

The City of Lake Forest
Building Review Board
Proceedings of August 8, 2019 Meeting

A regular meeting of the Lake Forest Building Review Board was held on Wednesday, August 8, 2019 at 6:30 p.m., at the Municipal Services Building, 800 N. Field Drive, Lake Forest, Illinois

Building Review Board members present: Chairman Jim Diamond and Board members, Joanne Bluhm, John Looby, Fred Moyer, James Sykora and Richard Walther

Building Review Board members absent: Chris Bires

Staff present: Catherine Czerniak, Director of Community Development and Jennifer Baehr, Assistant Planner

1. Introduction of Board members and staff, overview of meeting procedures – Chairman Diamond

Chairman Diamond reviewed the role of the Building Review Board and the meeting procedures followed by the Board. He asked the members of the Board and staff to introduce themselves.

2. Consideration of the minutes of the July 2, 2019 meeting of the Building Review Board.

The minutes of the July 2, 2019 meeting were approved as submitted.

3. Consideration of a request for approval of demolition of an existing residence and a one-car detached garage and the construction of a replacement residence and two-car detached garage located at 38 Washington Circle.

Owner: Eli Mueller

Representative: Thom Budzik, architect

Chairman Diamond asked the Board members for any Ex Parte contacts or conflicts of interest. Hearing none, he invited a presentation from the petitioner.

Mr. Budzik introduced the project on behalf of the property owners. He explained that currently, a two-story home and detached garage are located the property. He noted that the existing house and the garage are in poor condition. He stated that the design team explored the option of rehabilitating the existing home, however extensive repairs, reconstruction, additions and alterations would be needed, leaving little of the existing residence intact. He stated that the proposed replacement residence is sited closer to the street than the existing residence. He stated that the new driveway will be in the same general location as the existing driveway, on the west side of the site. He explained that the proposed replacement residence is 2,600 square feet with a two car

detached garage. He added that the home is designed in a “Modern Farmhouse” style. He stated that the home has a narrow configuration with steep pitched roofs. He noted that the exterior of the proposed residence consists of board and batten siding, asphalt shingle roof, and standing seam metal for the front porch and rear entry roof. He stated that the board material is fiber cement and the batten and trim materials will either be a composite product or wood. He added that aluminum clad casement windows are proposed. He noted that the home has some architectural details including brackets, exposed rafter tails and simple square columns. He explained that the windows have a 3.5 inch surround with some detail in the profile at the top. He stated that the proposed color palette consists of white board and batten siding and black windows, gutters and roofs. He stated that the detached garage will have the same details, materials and color palette as the house.

Ms. Baehr stated that the petition involves two requests; a request for approval of the demolition of the existing house, and a request for approval of a replacement residence. She explained that the existing house on the property does not reflect significant architectural or historical value that would warrant its preservation. She added that the work needed to make the existing house suitable for modern day living would result in the majority of the home being replaced. She stated that the massing and scale of the proposed replacement residence are consistent with other homes in the neighborhood. She explained that the increase in impervious surface on the site results from the larger building footprint and the new asphalt driveway proposed to replace the existing gravel driveway. She suggested that some pervious materials be incorporated into the plan given the increasing concerns about drainage, particularly in small lot neighborhoods. She noted that the proposed windows only have exterior muntins, which is inconsistent with the City’s Design Standards, and recommended both interior and exterior muntins to provide depth and shadow and for consistency with past Board actions and the guidelines. She stated that the window details as proposed reflect thin trim boards that could appear flat and flush with the siding. She recommended refinements to give definition to the window profile. She stated that the proposed white and black color palette will present a stark appearance; inconsistent with the neighborhood which features mostly natural tones that fit in more quietly to the streetscape. She added that a more subtle color palette will help soften the appearance of the home and allow it to fit more quietly into the neighborhood.

Board member Walther encouraged further study of drainage, the potential for runoff on to neighboring properties, and the incorporation of additional pervious surfaces on the site. He suggested that using a pervious surface for the front and rear walks and patios may be appropriate.

In response to questions from Board member Walther, Ms. Czerniak stated that the City Engineer will determine whether existing storm sewers or road drains have the capacity to allow the tie in of down spouts. She added that the condition of the infrastructure will also be considered.

Board member Walther observed that if the line cannot take on additional runoff, there

is an area behind the garage that could be used as short term storage after heavy storms. He stated that the placement of the battens should be refined to avoid awkward intersections with the openings around the house. He noted that the window surrounds do not appear to project enough to provide depth to the appearance of the windows.

In response to questions from Board member Walther, Mr. Budzik clarified that although the colored renderings represent the color of the metal roofs as dark gray, the proposed color is black. He explained that the differential between the window surrounds and the battens is a 1/4 inch and 7/8 inch between the window surrounds and the boards. He confirmed that the exposed rafter ends are proposed only on the front porch. He added that the windows will have clear glass. He stated that the horizontal band around the base of the house will be proud of the battens. He offered that a cap board can be added to the horizontal band.

Board member Moyer complimented the project. He stated that the scale and massing fits the neighborhood. He stated that in his opinion, the color palette should be left to the preference of the homeowners.

Board member Sykora agreed with comments made by Board member Walther.

In response to questions from Board member Sykora, Mr. Budzik stated the Sugar Maple on the west side of the property is in poor condition and may be impacted due to its close proximity to the proposed asphalt driveway. He added that it appears that the tree is on the neighbor's property.

In response to questions from Board member Looby, Mr. Budzik stated that a pre-fabricated fireplace is proposed. He added that the fireplace does not have a chimney but instead direct vents through the side of the house. He noted that using cedar battens in combination with fiber cement boards and black windows and trim presents a maintenance issue when repainting is required.

Board member Looby suggested adding further dimension to the narrow band at the sill to enhance the character. He stated that the windows should have both interior and exterior muntins consistent with the City's Design Guidelines.

Board member Bluhm expressed support for the petition. She stated that the simple form of the proposed residence fits into the neighborhood nicely. She suggested using a different color for the gutters to diminish their prominence.

In response to questions from Chairman Diamond, Mr. Budzik confirmed that only exterior muntins are proposed to reduce maintenance requirements. He explained that the skylight is located in an interior bathroom to allow light into the space. He confirmed that the interior lighting in the bathroom will be carefully chosen to avoid exterior light impacts. He explained that the homeowner's preference is to use a composite material for the battens and trim.

Chairman Diamond agreed that exterior and interior muntins should be used.

Board member Walther noted that as proposed, the house nearly reaches the maximum allowable height so very careful review of the grading and building plans will be necessary along with careful monitoring and documentation during the construction process.

Chairman Diamond noted a condition recommended in the staff report requiring as-built drawings at various points during construction to verify that the house does not exceed the allowable height. Hearing no further questions from the Board, he invited public comments.

Laura Ernst, 34 Washington Circle, expressed concern about drainage as a result of the proposed construction and potential impacts on her property.

In response to questions from Ms. Ernst, Mr. Budzik stated that the proposed location of the house is one foot closer to the east property line than the existing residence.

Greg Miller introduced himself as the builder for the project. He noted that there is an existing drain on the east side of the house that may be connected to a storm sewer pipe.

Ms. Czerniak reiterated that prior to connection of down spouts, drain tiles or a sump pump to a storm sewer or road drain, investigation and approval of the City Engineer will be required.

Hearing no further public comments, Chairman Diamond invited final comments from the Board.

In response to questions from Board member Walther, Mr. Budzik stated that they are working through the final grades to determine if the front porch will be above or at-grade. He added that a composite flooring material will be used if the porch is a deck surface.

Board member Walther suggested careful consideration of the placement of the battens and recommended that a cap board be added to the horizontal band along the base of the house.

Board member Bluhm stated support for the demolition of the existing residence. She added that the petitioner has been thoughtful in the design of the replacement residence.

Board member Looby suggested that bluestone be used for the walkways and patio.

Board member Moyer expressed support for the petition. He noted that the design is refreshing and has admirable qualities.

Hearing no further comments or questions from the Board, Chairman Diamond invited a motion.

Board member Sykora made a motion to recommend approval of the demolition of the existing residence and detached garage at 38 Washington Circle based on the findings in the staff report.

The motion was seconded by Board member Looby and approved by a vote of 6 to 0.

Board member Walther made a motion to recommend approval a replacement residence, detached garage, overall site plan and conceptual landscape plan based on the findings presented in this staff report and as further detailed during the Board's deliberations, subject to the following conditions of approval.

1. The plans shall be refined to address the following conditions detailed below if so directed by the Board.
 - a. Consider the incorporation of pervious materials to reduce the amount of impervious surface on the property.
 - b. Use a bluestone or paver type material, not concrete, for the front sidewalk and rear patio.
 - c. Enhance the horizontal band near the base of the house with a cap piece to provide additional depth.
 - d. Windows with interior and exterior muntins shall be used.
 - e. Submit window profiles reflecting depth and shadowing.
 - f. Design the batten layout to be symmetrical with the window placements.
2. If additional modifications are made to the plans, beyond those detailed above, either in response to Board direction, or as the result of final design development, the modifications shall be clearly called out on the plan and a copy of the plan originally provided to the Board shall be attached for comparison purposes. Staff is directed to review any changes, in consultation with the Chairman as appropriate, to determine whether the modifications are in conformance with the Board's direction and approval prior to the issuance of any permits.
3. The overall height of the house, in combination with any grade changes shall be clearly detailed on a section submitted at the time of application for permit to verify that the height does not exceed 30 feet from the point of lowest existing grade adjacent to the home, to the highest roof peak, excluding chimneys. As-built drawings shall be submitted at appropriate intervals to verify compliance with the height limitations.
4. The final grading and drainage plan shall demonstrate the project is consistent with the applicable Code requirements subject to review and approval by the City Engineer. Grading or filling on the site should be kept to the absolute minimum

necessary to meet good engineering practices to properly direct drainage. All necessary measures should be taken on the site to slow water runoff using on site measures given the significant increase in impervious surface proposed. Prior to any connection to existing storm sewers, the condition of the existing sewers shall be evaluated. No connection is permitted to road drains.

5. A final landscape plan shall be submitted and will be subject to review and approval by the City. The final landscape shall, at a minimum, meet the landscaping standards for new residences detailed in the Code including the planting of trees in the front yard to soften the appearance of the house from the streetscape over time.
6. Tree Protection Plan – Prior to the issuance of a building permit, a plan to protect trees during construction must be submitted and will be subject to review and approval by the City.
7. Details of exterior lighting shall be submitted with the plans submitted for permit. Cut sheets of all light fixtures shall be provided and all fixtures shall direct light downward and the source of the light shall be fully shielded from view by the fixture or by sight obscuring glass. All exterior lighting, except for security lights with motion detectors, shall be on timers to turn off no later than 11 p.m.
8. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, a materials staging and construction vehicle parking plan must be submitted to the City for review and will be subject to City approval in an effort to minimize and manage impacts on the neighborhood and trees during construction. Due to the narrowness and curving nature of the street, no on street parking of construction or contractor vehicles is permitted.

The motion was seconded by Board member Sykora and approved by a vote of 6 to 0.

OTHER ITEMS

4. Opportunity for the public to address the Building Review Board on non-agenda items.

There was no additional public testimony presented to the Board.

5. Additional information from staff.

No additional information was presented from staff.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:46 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jennifer Baehr
Assistant Planner