(g)

Categories, priority levels, funding sources and amounts, outcomes/objectives, goal outcome indicators, units of measure, targets, actual outcomes/outputs, and percentage completed for each of the grantee’s program year goals.

Goal	Category	Source / Amount	Indicator	Unit of Measure	Expected – Strategic Plan	Actual – Strategic Plan	Percent Complete	Expected – Program Year	Actual – Program Year	Percent Complete
Creative Economic Development Solutions	Non-Housing Community Development Economic Development	CDBG: \$70000	Facade treatment/business building rehabilitation	Business	0	0		0	0	
Creative Economic Development Solutions	Non-Housing Community Development Economic Development	CDBG: \$70000	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	60	4	6.67%	11	4	36.36%

Creative Economic Development Solutions	Non-Housing Community Development Economic Development	CDBG: \$70000	Businesses assisted	Businesses Assisted	0	3		3	3	100.00%
Enhanced Recreation Opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$100000	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	500	12564	2,512.80%	12850	12564	97.77%
Enhanced Recreation Opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$100000	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	0	0		0	0	
Improve Community Outreach	Affordable Housing Public Housing Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$27000	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	0	0		30	0	0.00%

Improve Community Outreach	Affordable Housing Public Housing Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$27000	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	300	4253	1,417.67%	270	2945	1,090.74%
Improve Community Outreach	Affordable Housing Public Housing Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$27000	Facade treatment/business building rehabilitation	Business	0	0		0	0	

<p>Improve Community Outreach</p>	<p>Affordable Housing Public Housing Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development</p>	<p>CDBG: \$27000</p>	<p>Jobs created/retained</p>	<p>Jobs</p>	<p>0</p>	<p>50</p>		<p>0</p>	<p>50</p>	
<p>Improve Community Outreach</p>	<p>Affordable Housing Public Housing Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development</p>	<p>CDBG: \$27000</p>	<p>Businesses assisted</p>	<p>Businesses Assisted</p>	<p>0</p>	<p>35</p>		<p>0</p>	<p>35</p>	

Improve Infrastructure/Pedestrian Infrastructure	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$52398	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	1000	0	0.00%			
Improve Infrastructure/Pedestrian Infrastructure	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$52398	Buildings Demolished	Buildings	0	0		2	0	0.00%
Improve Infrastructure/Pedestrian Infrastructure	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$52398	Other	Other	0	0		15	0	0.00%
Provide Education Programming for Students	Public Services for Youth	CDBG: \$32700	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	300	120	40.00%	70	1428	2,040.00%
Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$175000	Public service activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	0	8		0	0	
Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$175000	Rental units rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	3	1	33.33%	0	0	
Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$175000	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	21	5	23.81%	8	6	75.00%

Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$175000	Direct Financial Assistance to Homebuyers	Households Assisted	22	8	36.36%	6	8	133.33%
Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$175000	Housing for Homeless added	Household Housing Unit	0	0		0	0	
Provide Safe, Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing Homeless	CDBG: \$175000	Housing for People with HIV/AIDS added	Household Housing Unit	0	0		0	0	

Table 1 - Accomplishments – Program Year & Strategic Plan to Date

Assess how the jurisdiction’s use of funds, particularly CDBG, addresses the priorities and specific objectives identified in the plan, giving special attention to the highest priority activities identified.

A Break Down of ALL 2020 Activities per their Listed Goal Above: Creative Economic Development Solutions- Revolving Loan Funds; Enhanced Recreation Opportunities: Wright Park Phase 2, Adam Center Improvements, Historical Museum Repairs; Improve Community Outreach: Public Library After School Program, Salvation Army Food Pantry; Improve Infrastructure/Pedestrian Infrastructure: Planting of Trees (Lake Shore Drive); Provide Education Programming for Students: Boys & Girls Club Bridging the Gap Program, Public Library After School Program; Provide Safe, Affordable Housing: CHRIC Roof Repair, CHRIC Closing Costs, CHRIC Acquisition, Land Bank Acquisition of Property in REM, COI Home Owner Rehabilitation. PY20 was a successful program year in terms of addressing the priority activities identified in our strategic plan as best we could in the midst of a National Pandemic situation which included shut downs of businesses and general programs. The majority of CDBG funds expended in PY20 were used for three of the needs outlined in the strategic plan: Provide Safe and Affordable Housing, Creative Economic Development Solutions, and Enhanced Recreation. In total, the persons assisted breaks down as such for those 3 highlighted priorities: Provide Safe and Affordable Housing = 14 households assisted through the CHRIC Roof Repair, CHRIC Closing Cost/Down Payment Assistance and C.O.I. Housing Rehab programs; Creative Economic Development Solutions = 4 jobs created or retained so far as part of our Revolving Loan Program, with the assistance to 3 local businesses, accomplishments continue to come in for this activity; Enhanced Recreation = 12,564 people have access to more recreational activities with the Wright Park Phase 2, Adams Center for the Arts, and the Historic Museum activities.

To note some data is misleading: The Goal of "Improve Community Outreach" Funding Source Amount is incorrect in Table 1, the amount should

be \$11,000 (not \$27,000). The Goal of "Improve Infrastructure/Pedestrian Infrastructure" Funding Source Amount is incorrect in Table 1, the amount should be \$3,000 (not \$52,398). The Goal of "Provide Education Programming for Students" Funding Source Amount is incorrect in Table 1, the amount should be \$35,700 (not \$32,700). The 2020 Public Library Activity (799) which was allocated \$2,000 was split equally between the Goals of "Improve Community Outreach" and the "Provide Education Programming for Students.", This split of 50% resulted in the actual number benefited for each Goal to be 1308 people, along with each Goal receiving 1,000 towards the funding source amounts. Full results for the 2020 Public Library Activity (799) is 2616 people helped, \$2,000 allocated funding. The original 2020 AAP Goal of "Improve Community Outreach" included an incorrectly assumed 'Expected' number amount resulting in a very high percentage complete number. Though the Goal achieved beyond the original expectation, this percentage number is substantially higher than what it should be. The "Provide for Education Programming for Students" Goal also had an especially high percentage complete number which resulted from the onset of the COVID Pandemic and children needing more access to the services provided by the Boys and Girls Club Bridging the Gap program along with the Public Library's After School than ever previously needed.

CR-10 - Racial and Ethnic composition of families assisted

Describe the families assisted (including the racial and ethnic status of families assisted).

91.520(a)

	CDBG
White	109
Black or African American	9
Asian	1
American Indian or American Native	0
Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander	0
Total	119
Hispanic	36
Not Hispanic	83

Table 2 – Table of assistance to racial and ethnic populations by source of funds

Narrative

Dunkirk's population is majority White but increasingly diverse; CDBG assistance was well-distributed relative to the demographic profile of the city. Many of the home repairs and down payment cost assistance done through CHRIC's programs assisted homeowners who were unable to or not in a strong enough financial position to take care of the repairs themselves or were first time home buyers. Additional city youth were assisted through projects like the Boys and Girls Club Bridging the Gap program.

CR-15 - Resources and Investments 91.520(a)

Identify the resources made available

Source of Funds	Source	Resources Made Available	Amount Expended During Program Year
CDBG	public - federal	516,827	510,122

Table 3 - Resources Made Available

Narrative

Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Target Area	Planned Percentage of Allocation	Actual Percentage of Allocation	Narrative Description
DUNKIRK	100	100	Project Locations

Table 4 – Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Narrative

The location of projects completed and households assisted in 2020 was spread throughout the low to moderate income portions of the City as defined by HUD LMI block group data. CDBG assistance occurred in every ward.

Leveraging

Explain how federal funds leveraged additional resources (private, state and local funds), including a description of how matching requirements were satisfied, as well as how any publicly owned land or property located within the jurisdiction that were used to address the needs identified in the plan.

We did our best to utilize CDBG to leverage additional resources for a project with success.

In addition to our \$70,000 CDBG Funds used to complete the Wright Park Phase II all-inclusive playground project, we leveraged \$298,318.00 from NYS Office of Parks and Recreation Historic Preservation (NYSOPRHP), along with approximately \$30,000.00 from Consolidated Streets and Local Highway Improvement Program (CHIPS).

Our recent 2020 CHRIC Roof Repair activity had an overall budget of \$78,414.00 outside of the City's assisted \$60,000.00 CDBG Funds. (\$18,414.00 of it was NYS Affordable Housing Corporation funding awarded to C.H.R.I.C. for countrywide housing rehab.)

CR-20 - Affordable Housing 91.520(b)

Evaluation of the jurisdiction's progress in providing affordable housing, including the number and types of families served, the number of extremely low-income, low-income, moderate-income, and middle-income persons served.

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	0	1
Number of Non-Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	13	13
Number of Special-Needs households to be provided affordable housing units	0	0
Total	13	14

Table 5 – Number of Households

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of households supported through Rental Assistance	0	0
Number of households supported through The Production of New Units	0	0
Number of households supported through Rehab of Existing Units	7	6
Number of households supported through Acquisition of Existing Units	6	0
Total	13	6

Table 6 – Number of Households Supported

Discuss the difference between goals and outcomes and problems encountered in meeting these goals.

There are 3 acquisition / rehab / resale projects that has been delayed in starting due to the pandemic halting foreclosures and construction so it has not yet been completed to produce any new units at this time. Those are: 2020 CHRIC Acquisition/Rehab/Resale, 2020 LandBank Acquisition/Rehab/Resale, and previous year's 2019 CHRIC Acquisition/Rehab/Resale.

This was due to the following factors:

· NY State foreclosure moratorium resulted in the County not having a foreclosure auction so few, if any, properties were available to be acquired NY State order to halt construction projects earlier in 2020 resulting in 2019 & 2020 projects being stalled / unable to complete thus creating a timeline lag.

The COI Owner Occupied Housing Rehab resulted in 1 unit of vacant housing was renovated and made available as affordable rental housing. The tenant who was leased up is a single man who was previously homeless. With the assistance of SSI and his Section 8 voucher, the unit is affordable to him and his housing crisis has been stabilized

Discuss how these outcomes will impact future annual action plans.

With auctions being halted, and or few and far between due to the recent Pandemic, several of our 2019 & 2020 Projects have been slowed or come to a standstill. There will be a significant timeline lag seen next year and possibly into the following year as well before these projects are all back on a regular time schedule. The 2019 CHRIC Acquisition activity is currently working to take property through deed in lieu process. The 2020 CHRIC Acquisition activity had a request to combine previous years with it's 2020 year's funding due to rising material costs due to the Pandemic, but it was denied. There still is no forward movement on this activity at the moment. The 2020 LandBank Acquisition activity still has not made any forward progress due to the auction limitability.

Include the number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons served by each activity where information on income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity.

Number of Households Served	CDBG Actual	HOME Actual
Extremely Low-income	3	0
Low-income	4	0
Moderate-income	7	0
Total	14	0

Table 7 – Number of Households Served

Narrative Information

The programs that directly assisted low to moderate income households, where information in income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity were: · CHRIC's closing cost and down payment assistance program · CHRIC's roof repair program · COI Owner Occupied Housing Rehab program.

CR-25 - Homeless and Other Special Needs 91.220(d, e); 91.320(d, e); 91.520(c)

Evaluate the jurisdiction's progress in meeting its specific objectives for reducing and ending homelessness through:

Reaching out to homeless persons (especially unsheltered persons) and assessing their individual needs

The City continues to work with the Chautauqua County Homeless Coalition to work on a plan to eradicate homelessness. The CoC facilitates the process and establishes procedures for the region's coordinated entry system, which includes a detailed assessment to evaluate a person's vulnerability and acuity of needs and is conducted during the intake process of emergency shelters and social service agencies in the region. This information is then used to refer the individual to appropriate housing resources.

Key strategies include addressing chronic homelessness through PSH, applying for Rapid Rehousing bonus funds, and ramping up outreach efforts. The Continuum is made up of a variety of service providers that assist homeless families and individuals to access mainstream benefits, mental health and chemical dependency services, and emergency shelter and domestic violence services. Part of these outreach services include education of both the service providers and the community services available to assist in eradicating homelessness.

While local social service agencies are more likely to interact directly with individuals who are homeless, the City can provide valuable support and guidance by remaining informed of available resources and efforts. We do this by being an involved partner in the CoC.

Addressing the emergency shelter and transitional housing needs of homeless persons

The emergency shelter and transitional housing needs for homeless persons in our community are primarily handled by Chautauqua Opportunities, Inc (COI), the local Continuum of Care coordinator. As resources allow we support COI in their multitude of housing programs, attend CoC meetings, and serve on the NOFA rank and review committee. There are also domestic violence and runaway youth emergency shelters in our region. This year COI applied for Rapid Rehousing bonus funds to assist our region in making homelessness rare, brief, and non-recurring.

Helping low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless, especially extremely low-income individuals and families and those who are: likely to become homeless after being discharged from publicly funded institutions and systems of care (such as health care facilities, mental health facilities, foster care and other youth facilities, and corrections programs and institutions); and, receiving assistance from public or private agencies that address housing, health, social services, employment, education, or youth needs

We continue to work with our CoC to find ways to help low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless utilizing a variety of strategies. We are working to improve the local economy and provide more safe, affordable housing, both of which will help low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless. In addition, the CoC works in partnership with providers of mental health care, physical health care, veteran and youth service providers to address homelessness and housing stability concerns utilizing a cross-system approach. The approach allows the CoC to help establish appropriate discharge and housing plans throughout all aspects of the system of care.

Helping homeless persons (especially chronically homeless individuals and families, families with children, veterans and their families, and unaccompanied youth) make the transition to permanent housing and independent living, including shortening the period of time that individuals and families experience homelessness, facilitating access for homeless individuals and families to affordable housing units, and preventing individuals and families who were recently homeless from becoming homeless again

One of the ways we are working towards this goal is by working with Southern Tier Environments for Living (STEL) on their Dunkirk Renovation and Ownership program, which is creating close to 50 new housing units in our community, a number of which will be targeted to veterans and persons who are homeless and will provide additional wrap-around services to help these clients make the transition a success. The 2021 Completion Goal of this project is something we look forward to. Our CoC works with chronically homeless individuals and families in permanent supportive housing, helping them stay successfully housed and preventing incidents of recidivism. Finally, we're pleased to see COI was awarded bonus funding last NOFA to implement a new Rapid Rehousing program in the region. Prior to this, we did not have any Rapid Rehousing projects in our region but we do feel that this is an extremely beneficial strategy to help our area reduce lengths of time homeless so we are pleased to see the new funding award.

In general, one of the primary goals of our CDBG program is to provide more safe, affordable housing for our community. This goal is intended to benefit all low to moderate income residents, including those that are experiencing homelessness. In the upcoming program year, one of the ways we are addressing this goal is by funding a number of activities through local non-profits that will increase the supply of safe, affordable housing in Dunkirk.

CR-30 - Public Housing 91.220(h); 91.320(j)

Actions taken to address the needs of public housing

The Dunkirk Housing Authority (DHA) has 2 public housing communities consisting of a total of 223 rental units. It has an internal monitoring system and uses a project-based management model to identify the unique needs of each of the properties. This allows the DHA to be better able to identify the needs of the residents as well as streamlining the functions and processes of the housing authority. The needs are then addressed and incorporated into a future assessment to address any problems and prioritize those. Property management is tailored to the portfolio as a whole.

Actions taken to encourage public housing residents to become more involved in management and participate in homeownership

The Dunkirk Housing Authority strives to work closely with the tenants to provide activities and opportunities to its residents. It holds monthly open board meetings and is well attended by the residents. There are two resident representatives on the board of directors that collect and voice the needs and concerns of the residents. Residents have access to office staff daily and well as the Executive Director.

Residents that are paying close to market rents are encouraged to consider home ownership. We have an asset-based approach in the discussions and encourage their interest. Interested residents are connected to the local Community Action Agency or Chautauqua Home Rehab and Improvement Corporation for these services.

The City Planning and Development Department aims to expand economic opportunities for our community, a primary need also identified for DHA residents. We continue to look for ways to promote opportunity and provide assistance to the DHA where feasible and encourage its residents to participate in homeownership and economic opportunities.

Actions taken to provide assistance to troubled PHAs

The Dunkirk Housing Authority is not considered to be a troubled PHA.

CR-35 - Other Actions 91.220(j)-(k); 91.320(i)-(j)

Actions taken to remove or ameliorate the negative effects of public policies that serve as barriers to affordable housing such as land use controls, tax policies affecting land, zoning ordinances, building codes, fees and charges, growth limitations, and policies affecting the return on residential investment. 91.220 (j); 91.320 (i)

The City of Dunkirk has not identified any barriers to affordable housing and is not currently aware of any public policies that serve as such. With that, given the importance of affordable housing to our community, we will continue to monitor for any policies that do have the effect of creating barriers to affordable housing.

Actions taken to address obstacles to meeting underserved needs. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The largest obstacle to meeting underserved needs in our community is a lack of funding. As a result, we continue to diligently look for additional grant opportunities that will allow us to meet the underserved needs, of which there are many in our community. As in the past, we will look for opportunities to seek out new, non-entitlement funding and utilize CDBG as leverage.

Actions taken to reduce lead-based paint hazards. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The CDBG Program Administrator attended the HUD Sponsored Lead Safe Housing Rule training in Buffalo in 2019 who then provided the training materials and information to subgrantees. We also continue to work with Chautauqua Home Rehabilitation and Improvement Corp (CHRIC) and the Chautauqua County Department of Health and Human Services that aim to reduce lead-based paint hazards in our community. Where possible, we also seek out grant opportunities to address these hazards.

That being said, we feel that given the advanced age and poor condition of much of our community's housing stock, addressing lead-based paint hazards more explicitly should be a priority for our department and CDBG program.

Actions taken to reduce the number of poverty-level families. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

Much of the work undertaken in the Planning and Development Department are intended to reduce the number of poverty-level families in our community. Amongst the actions we have taken or are currently undertaking include:

- Funding programs through CDBG that create more housing security for low to moderate income households.
- Working to create more economic opportunities in our community by supporting local businesses and

by seeking out opportunities for new businesses.

- Seeking out additional grant funding to provide economic opportunities in our community.

Additional economic development, along with safe/affordable housing, is one of the primary needs in our community. One of the Planning and Development Department's primary goals is to foster this economic development, which will help reduce the number of poverty-level families in Dunkirk.

Actions taken to develop institutional structure. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

We have taken a number of actions over the past couple of years to help develop stronger institutional structure including:

- Creating checklists to ensure proper steps are taken with CDBG procedures
- Fostering better relationships with our subrecipients
- Continuing education of the CDBG program for staff, taking advantage of learning resources and training opportunities provided by HUD
- Ongoing creation of systems and internal structures to guide the City's CDBG program in the future

We intend to maintain these efforts and pursue other that can help us create greater sustainability for our CDBG program and the people we serve.

Actions taken to enhance coordination between public and private housing and social service agencies. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

During the PY2020 the City has undertaken a number of actions to enhance our coordination with local organizations including:

- better planning of the application process to ensure applications better matching community needs, including the development of a community input survey in both English and Spanish
- more local training opportunities for subgrantees
- more regular email updates on CDBG related matters and training

In a smaller community with a smaller Planning and Development Department such as Dunkirk coordinating effectively with local housing and social service agencies is essential to a successful CDBG program.

Identify actions taken to overcome the effects of any impediments identified in the jurisdictions analysis of impediments to fair housing choice. 91.520(a)

We are not aware of any impediments to fair housing choices in our community.

CR-40 - Monitoring 91.220 and 91.230

Describe the standards and procedures used to monitor activities carried out in furtherance of the plan and used to ensure long-term compliance with requirements of the programs involved, including minority business outreach and the comprehensive planning requirements

Each CDBG assisted activity is monitored throughout all phases of the project and standardized forms have been implemented for more accurate reporting. Documentation is requested from subrecipients for a desk review and an on-site inspection. On-site monitorings are also being conducted and documented in the file with any deficiencies noted and reported back to the agency for corrective action.

To ensure compliance with program requirements the City Program Administrator:

- participates in available webinars, conferences, and training classes offered by HUD
- regularly reviews printed CDBG guides
- regularly communicates with HUD staff
- regularly communicates with subrecipients
- conducts on-site monitoring visits

With regard to minority business outreach the City participates in NY State sponsored MWBE seminars and trainings and recently provided an updated list of NY State MWBE certified businesses to subrecipients encouraging them to do more to outreach, engage, and assist MWBE's with contracting opportunities

Citizen Participation Plan 91.105(d); 91.115(d)

Describe the efforts to provide citizens with reasonable notice and an opportunity to comment on performance reports.

As with all of the CDBG documents we prepare, we take care to follow the public notice guidelines set forth in our Citizen Participation Plan. For our 2020 CAPER, citizens were provided with a seven day notice of the availability of the draft plan through a legal notice in the Observer newspaper, a notice on the City's website, and at the City of Dunkirk's Planning & Development and Clerk's offices. A 15-day public comment period was provided with the availability of the draft plan with comments due by midnight on Tuesday, May 17, 2022, A public hearing was held on Tuesday May 10th, 2022 at 3 pm in

the Mayor's Conference Room, located in the City of Dunkirk's City Hall. No comments were received nor did any citizens attend the meeting.

We value the comments of citizens on our CDBG program and will continue to provide reasonable notice and an opportunity for citizen comment on performance reports and other CDBG documents

CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)

Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction's program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.

The City of Dunkirk did not change its program objectives and is not considering any changes at this time.

Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?

No

[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.

CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)

Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction's program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.

The City of Dunkirk did not change its program objectives and is not considering any changes at this time.

Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?

No

[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.

CR-58 – Section 3

Identify the number of individuals assisted and the types of assistance provided

Total Labor Hours	CDBG	HOME	ESG	HOPWA	HTF
Total Number of Activities	0	0	0	0	0
Total Labor Hours					
Total Section 3 Worker Hours					
Total Targeted Section 3 Worker Hours					

Table 8 – Total Labor Hours

Qualitative Efforts - Number of Activities by Program	CDBG	HOME	ESG	HOPWA	HTF
Outreach efforts to generate job applicants who are Public Housing Targeted Workers					
Outreach efforts to generate job applicants who are Other Funding Targeted Workers.					
Direct, on-the job training (including apprenticeships).					
Indirect training such as arranging for, contracting for, or paying tuition for, off-site training.					
Technical assistance to help Section 3 workers compete for jobs (e.g., resume assistance, coaching).					
Outreach efforts to identify and secure bids from Section 3 business concerns.					
Technical assistance to help Section 3 business concerns understand and bid on contracts.					
Division of contracts into smaller jobs to facilitate participation by Section 3 business concerns.					
Provided or connected residents with assistance in seeking employment including: drafting resumes, preparing for interviews, finding job opportunities, connecting residents to job placement services.					
Held one or more job fairs.					
Provided or connected residents with supportive services that can provide direct services or referrals.					
Provided or connected residents with supportive services that provide one or more of the following: work readiness health screenings, interview clothing, uniforms, test fees, transportation.					
Assisted residents with finding child care.					
Assisted residents to apply for, or attend community college or a four year educational institution.					
Assisted residents to apply for, or attend vocational/technical training.					
Assisted residents to obtain financial literacy training and/or coaching.					
Bonding assistance, guaranties, or other efforts to support viable bids from Section 3 business concerns.					
Provided or connected residents with training on computer use or online technologies.					
Promoting the use of a business registry designed to create opportunities for disadvantaged and small businesses.					
Outreach, engagement, or referrals with the state one-stop system, as designed in Section 121(e)(2) of the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act.					

Other.					
--------	--	--	--	--	--

Table 9 – Qualitative Efforts - Number of Activities by Program

Narrative

For Program Year 2020, the City of Dunkirk did not have any Section 3 required activities.