

The City of Lake Forest
CITY COUNCIL MEETING
Proceedings of the Monday, October 2, 2023
City Council Meeting – City Council Chambers
220 E Deerpath, Lake Forest, IL 60045

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL: Honorable Mayor Tack called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m., and City Clerk Margaret Boyer called the roll of Council members.

Present: Honorable Mayor Tack, Alderman Novit, Alderman Waldeck, Alderman Notz, Alderman Preschlack, Alderman Goshgarian, Alderman Weber, and Alderman Walther

Absent: Alderman Powers

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE was recited by all.

REPORTS OF CITY OFFICERS

COMMENTS BY MAYOR

Mayor Tack congratulated Lake Forest Academy who is celebrating continued success. They took top honors in two categories, Among Boarding Schools; ranked #13 in the Country and #1 in the Midwest. And Among Private Schools; ranked #36 in the Country and #1 in Illinois.

COMMENTS BY CITY MANAGER

A. Community Spotlight

**-Dickinson Hall
- Tricia Schwall, Manager**

Acting City Manager, Catherine Czerniak introduced Tricia Schwall, Senior Resources Manager. Ms. Schwall reported that Dickinson Hall had more than 15,000 visits last year with its more than 900 members that span four generations of families. She gave an over of the services available to include transportation, along with programming and additional support services that are offered.

**-Deerpath Community Park Update
- Michael Thomas, Director of Public Works**

Acting City Manager, Catherine Czerniak introduced Michael Thomas, Director of Public Works. Mr. Thomas gave an update on the Deerpath Community Park that included construction milestones and response to the community preference for more dedicated in pickleball courts. He reviewed the current layout of six tennis courts, the original project design of four tennis and four pickleball courts to the updated design of eight pickleball courts, noting optimal location, noise, separation of tennis and pickleball and the addition of twenty-four new parking spaces. Mr. Thomas noted there are 16 tennis courts throughout other City Parks.

OPPORTUNITY FOR CITIZENS TO ADDRESS THE CITY COUNCIL

None this evening.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

ITEMS FOR OMNIBUS VOTE CONSIDERATION

- 1. Approval of September 18, 2023, City Council Meeting Minutes**
- 2. Approval of the Check Register for the Period of August 26 – September 22, 2023**
- 3. Grant Final Reading of an Ordinance Amending Chapter 11, titled "City Administrative Hearing System," and creating Chapter 79, titled "Recreational Powered Devices," of the City Code**
- 4. Approval of a Purchase of Three Replacement Police Department Vehicles to Morrow Brothers Ford and the Advancement of Fiscal Year 2025 Capital Improvement Program Funding in the Amount of \$126,000**
- 5. Consideration of Adoption of Updated Versions of Previously Adopted State and National Life Safety and Building Codes Used by the City. (First Reading)**
- 6. Consideration of an Ordinance Approving a Recommendation from the Building Review Board. (First Reading, and if Desired by the City Council, Final Approval)**

COUNCIL ACTION: Approve the six (6) omnibus items as presented

Mayor Tack asked members of the City Council if there were any items that they would like removed or taken separately. Seeing none, he asked for a motion.

Alderman Goshgarian made a motion to approve the six (6) Omnibus items as amended, seconded by Alderman Walther. The following voted "Aye": Alderman Novit, Waldeck, Notz, Preschlack, Goshgarian, Weber and Walther. The following voted "Nay": none. 7-Ayes, 0-Nays, motion carried.

Information such as Purpose and Action Requested, Background/Discussion, Budget/Fiscal Impact, Recommended Action and a Staff Contact as it relates to the Omnibus items can be found on the agenda.

OLD BUSINESS

NEW BUSINESS

- 1. Consideration of an Appeal of a Decision of the Historic Preservation Commission to Deny a Certificate of Appropriateness to Allow Replacement of a Cedar Shingle Roof with A Synthetic Roof Product in the Historic District. (Action by Motion)**

Mayor Tack stated that the Council will be considering an appeal of a decision of the Historic Preservation Commission to deny a request for a certificate of appropriateness for a roof project. Mayor Tack added that since the Council does not often hear appeals, he wanted to be sure that Council as well as the Petitioners,

neighboring residents, and all other interested parties understand what is before the Council for consideration and importantly, what is not before the City Council.

He stated that the Council is not conducting a public hearing on this appeal. Noting that work has already been done by the HPC. Additionally, Council is not receiving new evidence in this matter, as explained in the City's Guidelines for Appeals which were included in the City Council packet and are available in tonight's meeting. He closed in saying that the Council will be considering whether to uphold or overturn the HPC's denial of a certificate of appropriateness for this roof project, based on the standards contained in the City Code as those standards are applied in the context of the Council's other duties and responsibilities to the City. Alternatively, the Council could remand the matter back to the HPC for further proceedings.

City Attorney, Julie Tappendorf gave a summary of the City Code related to the City Council authority in the matter and the appeal guidelines. She recapped the role of the HPC in conducting a public hearing and stated it is a decision-making body. She reiterated that the guideline prohibiting the introduction of new evidence. And she reviewed the Councils' motion options.

City Council had a brief discussion on applying the seventeen standards along with a broader lens of responsibility.

Mayor Tack invited the petitioner, Mary Therese and Greg Williams to step forward, asking them to adhere to the allotted time. Ms. Williams asked to present sample roofing materials to the Council and was reminded that samples were not part of the Historic Preservation Commission record, and that the HPC Workshop was not part of the public hearing. Ms. Williams stated her address and that she lives in Ward 1. She began her review on what the petition was about and what it is asking for. She stated the roof is a must have required structure. She stated that this appeal is solving a problem that is industry wide. Young wood Cedar is an issue and has failed them. Additionally, she referenced her insurance company. She added maintaining the visual appeal of her home and meeting the 17 standards has always been a priority. She stated that they have explored several products and feels that the DaVinci product is right for the home. She said she feels there have been inconsistency and disregard for requests of the community. Ms. Williams asked to have synthetic material recognized because some material does well while others do not. She added she understands why the HPC wants to take this very seriously. She reviewed her experience with HPC over the past six months. Looking for guidelines and unbiased conversation before end of roofing season.

Mayor Tack with Council consensus held questions for the petitioner until the end. Mayor Tack reported that the HPC will be represented by Catherine Czerniak, Director of Community Development.

Ms. Czerniak reported this petition was heard over the course of two meetings and at the end of the second meeting the HPC acknowledge that this is an important issue that they need to study further and address. The HPC asked the petitioner if they would like to withdraw or have the matter continued, at the petitioner's request, the HPC took two actions recognizing the urgency of needing to replace the roof. The HPC granted a certificate of approval, approving replacement of the roof with either asphalt the original roofing material or cedar shingles. The Commission took a second action and voted 7 to 0 to recommend denial at this time of the synthetic roof material to allow them to study it further and come to some conclusions as they have done with windows and

synthetic siding. In both cases the Commission has in the past approved criteria and moved forward with approving certain types of project products with specific visual characteristics.

Ms. Czerniak reviewed the HPC finding supporting the denial, noting standards 7, 9, 12, 14, 15 and 17. She reiterated the City Council action options of upholding the decision of the HPC, overturn the decision of the HPC and direct preparation of findings or remand back to HPC.

Mayor Tack offered the opportunity for public comment. The following offered their opinion to Council.

Laura Luce on behalf of Lake Forest Preservation Foundation offered her comments in support of the HPC decision.

Martha Zeeman offered comments in support of the appeal.

Bob Molton Ely offered comments in support of the appeal.

Alice Molton Ely offered comments in support of the appeal.

Kerri Sherman offered comments in support of the appeal.

Jan Gibson offered comments in support of the HPC decision.

The City Council then had discussion and questions for Ms. Czerniak and Ms. Williams that included; HPC review of synthetic siding and timing. HPC identified visual characteristics and qualities. The status of the roof, and what stop gap measures have been taken and options available like using plastic sheeting like the library as an example. The City perspective is to let homeowners take protective measures to protect their home while roofing. The HPC process to date. The HPC 's commitment to study this issue of synthetic materials. The HPC role in creating a set of visual characteristics to meet the standard. How the process of review will work for HPC. What are other communities doing. How synthetic material will age. First Lake Forest synthetic roof. The City Council acknowledged that the HPC is vetting this topic and recognized the need for further discussion in an expedited manner. The 17 standards of the HPC and a possible amendment. Application of standards for denial. Ongoing process of reviewing new materials. No guarantee that after reviewing the HPC will find a suitable replacement. Global review of insurability. Specifically, what the HPC voted on. Responsibilities of City Council to support the process that work well within the community. The Council showed empathy for the petitioner. Offered ideas to address current issues at the home. Currently approvals which are an approval of a cedar or asphalt roof.

Mayor Tack asked the Council for a motion to uphold, remand or reject the matter.

COUNCIL ACTION: Options for Council action are offered below in the form of possible motions.

1. Deny the appeal and **uphold** the Historic Preservation Commission's decision to deny a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow replacement of a cedar shingle roof with a synthetic roof product at 333 Woodland Road, in the Historic District.

OR

2. Grant the appeal and **overturn** the Historic Preservation Commission's decision and direct that written findings in support of the City Council's decision be prepared and presented to the Council for final action.

OR

Remand the matter to the Historic Preservation Commission for further consideration, public testimony, and action.

Alderman Goshgarian made a motion to Deny the appeal and uphold the Historic Preservation Commission's decision to deny a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow replacement of a cedar shingle roof with a synthetic roof product at 333 Woodland Road, in the Historic District, seconded by Alderman Notz. The following voted "Aye": Alderman Novit, Notz, Preschlack, Weber and Walther. The following voted "Nay": Alderman Waldeck. 6-Ayes, 1-Nays, motion carried.

ADDITIONAL ITEMS FOR COUNCIL DISCUSSION/COMMENTS BY COUNCIL MEMBERS
--

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business Mayor Tack asked for a motion to adjourn. Alderman Walther made a motion to adjourn, seconded by Alderman Novit. Motion carried unanimously by voice vote at 7:56 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,
Margaret Boyer, City Clerk

A video of the City Council meeting is available for viewing at the Lake Forest Library and on file in the Clerk's office at City Hall. You can also view it on the website by visiting www.cityoflakeforest.com. Click on I Want To, then click on View, then choose Archived Meetings Videos.