

The City of Lake Forest
Historic Preservation Commission
Proceedings of the November 28, 2018 Meeting

A regular meeting of the Lake Forest Historic Preservation Commission was held on Wednesday, November 28, 2018, at 6:30 p.m., at the City of Lake Forest City Hall, 220 E. Deerpath, Lake Forest, Illinois.

Historic Preservation Commissioners present: Acting Chairman Alfe and Commissioners Elizabeth Sperry, Jan Gibson, Bill Redfield, Carol Gayle and Wells Wheeler.

Commissioners absent: Chairman Bruce Grieve

City staff present: Catherine Czerniak, Director of Community Development, Jennifer Baehr, Assistant Planner

1. Introduction of Commissioners and staff, overview of meeting procedures.

Acting Chairman Alfe reviewed the meeting procedures followed by the Commission and asked the members of the Commission and staff to introduce themselves.

2. Consideration of the minutes of the September 26, 2018 meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

The minutes of the September 26, 2018 meeting were approved as submitted.

3. Consideration of a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the porch and stairs on the east elevation of the Church and associated pedestrian, lighting and landscaping improvements in the immediate area of the work. The Church of St. Mary is located at 175 Illinois Road.

Property Owner: The Archbishop of Chicago

Representative: Frank Klepitsch, architect

Acting Chairman Alfe asked the Commission for any Ex Parte contacts or conflicts of interest. Hearing none, he invited a presentation from the petitioner.

Mr. Klepitsch presented the project and reviewed the history and architecture of the Church. He noted the stained glass windows, pediments, arches, and tower elements and stated that the front façade of the Church and stained glass windows were recently restored. He stated that as part of the restoration project, the stain glass tracery was repainted, limestone pediments were restored, and the front concrete sidewalk and porch were restored. He added that the front concrete porch was colored and textured to appear similar to limestone. He

explained that the current request before the Commission involves four main areas of work; replacement of the entry porch and stairs on the east side of the Church, replacement of the lower stairs and walks leading to the parking lot, creation a new gathering space at the base of the stairs, and installation of upgraded exterior lighting fixtures. He explained that the main entrance to the Church is on Illinois Road and is used by most people to enter the Church. He noted however that many people use the door on the east side of the Church when leaving the Church. He explained that the existing stairs on the east side of the Church are very steep and the landing area of the porch is small. He added that the stairs and walkway leading to the parking lot cannot accommodate the large number of people leaving the Church after a Mass adding that there is no gathering space so people stop and talk in the parking lot. He explained that the proposed plan incorporates a larger landing at the top of the porch, gathering areas and planters for safety and to improve the aesthetics before entering the parking lot. He stated that the new entry porch has double-loaded stairs directing people to walkways extending to the north and south. He stated that the stair railings are designed to be similar to the railings at the front of the Church. He reviewed the proposed lighting enhancements noting that lights are added to the north of the east porch, to highlight the vegetation and statue in the Mary Garden. He noted that existing lights on the west side of the Rectory will be replaced to provide softer lighting for safety on the replacement porch and walkway. He added that bollard lights are proposed along the walkways and existing unshielded light fixtures on the south elevation of the Church will be upgraded.

Ms. Baehr stated that the proposed porch replacement, walkway enhancements and new exterior lighting is proposed to improve the functionality and safety for people existing the Church. She stated that the proposed design and materials are compatible with the existing Church without competing with the architecture of the original structure. She added that the project appears to meet the standards which are detailed in the staff report. She stated that approval of the petition is recommended.

Chairman Grieve invited questions from the Commission to the petitioner or staff.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Mr. Klepitsch stated that the Church currently has an accessible entrance and elevator at the southwest corner of the building.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Father Nacius stated that there are a number of security cameras on the Church property.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Mr. Klepitsch explained that bullet lights, to provide lighting for safety on the porch and stairs, are proposed because they do not make an architectural statement.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Mr. Willis, the Church's lighting

consultant, explained that two small lights are proposed to illuminate the statue in the garden. He added that up lighting is proposed to illuminate the landscaping along the walkways.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Ms. Czerniak noted that a condition in the staff report direct City staff to visit the site after installation of the light fixtures to evaluate light levels and work with the petitioners to make adjustments if needed.

In response to questions from Commissioner Sperry, Mr. Klepitsch stated that the existing door at the east entry will remain. He confirmed that no work is proposed on the stain glass windows. He stated that the brick used for the replacement stairways and porch walls will match the brick on the existing building to the extent possible. He added that there is currently a limestone band that wraps around the entire Church noting that the band will be carried around the new porch.

In response to questions from Commissioner Wheeler, Mr. Klepitsch explained that the concrete used for the new porch will be tinted a limestone color in an effort to minimize its appearance as new concrete.

Hearing no further questions from the Commission, Acting Chairman Alfe invited public comment.

Bill McFadden, speaking on behalf of the Lake Forest Preservation Foundation, stated that the proposed porch is much more functional and safer than the current condition. He noted however that the current parking at the Church is very crowded and expressed concern about the removal of three parking spots to create the gathering space at the base of the stairs. He stated that the proposed planters appear large and out of scale with the building and suggested that further refinement to those elements be considered. He also asked that consideration be given to potential drainage impacts due to the modifications proposed.

Hearing no further public comment, Acting Chairman Alfe invited final comments from the Commission.

Commissioner Gibson stated that the design is well thought out. She added that revisiting the design of the planters could be beneficial.

Commissioner Sperry agreed with the comments from the Lake Forest Preservation Foundation. She stated that the planters appear very dominant in the plan and asked that consideration be given to some refinement.

Commissioner Wheeler stated that the plan presents a very functional design.

Commissioner Gayle stated that the plans are well designed and address the need for a gathering space. She agreed that the planters should be further refined.

Commissioner Redfield stated that the plans present a significant improvement over the current conditions.

In response to Acting Chairman Alfe, Mr. Klepitsch clarified that the proposed plan removes two parking spaces and reconfigures other parking in the area of the gathering space.

Hearing no further comments from the Commission, Acting Chairman Alfe invited a motion.

Commissioner Wheeler made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness approving various modifications at the Church of St. Mary including:

- Demolition of the existing porch and stairs on the east elevation and removal of portions of the walkway and steps leading to the parking area.
- Construction of a replacement porch with stairs to the north and south.
- Enhancement of the walkways from the porch and stairs to the south, the parking area.
- Construction of new stairs to the parking area at the southeast corner of the Church.
- Expansion of the gathering area at the base of the steps at the parking area level.
- Addition and modification of exterior lighting.

He stated that the motion is based on the findings detailed in the staff report and incorporates the materials submitted and presented by the petitioner and the deliberations of the Commission as additional findings. He stated that the approval is subject to the following conditions of approval.

1. Further study of the planter elements shall be conducted to appropriately align the massing and scale as secondary to the Church itself.
2. Plans submitted for permit must reflect the project as presented to the Commission with the refinement directed in condition #1. If any other modifications are proposed in response to Commission direction or as a result of design development, plans clearly detailing the areas of change must be submitted at the time of submission for permit, along with the plans originally presented to the Commission, and will be subject to review by staff, in consultation with the Chairman as appropriate, to verify that the plans are consistent with the intent of the Commission and the approvals granted.

3. Details of exterior lighting shall be clearly reflected on the plans submitted for permit. Cut sheets of all light fixtures shall be provided. A lighting reduction plan shall be submitted to provide for a reduction in lighting levels when there is not activity in the area to preserve the dark streetscape character of Green Bay and Illinois Roads and mitigate impacts of lighting on the surrounding residential neighborhoods.
4. After installation, City staff is directed to conduct an inspection of lighting levels. If determined to be necessary, the intensity of lighting shall be reduced or the source of light further shielded.
5. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, a materials staging and construction vehicle parking plan must be submitted to the City. Staging for construction and vehicle parking shall occur on site to avoid causing congestion on adjacent streets.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Gibson and approved by a vote of 6 to 0.

4. Consideration of a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new garage and pool house at 1070 Elm Tree Road.

Property Owner: Mark Giesen

Representative: Edward Deegan, architect

Linda Hartman, landscape architect

Acting Chairman Alfe asked the Commission for any Ex Parte contacts or conflicts of interest. Hearing none, he invited a presentation from the petitioner.

Mr. Deegan introduced the project. He explained that the house is oriented perpendicular to Elm Tree Road, with the front of the house facing north. He explained that the existing house on the property is a Colonial Revival style home, with a combination of wood siding and brick façade materials. He noted that the house has been renovated a number of times. He explained that the proposed project includes construction of a one-car detached garage to the west of the main house, and a pool and pool house south of the main house. He noted that no changes are proposed to the exterior of the main house as part of this request. He explained that the proposed detached garage will have a cedar shingle roof, with a standing seam copper roof over the garage door, consistent with the roof element over the front door of the main house, and wood clapboard siding. He stated that the pool house structure is comprised of an enclosed space and a screen porch. He explained that the low-pitched roof of the pool house will be standing seam copper and the gable roof will be cedar shingles to match the roof of the main house. He noted that an existing 8 foot masonry wall is located west of the proposed pool house, near the west property line.

Ms. Hartman stated that currently, mature shade trees are located along the perimeter of the property offering screening of the proposed structures. She noted

that all the existing vegetation on the property will be maintained with the exception of one hollow tree which will be removed and replaced.

Ms. Baehr stated that the siting, massing and detailing of the proposed garage and pool house complement the main house. She explained that replacement plantings for the tree lost during construction can be sited to mitigate views of the pool and pool house from the street. She stated that staff received a message from a neighbor expressing concern about parking on Elm Tree Road during construction. She added that a condition is recommended in the staff report requiring on-site parking during construction.

In response to questions from Ms. Baehr, Ms. Hartman clarified that a new fence will be installed along the south property line and will connect to the existing fence on the east side of the property, along Elm Tree Road.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Mr. Deegan clarified that the low-pitched roofs on the pool house and garage are standing seam copper, while the higher-pitched roofs are cedar shingle to match the roof on the existing house.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Ms. Hartman stated that from west to east across the property, there is approximately 3 feet of elevation change. She explained that any water runoff from the proposed pool can be dispersed through the large yard area, on the site.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Mr. Deegan explained that a civil engineer will develop grading and drainage plans for the project to assure that water is not shed onto neighboring properties inappropriately.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Ms. Hartman stated that the lilacs behind the pool house are proposed to be removed because they are very old.

In response to questions from Commissioner Sperry, Mr. Deegan confirmed that the pool house and garage will have downspouts.

In response to questions from Commissioner Wheeler, Mr. Deegan stated that the screen porch area of the pool house uses "Phantom" screens. He explained that "Phantom" screens are motorized screens that can completely enclose the space.

In response to questions from Acting Chairman Alfe, Mr. Deegan stated that the screens are installed on tracks located down the middle of each supporting column.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gayle, Ms. Hartman stated that the area around the proposed pool will either be bluestone or limestone. She

confirmed that the current driveway will not be expanded.

In response to questions from Commissioner Wheeler, Ms. Czerniak stated that the City does not have an impervious surface limitation. She noted that drainage and grading plans will be subject to review and approval by the City Engineer before a building permit is issued. She added that if determined to be necessary, some detention areas such as a rain garden could be provided on site. She noted however that the property is large and can likely handle any additional water runoff.

In response to questions from Commissioner Wheeler, Ms. Hartman stated that the Silver Maple tree in the location of the proposed garage is in poor condition.

In response to questions from Commissioner Wheeler, Ms. Czerniak confirmed that the removal of the Silver Maple will require inch for inch replacement.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Ms. Hartman stated that the pool will have at least three lights and the spa will have a light.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Mr. Deegan stated that no lighting, beyond what is required by Code on the pool house and garage, is proposed.

In response to questions from Acting Chairman Alfe, Mr. Deegan stated that aluminum gutters are proposed to match the main house.

In response to questions from Commissioner Wheeler, Mr. Deegan confirmed that the pool house will be winterized.

Hearing no further questions from the Commission, Acting Chairman Alfe invited public comment. Hearing none, he invited final comments or a motion from the Commission.

Commissioner Wheeler made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to authorize construction of a one car detached garage, pool house, and an in-ground pool at 1070 Elm Tree Road. He stated that the motion is based on the findings detailed in the staff report and incorporates the materials submitted and presented by the petitioner and the deliberations of the Commission as additional findings. He stated that the motion includes the following conditions of approval.

1. Plans submitted for permit must reflect the project as presented to the Commission. If any modifications are proposed in response to Commission direction or as a result of design development, plans clearly detailing the areas of change must be submitted at the time of submission for permit, along with the plans originally presented to the Commission, and will be subject to review by staff, in consultation with the Chairman as

appropriate, to verify that the plans are consistent with the intent of the Commission and the approvals granted.

2. A final landscape plan shall be submitted and will be subject to review and approval by the City's Certified Arborist. Replacement plantings shall be reflected on the final landscape plan.
 - a. The landscape plan shall include plantings along the west property line to provide screening and softening of views of the proposed garage, pool and pool house.
 - b. The landscape plan shall include plantings along the east property line to provide screening and softening of views of the proposed pool and pool house.
3. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, a plan to protect trees and vegetation intended for preservation during construction must be submitted and will be subject to review and approval by the City's Certified Arborist.
4. Details of all exterior lighting, including, lights proposed on the garage and pool house and at the pool, shall be reflected on the plans submitted for permit. Cut sheets of all light fixtures should be provided and all fixtures shall direct light downward and the source of the light shall be shielded from view from off the property. The dark streetscape character of the neighborhood shall be preserved.
5. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, a materials staging and construction vehicle parking plan must be submitted to the City for review and will be subject to City approval in an effort to minimize and manage impacts on the neighborhood, neighboring properties and existing trees and landscaping during construction.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Gayle and approved by a vote of 6 to 0.

**5. Continued consideration of a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new residence on the property located at 295 Robinson Drive.
Property Owners: Steve & Michelle Parsons
Representative: Rick Swanson, architect**

Acting Chairman Alfe asked the Commission for any Ex Parte contacts or conflicts of interest. Hearing none, he invited a presentation from the petitioner.

Mr. Swanson introduced the project. He explained that the petition was previously heard by the Commission in September 2018. He stated that the Thorndale Manor Subdivision Architectural Board has approved the project with the most recent refinements. He reviewed the revisions made since the last meeting in response to the Commission's comments. He noted that modifications were made to the stair

tower element and gable roofs, the chimney height was increased, the window arches replaced with horizontal lintels, and the fenestration pattern was modified. He added that the color scheme was changed to a softer palette. He explained that the siding pattern as modified includes a combination of narrow and wide vertical siding.

Ms. Czerniak stated that at the September meeting the Commission offered a number of comments that spoke to the overall simplification of massing. She explained that reconsideration of the stair tower element was requested by the Commission she noted however, the tower element is important to the property owner. She stated that the stair tower was shifted slightly to be more integrated into the main form of the house. She suggested that further refinement to his element may be appropriate. She noted that the pitch of the shed roofs was increased but suggested that returning to the lower pitch for these elements may be appropriate to make them less visible. She stated that on the rear elevation of the house, there is an expanse of windows to take advantage of views of the site. She explained that to avoid impacts from light from the windows, the landscape buffer along the south property line should be enhanced with additional plantings. She requested Commission input on the modification made to the windows which replaced the arches over the windows with horizontal lintels. She stated that significant tree removal will occur on the site. She explained that the need for tree removal to accommodate a home on the lot was recognized at the time the subdivision was approved and in response, a Conservation Easement was established along the east side of the parcel and a Tree Preservation area was established along Robinson Drive. She explained that the proposed landscape plan for the project shows evergreen plantings in the Tree Preservation area. She noted that evergreen plantings should be limited in order to retain the natural wooded character of the site. She stated that the tree surveys staff received appear to be a combination of surveys that were done in 2008 and 2013. She stated that at the time of permit, an updated tree survey should be submitted to accurately reflect the trees on the site, the inches to be removed and the trees that will remain. She noted that based on the tree surveys provided, approximately 440 tree inches are proposed to be removed. She stated that any replacement inches that cannot be accommodated on the site will require a payment to the City in lieu of on-site plantings and will be used for parkway plantings in the general area. She stated that a preliminary grading and drainage plan was submitted and indicates about four feet of fill in some areas. She noted that based on the information available, with the proposed fill, the house still appears to comply with the maximum height of 40 feet when measured from the point of lowest existing grade to the highest roof peak. She stated that when detailed plans are submitted, the overall height will need to be confirmed. She stated that originally, vinyl-clad windows were proposed adding that metal-clad windows are now proposed to more fully comply with the City's Design Guidelines. She stated that in addition to comments from the Lake Forest Preservation Foundation, a letter from Meghan Beidler, the realtor representing the sale of properties in the subdivision was received. She noted that both letters were included in the Commission's packets.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Ms. Czerniak stated that any exterior lighting that is proposed will be reviewed carefully to assure that all exterior light fixtures fully screen the light source and direct light downward. She added that the City will also review the intensity of the light after installation. She stated that all exterior lights must be on timers and set to turn off by 11:00 p.m. She acknowledged that with the large expanse of windows on the rear of the house there could be some light spillover from the interior. She stated her hope that the architect and owners will be sensitive to off-site light impacts when considering interior lighting in that space. She added that the landscape buffer along the south side of the property once enhanced with additional plantings, will help to mitigate off site light impacts.

In response to staff comments, Mr. Swanson added that the area that features the large expansive windows on the rear of the house is recessed which should further help to mitigate any off site light impacts.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Mr. Swanson stated that the property owner prefers the horizontal lintels rather than the arches over the windows. He explained that the additional windows on the front elevation help to articulate the gable element.

In response to questions from Commissioner Wheeler, Mr. Swanson confirmed that the site plan is designed to allow for a swimming pool in the future.

Commissioner Wheeler commented that the single arch on the front elevation highlights the front entry.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gayle, Mr. Swanson stated that the need for additional windows at the second floor was in part driven by Code requirements for egress windows. He agreed that further consideration can be given to options to lower the height of the stair tower. He stated that the height as proposed is the result of structural, rather than aesthetic reasons.

Commissioner Redfield stated that the current proposal is an improvement over the previous design.

In response to questions from Acting Chairman Alfe, Mr. Swanson confirmed that a synthetic product to mimic slate is no longer being considered for the roof. He stated that architectural asphalt shingles will be used. He stated that zinc is proposed for the roofs over the front entry and the windows. He stated that the petitioner's goal is to preserve as many trees as possible on the site. He stated that they will work closely with the City Arborist.

Acting Chairman Alfe, hearing no further questions from the Commission, invited public comment. Hearing none, he invited final comments from the Commission.

Commissioner Gibson stated support for the change from arches to horizontal lintels over the windows. She asked that further consideration be given to lowering the stair tower. She suggested eliminating some of the windows around the house. She stated support for the softened color palette.

Commissioner Wheeler agreed that consideration should be given to lowering the height of the stair tower. He stated that the pitch of the shed roofs should be shallower, consistent with the earlier plans.

Hearing no further comments from the Commission, Acting Chairman Alfe invited a motion.

Commissioner Wheeler made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new single family residence and the overall site plan for the property located at 295 Robinson Drive. He stated that the motion is based on the findings detailed in the staff report and incorporates the testimony and the Commission's deliberations as additional findings. He stated that the motion is subject to the following conditions.

1. The plans shall be revised as follows:
 - a. Wood, fiberglass or aluminum clad windows shall be used.
 - b. Further study should be conducted in an effort to reduce the height of the tower closer to the lower height originally proposed and particularly, reducing the height of the stone base to provide a sense of human scale at the base.
 - c. The pitch of the shed roofs above the windows should be returned to the pitch as originally proposed to minimize the rise of the roofs and the appearance of the roofs above the windows. In addition, the roofs should be dropped to cover a small portion of the top of the windows rather than terminate at or above the windows as currently reflected on the elevations.
2. Plans submitted for permit must reflect the project as presented to the Commission with the revisions detailed above. If any further modifications are proposed as a result of design development, plans clearly detailing the areas of change must be submitted at the time of submission for permit, along with the plans originally presented to the Commission, and will be subject to review by staff, in consultation with the Chairman as appropriate, to verify that the plans are consistent with the intent of the Commission and the approvals granted.
3. At the time of submittal for a building permit, detailed drainage and grading plans must be submitted. Consistent with the subdivision approval,

no grading or filling shall be permitted except the absolute minimum necessary to meet accepted engineering standards and practices given the significant tree removal already proposed on the site and in the interest of minimizing stress on the trees intended to remain.

4. At the time of submittal for a building permit an updated and complete tree survey and removal plan shall be submitted showing calculations of the total tree inches to be removed or impacted and a breakout of the inches of Heritage trees to be removed or impacted. Heritage trees are trees over 18 inches in diameter when measured at 5 feet above the ground.
5. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, a plan, prepared by a Certified Arborist, to protect and treat trees and vegetation pre construction, during construction and post construction must be submitted and will be subject to review and approval by the City's Certified Arborist. Chain link fencing shall be required to protect trees intended for preservation and the Conservation and Tree Preservation Easements shall be fenced off entirely except for the intended driveway access.
6. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, a detailed, preliminary landscape plan shall be submitted and shall be subject to review and approval by the City's Certified Arborist. The plan shall provide for the required replacement inches to the extent possible using good forestry practices, detail enhancements to the Conservation and Tree Preservation Areas and detail planting in the landscape buffer that are sufficient to screen the new home from the homes to the south. In particular, the landscape buffer shall strive to mitigate any light spillover from the large expanses of windows on the rear elevation.
7. A final landscape plan, subject to the review and approval of the City's Certified Arborist, shall be submitted prior to the rough framing inspection.
8. Details of all exterior lighting, if any is proposed, shall be reflected on the plans submitted for permit. Cut sheets of all light fixtures should be provided and all fixtures shall direct light downward and the source of the light shall be shielded from view from off the property by the fixtures and if not, then by frosted or beaded glass dense enough to obscure views of the light source. The right to night, dark sky goals shall be satisfied.
9. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, a materials staging and construction vehicle parking plan must be submitted to the City for review and will be subject to City approval in an effort to minimize impacts on surrounding properties and on all protected easement and preservation areas.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Gibson and approved by a vote of 6 to 0.

6. Consideration of a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for signage for a new business located at 259 Market Square.

Property Owner: STRS L3 ACQ2, LLC

(Michael Schreiber, Domenic Lanni, Timothy Phair, Greg Schott)

Tenant: M on the Square

Representative: Melissa Crowe, business owner

Acting Chairman Alfe asked the Commission for any Ex Parte contacts or conflicts of interest. Hearing none, he invited a presentation from the petitioner.

Ms. Crowe introduced the project. She stated that she is the new business owner of "M on the Square." She explained that the proposed signage includes vinyl decal signs on the storefront window and entry door, and a wood band sign above the storefront. She stated that green and black are proposed for the text for the signs proposed on the window and door. She stated that the window sign will display the business logo and three descriptive words. She added that the door sign will be the same as the window sign with the addition of the store hours. She explained that the wood band sign will display the business name with wood letters applied to a wood band. She added that the color of the text on the band sign is white and the band sign itself is black.

Ms. Baehr stated the area of the proposed signage is just over 9 square feet, consistent with Code requirements. She explained that the size of the business logo is larger than allowed by Code, however, the logo consists of the letter "M" and does not reflect an image. She stated that the Code permits door signs listing the business name and store hours, but not the business logo and descriptive words.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Ms. Crowe explained that the design of the business logo is based on her name initials. She stated that she would consider a painted window sign as opposed to a vinyl decal.

In response to questions from Commissioner Sperry, Ms. Crowe stated that to reflect the store's product, the signage displays the word "bespoke" meaning custom. She added that the store does custom floral arrangements and designs.

Commissioner Wheeler stated that the design is elegant.

Commissioner Gayle stated that in her opinion, the openness of the logo allows for it to be larger than the allowed amount.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gayle, Ms. Baehr stated that the Code limits window signs to one third of the height of the glass in the sash. She noted that the proposed height of the window sign exceeds the allowable height

by three inches.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gayle, Ms. Crowe stated agreed to decrease the height of the window sign to comply with the Code requirement.

In response to questions from Acting Chairman Alfe, Ms. Crowe stated that most band signs in Market Square have a green background. She stated a willingness to use green for the background of the band sign.

Acting Chairman Alfe stated support for consistency with existing signs in Market Square.

Acting Chairman Alfe, hearing no further questions from the Commission, invited public comment. Hearing none, invited final comments from the Commission.

Commissioner Gibson recommended that the descriptive words be removed from the door sign in order to comply with the Code. She stated that only the business name and store hours should be displayed.

Hearing no further comments from the Commission, Acting Chairman Alfe invited a motion.

Commissioner Wheeler made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness approving the signage as proposed subject to the following conditions.

1. The band sign shall be designed to be consistent with other signs in Market Square.
2. The window sign height shall be reduced to comply with the Code.
3. The signage on the door shall be limited to the business name and hours of operation.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Redfield and approved by a vote of 6 to 0.

7. Consideration of a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for awning and window signage for a new business located at 284 E. Deerpath.

Property Owner: Altounian Construction (Todd Altounian)

Tenant: A.M. DePrisco Fine Jewelers

Representative: Jennifer Smoter, business owner

Acting Chairman Alfe asked the Commission for any Ex Parte contacts or conflicts of interest. Hearing none, he invited a presentation from the petitioner.

Ms. Smoter introduced the project. She stated that her business recently moved into the space at 284 E. Deerpath, the previous location of Jewels of Lake Forest. She explained that new awning and window signage is proposed along with a new exterior paint color for the storefront facade. She stated that the business has

other locations in Boston, Cape Cod, and Boca Rotan. She stated that currently, the sign on the awning valance, over the storefront, displays the previous tenant's business name. She added that the storefront trim is very dark and matches the color of the neighboring storefront creating the appearance that the storefronts are a single business. She stated that the proposed lettering will be applied to the existing awning valance. She added that white piping is also proposed along the edges of the existing awning to differentiate the storefront from neighboring businesses. She stated that the proposed awning sign displays the business logo, business name and "Fine Jewelers." She explained that the business graphic is an image of a crown and the letters "A.M." from the business name "A.M. DePrisco." She added that the color of the awning lettering is white. She stated that the current dark exterior trim is proposed to be repainted a cream color with black detailing. She noted that other storefronts in the area have a similar light/dark color palette. She explained that the window signage includes the business graphic, business name, other retail locations, various services offered, and the store hours. She noted that the window signage is proposed as vinyl decals in a silver color.

Ms. Baehr explained that the Code states that awning signs shall be limited to text, however this petition is proposing a graphic as part of the awning sign. She noted that staff recommends that the graphic be eliminated from the awning to comply with the Code. She stated that the proposed total signage exceeds the total square footage allowed by Code by 5 square feet. She recommended that to more closely comply with Code requirements and to reduce the total square footage of signage, the lettering describing the services offered should be reduced and the other retail locations eliminated.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gibson, Ms. Smoter confirmed that signage at other A.M. DePrisco locations includes the other retail locations of the business. She stated that there are cameras inside the store, but not on the exterior.

In response to questions from Commissioner Sperry, Ms. Czerniak confirmed that the Code limits awning signage to lettering, no graphics.

In response to questions from Commissioner Wheeler, Ms. Smoter stated that the awning is separate from the neighboring storefront awning.

In response to questions from Commissioner Gayle, Ms. Smoter agreed to eliminate the graphic from the awning valance.

Commissioner Redfield expressed support for the signage as proposed subject to the staff recommendations.

In response to questions from Acting Chairman Alfe, Ms. Smoter stated that the proposed lighter color palette is intended to be similar to the surrounding storefronts.

Acting Chairman Alfe, hearing no further questions from the Commission, invited public comment. Hearing none, invited final comments from the Commission.

Commissioner Gibson stated that only letters should be permitted on the awning valance. She stated support for the graphic as part of the window sign noting that it is subtle. She stated that in her opinion, the piping along the edges of the awning should be eliminated. She added that the lettering on the window shall be reduced by eliminating the listing of other retail locations and some of the services offered by the business.

Commissioner Sperry agreed with Commissioner Gibson.

Commissioner Wheeler agreed that the graphic should be removed from the awning valance. He stated that the descriptive words used in the window signage should be reduced to be consistent with the square footage permitted by the Code. He stated that in his opinion, the proposed piping on the awning identifies the business as distinct from the neighboring business. He added that the piping works well with the proposed color palette.

Commissioner Gayle stated support for the awning piping as proposed by the petitioner

Hearing no further comments from the Commission, Acting Chairman Alfe invited a motion.

Commissioner Wheeler made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness approving lettering on the awning valance, window signage and a new paint color on the storefront for a new business, A.M. DePrisco. He stated that the motion is based on the findings detailed in the staff report and incorporates the testimony and the Commission's deliberations as additional findings. He stated that the motion is subject to the following conditions.

1. The graphic shall be eliminated from the awning valance.
2. To bring the overall signage square footage closer into conformance with the permitted square footage and number of words:
 - a. Eliminate the other retail locations.
 - b. Reduce the descriptive signage on the window from five to three lines.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Gibson and approved by a vote of 6 to 0.

OTHER ITEMS

8. Opportunity for the public to address the Historic Preservation Commission on non-agenda items.

No testimony on non-agenda items was presented to the Commission.

9. Additional information from staff.

Board member Wheeler made a motion to approve the 2019 Historic Preservation Commission meeting schedule.

The motion was seconded by Board member Gayle and was approved by a 6 to 0 vote.

No additional information was presented by staff.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jennifer Baehr
Assistant Planner